

The Human Resources Program-Evaluation Handbook

Jack E. Edwards
U.S. General Accounting Office

John C. Scott
Applied Psychological Techniques, Inc.

Nambury S. Raju
Illinois Institute of Technology

The opinions expressed in this book are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the U.S. General Accounting Office or the Federal government.

 **SAGE Publications**
International Educational and Professional Publisher
Thousand Oaks ■ London ■ New Delhi



Contents

Preface

xxiii

PART I: FRAMEWORK FOR HUMAN RESOURCES PROGRAM EVALUATION

1

1. Overview of Program Evaluation

3

Dale S. Rose, E. Jane Davidson

Program Evaluation in Human Resources	4
Evaluation Myths	5
Myth 1: It Is Impossible to Measure . . .	5
Myth 2: There Are Too Many Variables to Do a Good Study	6
Myth 3: No One Is Asking for Evaluation, So Why Bother?	6
Myth 4: Negative Results Will Hurt My Program	7
Key Distinctions	7
Process Versus Outcome Evaluation	8
Program Improvement Versus Program Selection	9
Program Evaluation Versus Utility Analysis	9
Who Does Program Evaluation?	10
Choosing Criteria for Success	13
Practical Design Considerations	14
Standards of Proof	15
Designing an Adequate Evaluation	15
Measurement Issues	16
Reliability and Validity	16
Quantitative and Qualitative Data	17
Costs and Benefits	18
Identifying Human Resource Needs	18
Considering Cost-Benefit Trade-Offs	19
Concluding Comments on Costs and Benefits	20
Utilization	21

Evaluation Readiness	22
Communicating Results	22
Applying Findings	23
Conclusion	24
2. Job Analysis—The Basis for Developing Criteria for All Human Resources Programs	27
<i>Peter Y. Chen, Jeanne M. Carsten, Autumn D. Krauss</i>	
Uses of a Proactive Job Analysis Program	28
Assessing the Need for a Job Analysis Program and Preparing for It	29
Conducting a Job Analysis Program	30
Competence of Job Analysts	31
Sources and Number of SMEs	32
Methods of Collecting Information	32
Questionnaires	33
O*NET Database	34
Steps to Collect Job Information	35
Task-generation Interviews and Survey	36
KSAO-Identification Interviews and Survey	39
Applications for Job Analysis Results	42
Application to Personnel Selection	42
Application to Training	42
Application to Performance Evaluation and Competency Modeling	43
Application to Employee Physical and Psychological Well-Being	44
Other Applications	44
Conclusion	45
3. Criteria for Human Resources Program Evaluation	49
<i>Stephen David Steinhaus, L. A. Witt</i>	
Common Approaches and Pitfalls	50
One Measure to Serve All Masters	50
Getting Past the Obvious	51
Ramifications of Selecting Poor Criteria	52
Characteristics of Good Criteria	53
Reliability, Validity, and Other Measurement Factors	54
Reliability and Validity	54
Measures Based on Clearly Observable Events	55
Measurable	55
Freedom From Bias	56
Relevance	56
Meaningfulness to Stakeholders	57

Focus on Value as Opposed to	
Return on Investment as a Proxy Measure	57
Actionable Results	58
Practicality	59
Practicality and Costs	59
Realistic and Credible Goals	59
Organization Politics	60
Practical Steps in Criterion Development and Implementation	60
Involve a Broad Project Team	62
Clarify Program Goals and Expected Impacts	62
Review All Available Data	63
Involve Stakeholders Other Than the	
HR Program Evaluation Team	63
Develop Data Collection Strategy and Tools	64
Implement Data Collection	64
Analyze Criterion Measurements	65
Communicate Results	66
Final Comments	67

PART II: STAFFING **69**

4. Recruitment **71**

Michael M. Harris, Elliot D. Lasson

Understanding the Recruitment Process	72
Recruitment Sources	73
Traditional Sources	75
Employee Referrals	75
Print Ad	75
Search Firms	76
College Campus Recruitment	76
Radio Ads	77
Internet-Based Approaches	77
Job Boards	77
E-Recruiting	77
Relationship Recruiting	78
Evaluating the Recruitment Function	78
Using Recruitment Outcomes for Evaluation	79
Assessing Costs	80
Advantages of Estimating Costs	80
Potential concerns in Estimating Costs	81
Using Applicant Predictors and Criteria for Evaluation	81
Assessing Predictor and Criterion Results	81
Advantages of Evaluating Predictors and Criteria	82
Potential Concerns When	
Evaluating Predictors and Criteria	82

