THE SOCIAL APPRAISAL OF PROJECTS

A Text in Cost-Benefit Analysis

D. W. PEARCE 4A

Professor of Political Economy University of Aberdeen

.1

C. A. NASH VE

British Rail Lecturer in Rail Transport University of Leeds

Contents

 $\hat{}$

۰ ---

| - | Prefa | се | | xiii |
|---|-------|----------|------------------------------------------------------------|------|
| 1 | INTF | RODUC | TION | 1 |
| 2 | THE | RATIO | NALE OF COST-BENEFIT ANALYSIS | 5 |
| | 2.1 | Introd | uction | 5 |
| | 2.2 | Politic | al Votes and Economic Votes | 6 |
| | 2.3 | Value | Judgements and CBA | 8 |
| | 2.4 | Criticis | sms of 'Conventional' CBA | 12 |
| | | 2.4.1 | The 'Liberal' Attack | 12 |
| • | | 2.4.2 | The Political Science Attack | 16 |
| | | 2.4.3 | The Radical Critique | 18 |
| | | 2.4.4 | The Management Science' Approach | 18 |
| | 2.5 | Conclu | isions | 20 |
| | Appe | endix | Arrow's Impossibility Theorem | 21 |
| 3 | THE | WELF | ARE FOUNDATIONS OF COST-BENEFIT ANALYSIS | 23 |
| | 3.1 | Social | Appraisal in a World of Identical Consumers | 23 |
| | 3.2 | Cardin | al Utility and Cost-Benefit Analysis | 26 |
| | 3.3 | Compe | ensation Tests | 27 |
| | 3.4 | Distrib | outive Weighting Systems | 31 |
| | 3.5 | For an | d Against the Use of Weighting Systems | 33 |
| | 3.6 | Some | Practical Difficulties with Distributive Weighting Systems | 35 |
| | 3.7 | Conclu | isions | 37 |
| | Appe | endix | The Non-constancy of the Elasticity of the Marginal | |
| | | | Utility of Income with Respect to Monotonic | 20 |
| | . · | | Transformations of the Utility Function | 38 |
| 4 | INVI | ESTME | NT CRITERIA IN THE PUBLIC SECTOR | 41 |
| | 4.1 | Introd | uction | 41 |
| | 4.2 | Net Pr | esent Value and Depreciation | 44 |
| | 4.3 | Net Pr | esent Value and Project Acceptance | 46 |
| | | 4.3.1 | Accept – Reject | 46 |
| | | 4.3.2 | Ranking | 46 |
| | | 4.3.3 | Mutually Exclusive Projects | 47 |

,

| | 4.4 | The In | ternal Rate of Return | 48 |
|---|-----|----------|-------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| | | 4.4.1 | The Multiple-roots Problem | 49 |
| | | 4.4.2 | Sensitivity to Economic Life | 51 |
| | | 4.4.3 | Sensitivity to Time-phasing of Costs and Benefits | 51 |
| | | 4.4.4 | Mutual Exclusivity | 51 |
| | 4.5 | Discou | nt Factors and Time | 53 |
| | 4.6 | Optima | al Time-phasing of Investment | 56 |
| | 4.7 | Other I | Decision Criteria | 60 |
| | | 4.7.1 | The Pay-back Period | 60 |
| | | 4.7.2 | Annual Value | 60 |
| | | 4.7.3 | Terminal Value | 61 |
| | App | endix | Proof that $d_t = e^{-rt}$ implies a constant discount rate | 63 |
| 5 | RIS | K AND I | UNCERTAINTY | 64 |
| | 5.1 | Introdu | uction | 64 |
| | 5.2 | The Me | eaning of Risk and Uncertainty | 64 |
| | 5.3 | Risk-av | version | 65 |
| | 5.4 | Expect | ed Utility Maximisation | 67 |
| | 5.5 | Applic | ation to Decision Rules: Adjusting Net Present Values | 69 |
| | 5.6 | Applic | ation to Decision Rules: A 'Risky' Discount Rate | 70 |
| | 5.7 | Is the (| Cost of Risk-bearing Relevant? | 74 |
| | | 5.7.1 | The Arrow-Lind Theorem | 74 |
| | | 5.7.2 | The Relevance to Public Goods | 77 |
| | | 5.7.3 | Option Value and Risk-aversion | 78 |
| | | 5.7.4 | Option Value and Risk-neutrality | 81 |
| | 5.8 | Uncert | ainty | 83 |
| | | 5.8.1 | The Pay-off Matrix | 84 |
| | | 5.8.2 | The Maximax Criterion | 84 |
| | | 5.8.3 | The Maximin Criterion | 84 |
| | | 5.8.4 | Index of Pessimism Criterion | 85 |
| | | 5.8.5 | The Laplace Criterion | 86 |
| | | 5.8.6 | The Minimax Regret Criterion | 86 |
| | | 5.8.7 | Conclusions | 87 |
| 6 | VAI | JUING C | COSTS AND BENEFITS WHEN PRICES CHANGE | 89 |
| | 6.1 | Consur | mers' Surplus | 89 |
| | 6.2 | The Fo | our Consumers' Surpluses | 92 |
| | 6.3 | Aggreg | ation of Surpluses | 95 |
| | 6.4 | Produc | cers' Surplus | 97 |
| | 6.5 | A Com | parison between the Consumers' Surplus Measure of | |
| | | Benefi | ts and the Rise in Real National Income | 99 |
| | | 6.5.1 | National Income Measures | 99 |

