

Integration Through Law

Europe and the American Federal Experience

A Series under the General Editorship of
Mauro Cappelletti · Monica Seccombe · Joseph Weiler

Volume 3

Consumer Law, Common Markets and Federalism in Europe and the United States

by

Thierry Bourgoignie and David Trubek

(with Louise Trubek and Denis Stingl)

B 49 514

Juristische Gesamtbibliothek
der Technischen Hochschule
Darmstadt



1987

Walter de Gruyter · Berlin · New York

Table of Contents

General Editor's Foreword	V
Authors' Preface	IX
Acknowledgements	X
Table of Constitutional and Treaty Provisions and of Community Acts	XVI
Table of Legislative Provisions	XVIII
Table of Cases	XX

Part I

Consumer Law, Common Markets and Federalism: Introduction and General Concepts

<i>by</i> David M. Trubek	1
1.1 Introduction and General Concepts	1
1.1.1 "The" European Consumer Law Problem	2
1.1.1.1 Conflicts Between Consumer Protection and Open Borders	2
1.1.1.2 The Problem	4
1.1.2 The Political Economy of Consumer Protection	6
1.1.2.1 The Concept of Political Economy	6
1.1.2.2 The Modern Political Economy of Consumer Protection	7
1.1.2.2.1 Introduction	7
1.1.2.2.2 The Need for and Nature of State Action	8
1.1.2.2.3 Hidden Agendas in Consumer Protection Law – A Caveat	9
1.1.2.2.4 Consumer Protection and Administration	9
1.1.2.2.5 Responsiveness and Diffuse Interests	10
1.1.2.2.6 Responsiveness and Access	11
1.1.3 Consumer Protection in Federalized Common Markets	12
1.1.3.1 Harmonizing Open Borders and Consumer Protection Policies	12
1.1.3.2 The Political Economy of Consumer Protection in a Federal System	13
1.2 Consumer Protection in the American Federal System	14
1.2.1 Division of Sovereignty and the Structure of Consumer Law in the United States	15
1.2.1.1 Legal Authority	15
1.2.1.2 The Structure of Consumer Law and Policy in the United States	16
1.2.2 The Allocation of Authority in the American Federal System	17
1.2.2.1 Determinants of Federalization	17
1.2.2.2 Allocational Institutions	18
1.2.3 Concluding Remarks	20
1.3 Consumer Protection in the European Community: Issues and Prospects	21

1.3.1	Potential of the Community Law and Policy System	21
1.3.1.1	Community Policy	21
1.3.1.2	National Consumer Protection in Europe	22
1.3.1.3	Legal Authority	22
1.3.2	Community Consumer Law and Policy: Real Formation and Decision-Making Processes – the Record to Date	23
1.3.2.1	Evidence that the Community Has Adopted a Policy of Positive European Protection	23
1.3.2.2	Failures and Limits of Community Integration	24
1.4	Conclusion: The Future of Consumer Law in the European Community	25

Part II

Consumer Law in the American Federal System

	<i>by David M. Trubek, Louise G. Trubek and Denis Stigl</i>	27
2.1	Division of Sovereignty and the Structure of Consumer Law in the United States	28
2.1.1	Legal Authority	28
2.1.1.1	Central Government	28
2.1.1.2	States	29
2.1.2	Structure of Consumer Law and Policy in the United States	30
2.1.2.1	Governmental Participation – Federal Level	30
2.1.2.2	Governmental Participation – State Level	35
2.1.2.3	Consumer Representation and Participation in the Process	35
2.1.2.3.1	Consumer Organizations	35
2.1.2.3.2	Funding for Consumer Representation in the Law-Making Process	36
2.1.2.3.3	Courts, Common Law and Doctrine	37
2.2	Allocation of Authority in the American Federal System	39
2.2.1	Determinants of Federalization	39
2.2.1.1	Antitrust/Trade Regulation	43
2.2.1.2	Food and Drug Laws	48
2.2.1.3	Consumer Product Safety Act	52
2.2.1.4	Regulation of Insurance	54
2.2.1.5	Product Liability	57
2.2.2	Allocational Institutions	60
2.2.2.1	Dormant Commerce Clause	61
2.2.2.2	Federal Level Intervention in the Consumer Area	63
2.2.2.2.1	Preemption	63
2.2.2.2.1.1	Preemption by Congressional Statute	64
2.2.2.2.1.2	Preemption by Administrative Rule	66
2.2.2.2.2	Federal Involvement in the Coordination of Consumer Law and Policy	68
2.2.2.3	Parallel Coordination	72
2.2.2.3.1	Coordination in the Enforcement and Adjudication of Consumer Law Cases	73
2.2.2.3.2	Coordination of State Legislation	74
2.2.2.4	Voluntary Standards in the United States	76
2.2.2.4.1	Standards-Setting Organizations	76

2.2.2.4.2	When and Why Will Private Standards Be Used?	78
2.2.2.4.2.1	Voluntary Standards	78
2.2.2.4.2.2	Governmental Involvement in the Voluntary Standards System	81
2.2.2.4.3	Federalism and Voluntary Standards	83
2.3	Concluding Comments on the American Federal System	85
	References: Part II	86

