

# Making Hard Decisions

An Introduction to Decision Analysis  
2nd Edition

**Robert T. Clemen**

Fuqua School of Business  
Duke University



**Duxbury Press**

An Imprint of Brooks/Cole Publishing Company

I(T)P® An International Thomson Publishing Company

Pacific Grove • Albany • Belmont • Bonn • Boston • Cincinnati • Detroit  
Johannesburg • London • Madrid • Melbourne • Mexico City  
New York • Paris • Singapore • Tokyo • Toronto • Washington

# Contents

## **Preface   xix**

## **Chapter 1   Introduction to Decision Analysis   1**

Gypsy Moths and the ODA	1
Why Are Decisions Hard?	2
Why Study Decision Analysis?	3
Subjective Judgments and Decision Making	5
The Decision-Analysis Process	5
<i>Requisite Decision Models</i>	8
Where Is Decision Analysis Used?	8
Where Are We Going from Here?	9
Summary	10
Questions and Problems	10
<i>Case Studies:</i> Dr. Joycelyn Elders and the War on Drugs	11
Lloyd Bentsen for Vice President?	12
Du Pont and Chlorofluorocarbons	13
References	14
Epilogue	15

---

## Section 1 Modeling Decisions 17

### Chapter 2 Elements of Decision Problems 19

Values and Objectives	19
Making Money: A Special Objective	20
Values and the Current Decision Context	21
Boeing's Supercomputer	22
Decisions to Make	23
Sequential Decisions	24
Uncertain Events	25
Consequences	27
The Time Value of Money: A Special Kind of Trade-Off	28
Larkin Oil	31
Summary	34
Questions and Problems	34
<i>Case Studies:</i> The Value of Patience	36
Early Bird, Inc.	37
References	39
Epilogue	39

### Chapter 3 Structuring Decisions 41

Structuring Values	42
Hiring a Summer Intern	42
Fundamental and Means Objectives	44
Getting the Decision Context Right	49
Structuring Decisions: Influence Diagrams	50
Influence Diagrams and the Fundamental Objectives Hierarchy	52
Using Arcs to Represent Relationships	53
Some Basic Influence Diagrams	55
<i>The Basic Risky Decision</i>	55
<i>Imperfect Information</i>	56
<i>Sequential Decisions</i>	59
<i>Intermediate Calculations</i>	61
Constructing an Influence Diagram (Optional)	63
Toxic Chemicals and the EPA	63
<i>Some Common Mistakes</i>	65
<i>Multiple Representations and Requisite Models</i>	67

Structuring Decisions: Decision Trees	67
Decision Trees and the Objectives Hierarchy	69
Some Basic Decision Trees	70
<i>The Basic Risky Decision</i>	70
<i>Imperfect Information</i>	72
<i>Sequential Decisions</i>	72
Decision Trees and Influence Diagrams Compared	74
Decision Details: Defining Elements of the Decision	74
More Decision Details: Cash Flows and Probabilities	76
Defining Measurement Scales for Fundamental Objectives	77
Using Computers for Structuring Decisions	82
<i>Logical Decisions</i>	83
<i>DPL (Decision Programming Language)</i>	85
<i>DATA</i>	88
Summary	89
Exercises	90
Questions and Problems	92
<i>Case Studies:</i> Cold Fusion	96
Prescribed Fire	97
The SS <i>Kunyang</i>	97
References	98
Epilogue	100

## Chapter 4 Making Choices 101

Texaco Versus Pennzoil	101
Decision Trees and Expected Monetary Value	105
Solving Influence Diagrams: Overview	109
Solving Influence Diagrams: The Details (Optional)	112
Solving Influence Diagrams: An Algorithm (Optional)	117
Risk Profiles	118
<i>Cumulative Risk Profiles</i>	122
Dominance: An Alternative to EMV	123
Making Decisions with Multiple Objectives	127
The Summer Job	128
Analysis: One Objective at a Time	130
Subjective Ratings for Constructed Attribute Scales	130
Assessing Trade-Off Weights	132
Analysis: Expected Values and Risk Profiles for Two Objectives	133