Using Applicant Perceptions of the Recruitment Process for Evaluation	83
Assessing Applicant Reaction	83
Advantages of Assessing Applicant Perceptions	84
Potential Concerns in	
Assessing Applicant Perceptions	84
Using Organizational Reputation for Evaluation	84
Assessing Organizational Reputation	85
Advantages of Assessing	
Organizational Reputation	86
Potential Concerns When Assessing	
Organizational Reputation	86
Conclusions	86
5. Setting Standards	89
<i>Andrew J. Falcone, Nambury S. Raju</i>	
Setting Standards for Program Evaluation	90
Criterion-Referenced	
Versus Norm-Referenced Approaches	91
Nonmeasurement Aspects of Standard Setting	93
Evaluation of the Standard-Setting Programs	94
Subject Matter Expert (SME) Selection	94
Job Experience and Competency	94
Geographic Representation	95
Number of SMEs	96
Job Analysis	97
Examination Specifications	97
Standard-Setting Procedures	98
Angoff Method	99
Nedelsky Method	102
Bookmark Method	104
Summary	106
6. Evaluating Personnel Selection Systems	109
<i>Scott B. Morris, Russell Lobsenz</i>	
Program Evaluation Process	110
Forming the Evaluation Team	110
Evaluation Criteria	111
Reliability	112
Types of Reliability Estimates	113
Test-Retest Method	113
Alternate Forms Method	113
Internal Consistency Methods	114
Interrater Reliability	114
Generalizability Theory	114
Interpreting Reliability	115

Reliability Coefficient	115
Standard Error of Measurement (SEM)	115
Effect of Study Design	115
Validity	116
Criterion-Related Validity	117
Content-Oriented Validity	118
Construct Validity	119
Validity Generalization (VG)	120
Selection Decisions	121
Cutoff Scores, Ranking, and Banding	122
Combining Scores From Multiple Employment Tests	122
Test Administration Practices	122
Fairness, Bias, and Discrimination	123
Bias	123
Item Bias	124
Test Bias	124
Illegal Discrimination	124
Perceived Fairness	126
Utility Analysis	126
Conclusion	127

7. Selecting Managers and Executives: The Challenge of Measuring Success **130**

Rob Silzer, Seymour Adler

Selection Context	132
Context of Management and Executive Roles	132
Role Complexity and Change	132
Management Versus Executive Positions	132
Impact of the Individual	133
Selection Considerations	133
Multiple Stakeholders	133
Sequential Selections and Candidates	134
Levels of Fit	134
Evaluating Selection Design	135
Evaluating Target Competencies	135
Evaluating Assessment Tools	136
Evaluating Selection Administration	140
Design of Selection Administration	140
Records and Documents	141
Implementation of the Selection Process	141
Evaluating Selection Decisions	143
Data Interpretation	143
Behavioral Indicators	144
Actual Behavior	144
Data Integration	145

Evaluating Selection Outcomes	148
Conclusions	150

PART III: EVALUATING AND REWARDING EMPLOYEES 153

8. Performance Appraisal and Feedback Programs 155

Janet L. Barnes-Farrell, Angela M. Lynch

Goals of Appraisal and Feedback Systems	156
Organizational Perspectives and Goals	156
Appraisers' Perspectives and Goals	158
Workers' Perspectives and Goals	160
Functions of Performance Appraisal	161
Evaluating Performance	
Appraisal Measurement Functions	162
What Should Be Measured?	162
Who Should Measure?	162
How to Measure?	165
Evaluating the Communication	
Function of Performance Appraisal	169
Corporate Communication Function	169
Individual Performance Expectations and Feedback	171
Role and Preparation of the Appraiser	171
Timing and Frequency of	
the Performance Appraisal Communication	171
Communicating What Is Expected	172
Communicating How the Individual Performed	172
Summary and Conclusions	175