Part III

Consumer Law and the European Community: Issues and Prospects

	<i>by</i> Thierry M. Bourgoignie	89
3.1	Potential of the Community Consumer Law and Policy System	97
3.1.1	Policy Recognition of the Need for a Community Consumer Law and Policy System	98
3.1.1.1	The Rise of EC Involvement in Consumer Law and Policy	99
3.1.1.1.1	Consumers, the Common Market, and the Treaty of Rome	99
3.1.1.1.2	The 1975 and 1981 Community Consumer Action Programs	102
3.1.1.1.3	The EC's Basic Policy Choice in the Consume Field	103
3.1.1.1.3.1	Alternative Possibilities for an EC Consumer Protection Policy	104
3.1.1.1.3.2	Community Consumer Programs Fall Under Option 1: "Positive Community Protection"	107
3.1.1.2	Main Motivations and Acting Agents	110
3.1.1.2.1	Main Motivations	110
3.1.1.2.1.1	Economic Considerations	110
3.1.1.2.1.2	Social Policy Considerations	113
3.1.1.2.1.3	Political Considerations	114
3.1.1.2.2	Acting Agents	115
3.1.1.3	Policy Recognition of the Legal Authority of the EC to Intervene in the Consumer Field	124
3.1.1.4	De Facto Impact of EC Consumer Programs on National Development	126
3.1.2	National Consumer Law and Policy Systems: Legal Pluralism as a Vector of Convergence – Case Studies	127
3.1.3	Legal Basis and Instrumentation for Community Action Toward Consumers	137
3.1.3.1	Multiplicity of Legal Bases and Tools for Action	137
3.1.3.2	Supremacy and Self-Execution (Direct Effect) of Community Law	140
3.1.4	Conclusions	144
3.2	Real Policy Formation and Decision-Making in Community Consumer Law and Policy	147

3.2.1	Community Consumer Protection Policy: the Record to Date	147
3.2.1.1	Actual Scope of Implementation of Community Consumer Protection Policy	148
3.2.1.1.1	Community Consumer Action Programs	148
3.2.1.1.2	Other Community Policies	153
3.2.1.1.2.1	Positive Consumer Protection and Actual Implementation of Competition Policy	154
3.2.1.1.2.2	Positive Consumer Protection and Actual Implementation of Free-Trade Policy	159
3.2.1.2	Legal Instrumentation Used in EC Consumer Law and Policy: From Dreams of Integration to the Reality of Deregulation	172
3.2.1.2.1	The Use of Council Regulations and Directives	173
3.2.1.2.1.1	The Use of Council Regulations	173
3.2.1.2.1.2	The Use of Council Directives	174
3.2.1.2.2	The Search for New Means of Interventionism	178
3.2.1.2.2.1	Article 155, Paragraph 4 of the Treaty	179
3.2.1.2.2.2	The Use of Competition Rules and Consumer Protection Policy	179
3.2.1.2.2.3	The Use of Article 30 and Consumer Protection Policy	181
3.2.1.2.2.4	The Use of Article 220 and Consumer Protection Policy	183
3.2.1.2.2.5	Deregulatory Approaches	183
3.2.1.3	Consumer Participation in the Community Consumer Policy Formation Process	189
3.2.1.3.1	Poor Organization of Consumer Interests at the Community Level	190
3.2.1.3.2	Consumer Underrepresentation Within the Commission Administrative Structure	192
3.2.1.3.3	Failures Affecting Consumer Consultation Procedures at the Community Level	193
3.2.1.3.4	Lack of Consumer Participation in the Enforcement Process	197
3.2.2	The Failures of Positive Community Consumer Protection Policy	200
3.2.2.1	Community Consumer Action Programs Remain By-Products	200
3.2.2.2	Correction of Market Failures Remains Incomplete	202
3.2.2.3	Legal Instrumentation in the Service of Real Policy	206
3.2.2.4	Evidence of Negative Integration	207
3.2.3	The Limits of EC Integration in Consumer Law and Policy	209
3.2.3.1	The Limits of European Integration in Social Policies	210
3.2.3.2	Additional Limitations on the EC Integration Process in the Consumer Field	213
3.3	The Future of Consumer Law in the European Community	220
3.3.1	The Need Exists for Consumer Law at the European Community Level	220

3.3.2 “European” Consumer Law does not Necessarily Involve Uniform Legislation at the Community Level	221
3.3.3 Europe Must Create a More Viable Partnership System	223
3.3.3.1 A Positive Approach to Using the Member States to Implement the Community Consumer Programs	224
3.3.3.2 A Clear Acceptance by Member States of a More Efficient Central Authority to Implement Community Consumer Programs	227
3.3.4 Consumer Input into the Community Consumer Protection System Must be Significantly Increased	231
3.3.4.1 Increasing Consumer Participation in the Consumer Policy-Making Process in the European Community	231
3.3.4.2 A Popular Consumer Movement in Europe	233
References: Part III	235
Index	263