Computer Programs for Decision Analysis	136
<i>DPL</i>	136
<i>DATA</i>	137
<i>Electronic Spreadsheets</i>	140
Summary	140
Exercises	141
Questions and Problems	142
<i>Case Studies:</i>	
GPC's New Product Decision	145
Southern Electronics, Part I	146
Southern Electronics, Part II	147
Strenlar	148
Job Offers	150
SS Kuniang, Part II	152
References	152
Epilogue	154

## **Chapter 5   Sensitivity Analysis   155**

Eagle Airlines	155
Sensitivity Analysis: A Modeling Approach	156
Problem Identification and Structure	157
One-Way Sensitivity Analysis	160
Tornado Diagrams	161
Dominance Considerations	162
Two-Way Sensitivity Analysis	164
Sensitivity to Probabilities	165
Two-Way Sensitivity Analysis for Three Alternatives	
(Optional)	169
Investing in the Stock Market	169
Sensitivity Analysis in Action	172
Heart Disease in Infants	173
Sensitivity Analysis by Computer	174
<i>Sensitivity Analysis with DPL</i>	174
<i>Sensitivity Analysis with DATA</i>	176
Sensitivity Analysis: A Built-In Irony	178
Summary	178
Exercises	178
Questions and Problems	179

<i>Case Studies:</i>	<i>The Stars and Stripes</i>	181
	Dumond International, Part I	182
	Strenlar, Part II	183
	Facilities Investment and Expansion	184
	Job Offers, Part II	184
References		186
Epilogue		186

## **Chapter 6 Creativity and Decision Making 187**

What Is Creativity?	188
Theories of Creativity	189
Chains of Thought	189
Phases of the Creative Process	190
Blocks to Creativity	192
<i>Framing and Perceptual Blocks</i>	192
The Monk and the Mountain	192
Making Cigars	193
<i>Value-Based Blocks</i>	195
<i>Cultural and Environmental Blocks</i>	197
Ping-Pong Ball in a Pipe	197
<i>Organizational Issues</i>	199
Value-Focused Thinking for Creating Alternatives	200
<i>Fundamental Objectives</i>	200
<i>Means Objectives</i>	200
Transportation of Nuclear Waste	201
<i>The Decision Context</i>	202
Other Creativity Techniques	203
<i>Fluent and Flexible Thinking</i>	203
<i>Idea Checklists</i>	203
<i>Brainstorming</i>	206
<i>Metaphorical Thinking</i>	206
<i>Other Techniques</i>	208
Creating Decision Opportunities	209
Summary	209
Questions and Problems	210
<i>Case Studies:</i>	
Modular Olympics	211
Burning Grass-Seed Fields	212
References	212
Epilogue	214

---

## Section 2 Modeling Uncertainty 217

### Chapter 7 Probability Basics 219

- A Little Probability Theory 220
- Venn Diagrams 220
- More Probability Formulas 221
- Uncertain Quantities 226
  - Discrete Probability Distributions* 227    *Expected Value* 229
  - Variance and Standard Deviation* 230    *Covariance and Correlation for Measuring Dependence (Optional)* 232
  - Continuous Probability Distributions* 236    *Stochastic Dominance Revisited* 237    *Stochastic Dominance and Multiple Attributes (Optional)* 238
  - Probabilities Density Functions* 239    *Expected Value, Variance, and Standard Deviation: The Continuous Case* 240    *Covariance and Correlation: The Continuous Case (Optional)* 241
- Oil Wildcatting 242
- John Hinckley's Trial 248
- Decision-Analysis Software and Bayes' Theorem 250
- Summary 250
- Exercises 251
- Questions and Problems 255
- Case Studies:*
  - Decision Analysis Monthly 257
  - Screening for Colorectal Cancer 258
  - AIDS 259
- Discrimination and the Death Penalty 262
- References 264
- Epilogue 264

### Chapter 8 Subjective Probability 265

- Uncertainty and Public Policy 265
- Probability: A Subjective Interpretation 267
- Accounting for Contingent Losses 268
- Assessing Discrete Probabilities 269
- Assessing Continuous Probabilities 274
- Pitfalls: Heuristics and Biases 281