9. The Evaluation of 360-Degree Feedback Programs 177

John C. Scott, Manuel London

An Overview of 360-Degree Feedback	178
Administering the Program and	
Using the Resulting Information	178
Frequency and Method of Delivery	179
Underlying Assumptions	
About the Benefits of 360-Degree Feedback	179
Criteria for Evaluating 360-Degree Feedback Systems	180
Survey Design	181
Process Components	181
Survey Results	182
Interrater Agreement and	
Self-Other Discrepancy Scores	182
Relationships Between 360-Degree	
Feedback and Other Performance Measures	183

Isolating the Unique Contribution of 360-Degree Feedback as Part of a Comprehensive Development Program	183
Methods for Evaluating the Quality of the 360-Degree Program	184
Reviewing Archival Records	184
Stakeholder Assessments	185
Benchmarking Analyses	186
Evaluators of the Survey Program	186
Organizational Leaders	187
Internal HR Staff	187
External 360-Degree Feedback Assessment Experts	188
Evaluating the Quality and Long-Term Effects of 360-Degree Feedback	188
Attitudes About the Process	188
Awareness of Performance	
Dimensions and Performance Management	189
Creating a Feedback Culture	189
Tracking Change in 360-Degree Feedback Ratings	190
Examining Summary Data and Tracking Change Across the Organization	190
Assessing Sensitivity to Others' Ratings	191
Longitudinal Study	191
Recommendations and Conclusion	193

10. Compensation Analysis **200**

Mary Dunn Baker

Who Should Be Involved in the Preparation of Compensation Analyses?	201
Pay Elements Included in a Compensation Study	202
Methods of Analyzing Compensation	203
Simple Pay Equity Analyses	204
Organizationwide "Raw"	
Average (Median) Salary Comparisons	204
What Factors Influence Pay?	205
Fair Labor Standards	
Act (FLSA) Average Pay Comparison	207
Average Pay Comparisons by Grade	207
Job Title Cohort Analysis	208
Criticisms of Simple Pay Analyses	208
Applying Inferential Statistical Tests to Simple Pay Models	210
Complex Pay Equity Techniques—Multiple Regression Analysis	211
Explanatory Factors	212

How Are Regression Analyses Structured?	213
Dangers of Using an Overall Regression Method to Assess Pay Equity	215
Consider Practical as Well as Statistical Significance	218
How Well Does the Regression Model Fit the Data?	219
Tainted Variables	220
Common Root Causes of Compensation Disparities	220
Artificial Pay Differences	220
Employment Policies and Practices	221
Summary	222

PART IV: EMPLOYEE EFFECTIVENESS 223

11. Conducting Training Evaluation 225

Miguel A. Quiñones, Scott Tonidandel

Overview of Training Evaluation	226
A Five-Step Model of Training Evaluation	228
Step 1: Identify Training Objectives	228
What Are Training Objectives and Why Do We Need Them?	228
Three Components of Training Objectives	228
Writing Training Objectives	229
Step 2: Develop Evaluation Criteria	230
Importance of the Criteria	230
Kirkpatrick's Levels	231
Additional Evaluation Criteria	232
Matching Criteria to Training Objectives	233
Step 3: Select an Evaluation Design	233
Classical Experimental Designs	233
Alternative Designs	235
Selecting an Optimum Design	237
Step 4: Assess Change Due to Training	238
An Illustrative Example	238
Choosing an Analytic Strategy	239
Step 5: Perform a Utility Analysis	239
Calculating Training Program Costs	240
Calculating Program Benefits	240
Calculating the Utility of a Training Program	241
Summary and Conclusions	241

12. Succession Management 244

Michael M. Harris, Manuel London,

William C. Byham, Marilyn Buckner

What Is Succession Management?	245
Methods for Evaluating Competencies	246

Multisource (360-Degree) Feedback Surveys	247
Acceleration Centers SM	248
Providing Feedback to Pool Members	249
Determining Appropriate Developmental Activities	250
Role of the CEO	250
Line Manager Involvement	251
Identifying the Organizational Level to Be the Target of the Succession Management Process and the Current and Future Requirements	251
Selection Decisions	252
Additional Considerations	252
Evaluating Succession Management	253
A Case Example	253
Conclusion	260

