

**Institute of Mathematical Statistics**

**LECTURE NOTES—MONOGRAPH SERIES**

**Shanti S. Gupta, Series Editor**

**Volume 6**

# **The Likelihood Principle**

**(Second Edition)**

**James O. Berger**

*Purdue University*

**Robert L. Wolpert**

*Duke University*

**Institute of Mathematical Statistics  
Hayward, California**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION . . . . .	1
CHAPTER 2. CONDITIONING . . . . .	5
2.1. Simple Examples . . . . .	5
2.2. Relevant Subsets . . . . .	11
2.3. Ancillarity . . . . .	13
2.4. Conditional Frequentist Procedures . . . . .	14
2.4.1. <i>Conditional Confidence</i> . . . . .	14
2.4.2. <i>Estimated Confidence</i> . . . . .	16
2.5. Criticisms of Partial Conditioning . . . . .	16
CHAPTER 3. THE LIKELIHOOD PRINCIPLE AND GENERALIZATIONS . . . . .	19
3.1. Introduction . . . . .	19
3.2. History of the Likelihood Principle . . . . .	22
3.3. Birnbaum's Development - the Discrete Case . . . . .	24
3.3.1. <i>Evidence, Conditionality, and Sufficiency</i> . . . . .	24
3.3.2. <i>Axiomatic Development</i> . . . . .	26
3.4. Generalizations Beyond the Discrete Case . . . . .	28
3.4.1. <i>Difficulties in the Nondiscrete Case</i> . . . . .	29
3.4.2. <i>Evidence, Conditionality, and Sufficiency</i> . . . . .	31
3.4.3. <i>The Relative Likelihood Principle</i> . . . . .	32
3.5. Prediction, Design, Nuisance Parameters, and the LP . . . . .	36
3.5.1. <i>Introduction</i> . . . . .	36
3.5.2. <i>Unobserved Variables: Prediction and Design</i> . . . . .	37
3.5.3. <i>Nuisance Variables and Parameters</i> . . . . .	41

3.6.	Criticisms of Birnbaum's Axiomatic Development . . . . .	42
3.6.1.	<i>The Model Assumption</i> . . . . .	43
3.6.2.	<i>The Evidence Assumption</i> . . . . .	45
3.6.3.	<i>The Weak Conditionality Principle</i> . . . . .	45
3.6.4.	<i>The Sufficiency Principle</i> . . . . .	46
3.7.	Violation of the Likelihood Principle: Inadmissibility and Incoherency . . . . .	50
3.7.1.	<i>Introduction</i> . . . . .	50
3.7.2.	<i>Decision Theoretic Evaluation</i> . . . . .	52
3.7.3.	<i>Betting Evaluation</i> . . . . .	59
CHAPTER 4.	CONSEQUENCES AND CRITICISMS OF THE LIKELIHOOD PRINCIPLE AND THE RELATIVE LIKELIHOOD PRINCIPLE . . . . .	65
4.1.	Incompatibility with Frequentist Concepts . . . . .	65
4.1.1.	<i>Introduction</i> . . . . .	65
4.1.2.	<i>Objectivity</i> . . . . .	67
4.1.3.	<i>Procedures for Nonspecialists</i> . . . . .	68
4.1.4.	<i>Repeatability</i> . . . . .	70
4.1.5.	<i>The Confidence Principle</i> . . . . .	71
4.2.	The Irrelevance of Stopping Rules . . . . .	74
4.2.1.	<i>Introduction</i> . . . . .	74
4.2.2.	<i>The (Discrete) Stopping Rule Principle</i> . . . . .	75
4.2.3.	<i>Positive Implications</i> . . . . .	77
4.2.4.	<i>Criticisms</i> . . . . .	80
4.2.5.	<i>Stopping Rules and Inadmissibility</i> . . . . .	83
4.2.6.	<i>The General Stopping Rule Principle</i> . . . . .	86
4.2.7.	<i>Informative Stopping Rules</i> . . . . .	88
4.3.	The Irrelevance of Censoring Mechanisms	
4.3.1.	<i>Introduction</i> . . . . .	90
4.3.2.	<i>Fixed Censoring and Equivalent Censoring Mechanisms</i> . . .	92
4.3.3.	<i>Random Censoring</i> . . . . .	95
4.3.4.	<i>Informative Censoring</i> . . . . .	103

4.4. Significance Testing . . . . .	104
4.4.1. <i>Conflict with the Likelihood Principle</i> . . . . .	104
4.4.2. <i>Averaging Over "More Extreme" Observations</i> . . . . .	105
4.4.3. <i>Testing a Single Null Model</i> . . . . .	109
4.4.4. <i>Conclusions</i> . . . . .	109.3
4.5. Randomization Analysis . . . . .	110
4.5.1. <i>Introduction</i> . . . . .	110
4.5.2. <i>Finite Population Sampling</i> . . . . .	112
4.5.3. <i>Randomization Tests</i> . . . . .	117
CHAPTER 5. IMPLEMENTATION OF THE LIKELIHOOD PRINCIPLE . . . . .	121
5.1. Introduction . . . . .	121
5.2. Non-Bayesian Likelihood Methods . . . . .	122
5.3. Arguments for Bayesian Implementation . . . . .	124
5.3.1. <i>General Considerations</i> . . . . .	124
5.3.2. <i>The Fraser-Monette-Ng, Stone, and Stein Examples</i> . . . . .	127
5.4. Robust Bayesian Analysis . . . . .	136
5.5. Conclusions . . . . .	141
REFERENCES . . . . .	143
ADDITIONAL OR UPDATED REFERENCES . . . . .	160
DISCUSSION BY M. J. BAYARRI AND M. H. DEGROOT . . . . .	160.3
DISCUSSION BY BRUCE HILL . . . . .	161
DISCUSSION BY DAVID LANE . . . . .	175
DISCUSSION BY LUCIEN LE CAM . . . . .	182
REPLY TO THE DISCUSSION . . . . .	186
ADDITIONAL REFERENCES IN THE DISCUSSION . . . . .	198
INDEX OF EXAMPLES . . . . .	200
AUTHOR INDEX . . . . .	201
SUBJECT INDEX . . . . .	204
ERRATA AND CLARIFICATIONS . . . . .	207