,

| | | | Contents | ix |
|---|-----------|--------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| | | 6.5.2 | Cost–Benefit Analysis Measures | 100 |
| | 66 | Conclu | An Example | 101 |
| | 0.0 | | | 102 |
| | App | endix | Equivalence of Alternative Rules of Aggregation, Given Symmetry of Substitution | 103 |
| 7 | SHA | DOW P | RICING | 105 |
| | 7.1 | The C | oncept of a Shadow Price | 105 |
| | 7.2 | Marke | t Imperfections | 106 |
| | 7.3 | The V | aluation of Intermediate Goods | 107 |
| | 7.4 | The L | abour Market | 108 |
| | 7.5 | Taxes | and Subsidies | 110 |
| | 7.6 | Intern | ational Trade | 111 |
| | 7.7 | Interd | ependence between Shadow Prices | 116 |
| | 7.8 | The Pr | coblem of Institutional Arrangements | 116 |
| | ,7.9 ; | Conch | ISIONS | 11/ |
| 8 | EXT | ERNAI | LITIES AND PUBLIC GOODS | 119 |
| | 8.1 | Introd | uction | 119 |
| | 8.2 | Exterr | alities and Public Goods: Definitions | 121 |
| | 8.3 | Margir | al Conditions and Demand Curves | 126 |
| | | 8.3.1 | Pure Private Goods | 126 |
| | | 8.3.2 | Pure Public Goods | 127 |
| | | 8.3.3 | Impure Public Goods | 130 |
| | | 8.3.4 | The 'Free-rider' Problem | 132 |
| | | 8.3.5 | The 'Forced-rider' Problem | 136 |
| | 8.4 | Valuin | ig Externalities: Hedonic Prices | 136 |
| | 8.5 | A Not | e on Non-convexity and Optimal Externality | 139 |
| | 8.6 | Conch | usions | 142 |
| 9 | THE | SOCIA | AL DISCOUNT RATE | 143 |
| • | 9.1 | Introd | uction: Individual and Social Discount Rates | 143 |
| | 9.2 | A Sim | ple Two-period Model of Discount Rates | 145 |
| | 9.3 | The D | ivergence between STPR and SOC | 149 |
| | 9.4 | The So | ocial Opportunity Cost Approach | 150 |
| | 9.5 | SOC a | nd Capital Rationing | 151 |
| | 9.6 | The So | ocial Time-preference Rate | 153 |
| | | 9.6.1 | Pure Myopia | 154 |
| | | 9.6.2 | Risk of Death | 154 |
| | | 9.6.3 | Diminishing Marginal Utility of Consumption | 155 |
| | | 9.6.4 | A DMUC Model of STPR | 156 |
| | | 9.6.5 | An Alternative Approach: Scott | 158 |

,

| | 9.7 | 'Synthetic' Discount Rates | 159 | | |
|----|--------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|-----|--|--|
| | | 9.7.1 Marglin's Approach | 160 | | |
| | | 9.7.2 Feldstein's Approach | 162 | | |
| | 9.8 | Conclusions | 164 | | |
| 10 | SOCIAL APPRAISAL OF PROJECTS IN DEVELOPING | | | | |
| | COU | NTRIES | 165 | | |
| | 10.1 | The Special Problems of Developing Countries | 165 | | |
| | 10.2 | Inflation | 166 | | |
| | 10.3 | Currency Overvaluation | 166 | | |
| | 10.4 | The Labour Market | 167 | | |
| | 10.5 The Savings Deficiency | | | | |
| | 10.6 | The Distribution of Income | 171 | | |
| | 10.7 | Alternative Approaches to the Overall Evaluation | 172 | | |
| | 10.8 | Conclusions | 175 | | |
| ú | COS | | | | |
| 11 | | AISAL OF TRANSPORT PROJECTS | 176 | | |
| | 111 | Introduction | 176 | | |
| | 11.2 | Transport as an Intermediate Good | 177 | | |
| | 11.3 | Time Savings in Transport Projects | 179 | | |
| | 11.4 | Interurban Road Schemes | 181 | | |
| | 11.5 | Urban Transport Evaluation | 184 | | |
| | 11.6 | Transport Projects in Developing Countries | 188 | | |
| | 11.7 | Conclusions | 189 | | |
| 12 | COS | T_RENEET ANALYSIS IN PRACTICE: IL THE SOCIAL | | | |
| 12 | APPRAISAL OF MATERIALS RECYCLING | | | | |
| | 12.1 | The Desirability of Recycling | 190 | | |
| | 12.2 | The Cost—Benefit Model | 191 | | |
| | 12.3 | The Cost-Benefit Study | 194 | | |
| | 12.4 | Conclusions | 198 | | |
| 10 | 000 | T DENERT ANALYSIS IN DRACTICE. III THE SOCIAL | | | |
| 13 | | I-BENEFIT ANALYSIS IN PRACTICE: III. THE SOUIAL | 200 | | |
| | APPRAISAL OF NUCLEAR POWER | | | | |
| | 13.1 Introduction | | | | |
| | 13.2 | 13.2 The Application of CDA | | | |
| | 13.3 | The Costs and Banafits of Nuclear Enterna | 202 | | |
| | 13.4 | The Costs and Benefits of Nuclear Putures | 204 | | |
| | | 12.4.2 Deuting Dediction | 204 | | |
| | | 13.4.2 KOULINE KADIATION | 206 | | |
| | | 13.4.3 INON-FOULINE KADIATION | 207 | | |

Contents

| | Contents | | xi | |
|------------|----------|--------------------------|-----|--|
| | 13.4.4 | Waste Management | 207 | |
| | 13.4.5 | Proliferation | 208 | |
| | 13.4.6 | Civil Liberties | 208 | |
| 13.5 | The Cos | st—Benefit Balance-sheet | 209 | |
| 13.6 | A Regre | et Matrix Approach | 209 | |
| Notes | | | 212 | |
| References | | | 215 | |
| Index | | | 223 | |

;

xi