13. A Practical Guide to Evaluating Coaching: Translating State-of-the-Art Techniques to the Real World **262**


David B. Peterson, Kurt Kraiger

Research on Coaching	263
Challenges and Issues in Evaluating Coaching	265
Purpose	265
Design	265
Return on Investment and the Impact of Coaching	267
A Practical Guide to Evaluating Coaching	269
Step 1: Lay the Foundation	269
Step 2: Design the Process	273
Recommendations	275
Step 3: Implement the Process	277
Step 4: Analyze the Data	278
Step 5: Present the Findings	279
Final Comments	280

PART V: TEAM AND ORGANIZATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS **283**

14. Team Performance **285**

Wendy S. Becker, John E. Mathieu

Framework for the Chapter	286
Team Designs Are NOT Panaceas 	286
Performance Evaluation as a General Process	287
Measurement Framework for Understanding Team Performance	288
Getting Started: How to Develop Team Performance Measures	290

Five-Step Process for Developing	
Team Performance Measures	290
Step 1: Review Existing Organizational Measures	291
Step 2: Define Team Measurement Factors	291
Step 3: Identify and Weight	
Team Member Activities	291
Step 4: Develop Team Performance	
Measures and Standards	292
Step 5: Create a Feedback System	293
Sources of Measurement in Teams	295
The Future of Team Performance Evaluation	297
Conclusions	298

15. The Evaluation of Job Redesign Processes 301

Steven F. Cronshaw, Sidney A. Fine

Five Principles of Job Redesign Evaluation	305
Principle 1: Job Redesign and Its Evaluation Must	
Be Understood From a Systems Perspective	306
The Work Organization as a Systems Component	306
The Worker as a Systems Component	306
The Work as a Systems Component	308
Principle 2: The Worker Is the Most	
Significant Factor in Effective Job Redesign	308
Principle 3: Job Redesign and Its	
Evaluation Are Continuous Processes	309
Principle 4: A Realistic and Practical Understanding	
of the Work System Is Needed to Effectively	
Use Evaluation Results	310
Principle 5: Conditions Before and During the	
Job Redesign Must Be Considered in Evaluation	311
Worker Criteria for the Evaluation of Job Redesign Programs	311
Adequate Discretion in Decision Making	312
Opportunity to Learn on the Job and Keep on Learning	312
Job Variety	313
Mutual Support and Respect	314
Experienced Meaningfulness of the Work	314
A Desirable Future for the Worker	315
Management Criteria for the Evaluation	
of Job Redesign Programs	316
Reduction of Bottlenecks and Production Problems	317
Improvement of Work Team Functioning	317
Compliance With Government Laws and Regulations	318
The Summative Evaluation of Job Redesign	319
Bringing Together Worker and	
Management Criteria in Successful Job Redesign	319
Conclusions	320

16. Organization Development	322
<i>Allan H. Church</i>	
Overview of Organization Development	324
A Process for Evaluating OD Interventions	327
Scoping ✓	328
Purpose of the Evaluation	328
The Role of Evaluator and Key Stakeholders	329
Timing of the Evaluation	330
Designing	330
Determining the Level of Impact to Evaluate	331
Identifying the Evaluation Methods	332
Deciding on Data Source and Level of Detail	332
Collecting and Analyzing Data	333
Working With International Populations	334
Ensuring Collection of the Right Amount of Data	334
Communicating	335
Telling a Compelling Story	000
Maintaining Balance and Integrity	336
Understanding Reactions to Feedback	337
Several Case Examples	337
Case 1: Formative Evaluation	
Feedback Saves the Day	337
Case 2: A Case of Poor Scoping	338
Case 3: Showing That Survey	
Action Planning Really Works	339
Conclusion	340
17. Evaluating Diversity Programs	343
<i>Paul Rosenfeld, Dan Landis, David Dalsky</i>	
Evaluating Diversity Programs: Barriers and Benefits	344
Barriers: Reasons Diversity	
Programs Might Not Be Evaluated	345
Superficial Commitment to Diversity	345
Ignorance Is Bliss: Fear of	
What Might Be Learned	345
Impact, Cost, and Time Involved in Evaluation	345
Benefits: Reasons Diversity Programs Should	
Be Evaluated	346
Determines Impact, Detects Deficiencies,	
and Identifies Areas for Improvement	346
Signals Commitment	346
Fends Off the Critics	347
Evaluating Diversity Programs: A Six-Step Plan	347
Step 1. Form the Diversity Evaluation Team	347
Internal Versus External Evaluators	348