Tom W.	281
<i>Representativeness</i>	282
<i>Availability</i>	283
<i>Anchoring and Adjusting</i>	284
<i>Motivational Bias</i>	284
<i>Heuristics and Biases: Implications</i>	284
Decomposition and Probability Assessment	285
Experts and Probability Assessment: Pulling It All Together	291
Climate Change at Yucca Mountain, Nevada	294
Coherence and the Dutch Book (Optional)	296
Summary	298
Exercises	299
Questions and Problems	300
<i>Case Studies:</i> Assessing Cancer Risk—From Mouse to Man	305
Breast Implants	307
The Space Shuttle <i>Challenger</i>	308
References	310
Epilogue	313

## **Chapter 9 Theoretical Probability Models 314**

Theoretical Models Applied	315
The Binomial Distribution	316
The Poisson Distribution	320
The Exponential Distribution	323
The Normal Distribution	325
The Beta Distribution	331
Probability Distributions and Decision-Analysis Software	335
Summary	335
Exercises	335
Questions and Problems	337
<i>Case Studies:</i> Overbooking	345
Earthquake Prediction	346
Municipal Solid Waste	350
References	353
Epilogue	354

## **Chapter 10 Using Data 355**

Using Data to Construct Probability Distributions	355
<i>Histograms</i>	356
<i>Empirical CDFs</i>	357



Halfway Houses	357
Using Data to Fit Theoretical Probability Models	361
Software for Fitting Distributions: BestFit	362
Using Data to Model Relationships	363
The Regression Approach	365
<i>Estimation: The Basics</i>	368
<i>Estimation: More than One Conditioning Variable</i>	375
<i>Regression Analysis and Modeling: Some Do's and Don't's</i>	378
<i>Regression Analysis: Some Bells and Whistles</i>	383
<i>Regression Modeling: Decision Analysis Versus Statistical Inference</i>	386
<i>An Admonition: Use with Care</i>	387
Natural Conjugate Distributions (Optional)	387
<i>Uncertainty About Parameters and Bayesian Updating</i>	388
<i>Binomial Distributions: Natural Conjugate Priors for p</i>	390
<i>Normal Distribution: Natural Conjugate Priors for <math>\mu</math></i>	392
<i>Predictive Distributions</i>	394
<i>Predictive Distributions: The Normal Case</i>	395
<i>Predictive Distributions: The Binomial Case</i>	396
A Bayesian Approach to Regression Analysis (Optional)	397
Summary	397
Exercises	398
Questions and Problems	398
Case Studies:	
Taco Shells	405
Forecasting Sales	406
Overbooking, Part II	408
References	408

## Chapter 11 Monte Carlo Simulation 410

Fashions	411
Using Uniform Random Numbers as Building Blocks	414
General Uniform Distributions	415
Exponential Distributions	416
Discrete Distributions	417
Other Distributions	417
Computer Software for Simulation	417
<i>Crystal Ball</i>	418
@ RISK	420
Simulation and Sensitivity Analysis	422
Distributions on Parameters (Optional)	423

Simulation, Decision Trees, and Influence Diagrams	424
Summary	426
Exercises	426
Questions and Problems	426
<i>Case Studies:</i> Choosing a Manufacturing Process	428
Organic Farming	430
Overbooking, Part III	433
References	433

## **Chapter 12 Value of Information 435**

Investing in the Stock Market	435
Value of Information: Some Basic Ideas	436
<i>Probability and Perfect Information</i>	436
<i>The Expected Value of Information</i>	438
Expected Value of Perfect Information	439
Expected Value of Imperfect Information	441
Value of Information in Complex Problems	447
Value of Information, Sensitivity Analysis, and Structuring	448
Seeding Hurricanes	448
Value of Information and Nonmonetary Objectives	449
Value of Information and Experts	450
Calculating EVPI: DATA and DPL	451
Summary	451
Exercises	452
Questions and Problems	453
<i>Case Studies:</i> Texaco-Pennzoil Revisited	455
Medical Tests	456
Dumond International, Part II	456
References	457