Step 2. Develop the	
Evaluation Plan and Measures of Success	349
Developing the Evaluation Plan	349
Identifying Measures of Success	350
Step 3. Obtain Commitment from	
Organizational Leaders	350
Step 4. Gather Data	351
Policy and Procedure Documents	351
Demographic Breakouts Showing	
Trends Over Time	352
Survey Findings	353
Individual and Focus Group Interviews	355
Naturalistic Observations	356
Best Practices From Organizations	
That Are Recognized as Leaders in Diversity	357
Step 5. Analyze Evaluation Data	358
Step 6. Prepare an Evaluation Report With Action Plan	359
Develop Presentation and Evaluation Report	359
Develop and Implement Action Plan	360
Summary and Conclusions	361

PART VI: ORGANIZATIONAL COMMUNICATIONS **363**

18. Evaluating Organizational Survey Programs **365**

Jack E. Edwards, Bruce M. Fisher

Methods for Gathering Evaluation Data	366
Reviewing Archival Records	366
Interviewing Stakeholders	367
Evaluators of the Survey Program	367
Internal Survey Staff	367
Consortia	368
External Experts	368
Organization Leaders	369
Rank and File Employees	369
Criteria for Judging Survey Program Quality	369
Qualifications of the Survey Staff	369
Questionnaire Quality	371
Bad Items	371
Inadvertent Mistakes	372
Respondent Inquiries and Concerns	372
International Concerns	373
Generalizability of Survey Findings	373
Response Rates	374
Precision of Findings	375
Data Analysis and Presentation of Findings	376
Analyses and Statistics	376

Presenting Findings	377
Benchmarking and Best Practices	378
Decisions and Changes Linked to Survey Findings	379
Timeliness and Cost	379
Rapidly With Which a Survey Can Be Conducted	380
Cost	381
Summary and Conclusions	383
19. A Practical Guide to	
Evaluating Computer-Enabled Communications	387
<i>J. Philip Craiger, Virginia Collins, Alex Nicoll</i>	
Dimensions of Communication Technologies	388
Dimensions	388
Groupware	390
Evaluating Corporate Needs	390
Strategies for Selecting Among a Set of Alternatives	391
Compensatory Model	391
Noncompensatory Model	392
Application of the Models	393
Results of the Compensatory Model	393
Results of the Noncompensatory Model	393
Which Model to Use?	394
Prevalent Communication Technologies	394
Videoconferencing	395
Discussion Groups	396
Technology-Based Training	398
Instant Messaging	398
Electronic Mail (E-mail)	401
Corporate Web Sites	401
Computer-Enabled Communication: Impact and Policies	402
Evaluating Corporate Communications Policies	402
Acceptable Use Policies	403
Netiquette	403
Policies Regarding the	
Monitoring of Communications	404
Conclusion	405
20. Customer Service Programs	407
<i>L. A. Witt, Paulette Henry, Margareta Emberger</i>	
The Role of Human Resources in Customer Service	408
Identifying Stakeholders (Who)	410
Evaluators of the Customer Service Program	410
Staff Departments	411
Line Departments	411
External Groups	411
Working With the Stakeholders	411

Selecting the Evaluation Criteria (What)	412
Internal Customer Measures	413
Performance Management	
and Performance Discipline Data	413
Employee Attitudes	415
Medical Incidents	418
External Customer Measures	418
Wallet Expansion	419
Customer Retention	419
Referrals	420
Requests for Rework and Complaints	420
Customer Attitudes	420
Linking HR Programs With Customer	
Service Outcomes (Why)	422
Summary	422

PART VII: HEALTH AND WORK/LIFE BALANCE **427**

21. Health and Safety Training Programs **429**

Michael J. Burke, Jill Bradley, Harold N. Bowers

A Systems Approach to Health and Safety Training	430
Assessing Training Needs and the Regulatory	
Nature of Health and Safety Training	430
Developing Instructional Objectives	432
Selecting and Designing Training Course Content	
and Delivering Training	433
Enhanced Work Planning and Continuous	
Improvement Through Training Program Evaluation	433
Measures of Health and Safety Training	
Program Effectiveness	434
Guidelines for Assessing On-the-Job Behavior (STEP-3)	
Associated With Health and Safety Training	437
Planning an Evaluation of On-the-Job Behavior	439
Developing and Administering New Training Program	
Evaluation Forms	440
Analyzing Data, Following Up With Participants,	
and Reporting Results	443
Issues Concerning the Transfer of Health	
and Safety Training	443
Conclusion	444