---

## **Section 3 Modeling Preferences 459**

## **Chapter 13 Risk Attitudes 461**

E. H. Harriman Fights for the Northern Pacific Railroad	462
Risk	463

Risk Attitudes	465
Investing in the Stock Market, Revisited	467
Expected Utility, Certainty Equivalents, and Risk Premiums	469
Keeping Terms Straight	473
Utility Function Assessment	473
<i>Assessment Using Certainty Equivalents</i>	474
<i>Assessment Using Probabilities</i>	475
<i>Gambles, Lotteries, and Investments</i>	477
Risk Tolerance and the Exponential Utility Function	477
Risk Tolerance and Sensitivity Analysis: Eagle Airlines, Revisited	480
Decreasing and Constant Risk Aversion (Optional)	482
<i>Decreasing Risk Aversion</i>	483
<i>An Investment Example</i>	484
<i>Constant Risk Aversion</i>	485
Some Caveats	488
Summary	488
Exercises	489
Questions and Problems	490
<i>Case Studies:</i> Interplants, Inc.	497
Texaco-Pennzoil One More Time	499
Strenlar, Part III	501
References	501
Epilogue	502

## **Chapter 14 Utility Axioms, Paradoxes, and Implications 503**

Preparing for an Influenza Outbreak	503
Axioms for Expected Utility	504
Paradoxes	510
Implications	514
<i>Implications for Utility Assessment</i>	514
<i>Managerial and Policy Implications</i>	516
A Final Perspective	518
Summary	519
Exercises	520
Questions and Problems	521
<i>Case Studies:</i> The Life Insurance Game	524
Nuclear Power Paranoia	525
The Manager's Perspective	526

References 527  
Epilogue 529

## Chapter 15 **Conflicting Objectives I: Fundamental Objectives and the Additive Utility Function** 530

Objectives and Attributes 532  
Trading Off Conflicting Objectives: The Basics 534  
    *Choosing an Automobile: An Example* 534  
The Additive Utility Function 536  
    *Choosing an Automobile: Proportional Scores* 538   *Assessing Weights:*  
    *Pricing Out the Objectives* 539   *Indifference Curves* 540  
Assessing Individual Utility Functions 542  
    *Proportional Scores* 542   *Ratios* 544   *Standard Utility-Function*  
    *Assessment* 546  
Assessing Weights 546  
    *Pricing Out* 547   *Swing Weighting* 547   *Lottery Weights* 550  
Keeping Concepts Straight: Certainty Versus Uncertainty 552  
An Example: Library Choices 553  
The Eugene Public Library 553  
Using Software for Multiple-Objective Decisions 560  
Summary 560  
Exercises 561  
Questions and Problems 562  
    *Case Studies: The Satanic Verses* 569  
        Dilemmas in Medicine 570  
        A Matter of Ethics 572  
        FDA and the Testing of Experimental Drugs 573  
References 574  
Epilogue 575

## Chapter 16 **Conflicting Objectives II: Multiattribute Utility Models with Interactions** 576

Multiattribute Utility Functions: Direct Assessment 577  
Independence Conditions 579  
    *Preferential Independence* 579   *Utility Independence* 580  
Determining Whether Independence Exists 580

Using Independence	582
Additive Independence	583
Substitutes and Complements	586
Assessing A Two-Attribute Utility Function	586
The Blood Bank	587
Three or More Attributes (Optional)	591
When Independence Fails	592
Multiattribute Utility in Action: BC Hydro	593
Strategic Decisions at BC Hydro	593
Summary	598
Exercises	599
Questions and Problems	600
<i>Case Studies:</i> A Mining-Investment Decision	603
References	605
Epilogue	606

## **Chapter 17 Conclusion and Further Reading 607**

A Decision-Analysis Reading List	608
----------------------------------	-----

## **Appendixes 613**

A Binomial Distribution: Individual Probabilities	614
B Binomial Distribution: Cumulative Probabilities	622
C Poisson Distribution: Individual Probabilities	630
D Poisson Distribution: Cumulative Probabilities	635
E Normal Distribution: Cumulative Probabilities	640
F Beta Distribution: Cumulative Probabilities	644

## **Answers to Selected Exercises 653**

## **Author Index 654**

## **Subject Index 657**