22. Work/Life Balance Policies and Programs **447**

E. Jeffrey Hill, Sara P. Weiner

Why Evaluate Work/Life Policies and Programs?	447
Historical Overview	448

Work/Family Focus on Child Care (1970s–1980s)	448
Broad Work/Life Focus (1980s–1990s)	449
Work/Life Business Imperative (Late 1990s to the Present)	449
Evaluating Work/Life Policies and Programs	450
Step 1: Identify Objectives	451
Programmatic Objectives	451
Organizational Objectives	451
Individual Objectives	452
Step 2: Determine Methods	452
Quantitative Methods: Human Resources Databases	453
Quantitative Methods: Surveys	453
Qualitative Methods	454
Step 3: Gather and Analyze the Data	454
P1. Offer the Best (or Superior, or Competitive, or Average) Work/life Programs in the Industry	454
P2. Promote Work/Life Awareness	455
P3. Ensure Work/Life Usage	455
P4. Improve Continuously	455
O1. Improve Recruiting	455
O2. Increase Retention of the Best Talent	456
O3. Motivate Employees to Contribute Their Best	457
O4. Raise Productivity	457
O5. Move to a Results-Based Culture	458
I1. Fulfillment on and off the Job	458
I2. Manageable Workload	458
I3. Balance Work and Personal Life	459
I4. Seek Synergy	459
Step 4: Link Analysis to Bottom Line Measures	460
ROI	460
Break-Even Analysis	460
Step 5: Make Recommendations Based on the Work/Life Evaluation	460
Summary	464

PART VIII: ISSUES SPANNING HUMAN RESOURCES PROGRAMS **469**

23. Evaluation of Human Resource Information Systems **471**

Jeffrey M. Stanton,

Timothy V. Nolan, John R. Dale

Brief Historical Overview of HRISs 474

Primary Research Strategies for Evaluating an HRIS 476

Assessors Who Can Conduct HRIS Evaluations	477
Internal Groups	477
External HRIS Experts	478
Consortium Participation	479
Criteria for Judging HRIS Quality	479
Financial Criteria	481
Human Infrastructure	484
Technical Quality of System Functioning	485
Reactions	486
Value-Added Functions	487
Benchmarking and Best Practices Criteria	488
Integrating Criteria and Reporting Evaluation Results	489

24. Global Human Resource Metrics 493

Helen De Cieri, John W. Boudreau

Talentship: A Decision Science for HR	494
A Strategic Approach to the Measurement of Global HR	495
A Model for Global HR Metrics	496
External Factors Influencing Global HR Metrics	502
Organizational Factors Influencing HR in MNEs	504
Linking Elements	506
Impact	506
Effectiveness	507
Efficiency	508
Outcomes: MNE Concerns and Goals	510
Summary and Conclusions	511

25. Strategic Planning for Human Resources 514

Edward J. Kelleher, F. Stephen Cobe

Key Strategic Planning Issues for HR	515
The Strategic Planning–HR Interface	515
Strategic Planning Orientations	516
Business Paramount	516
Corporate Command	517
Corporate Strategies	517
Strategic Networks	517
The Strategic Management Process	518
HR Roles in the Strategic Management Process	520
Role 1: Implementation of Corporate and	
Business Strategies and HR Program Development	520
Implementation Roles in HR	522
Testing the Implementation Models	523
Program Development Models	525
Role 2: HR Strategies	526
Corporate Development Stages Model	526
Role 3: HR Participation in Change Management	527

Role 4: HR Participation in Acquisitions and Mergers	529
Evaluation of HR Strategy	530
Self-Audit Questionnaire for HR Strategy	530
HR Strategy Benchmarking	531
Achievement of Expected Values of Performance	532
Conclusions	533

**Glossary: Definitions of Technical and Statistical
Terms Commonly Used in HR Program Evaluations** **537**

Chet Robie

Nambury S. Raju

Index **551**

About the Editors **561**

About the Contributors **563**