Decision Analysis for the Manager

Rex V. Brown

Decisions and Designs Inc.
Formerly of Harvard Business School and the University of Michigan

Andrew S. Kahr

Cameron Peterson

Decisions and Designs Inc.
Associate Professor of Psychology
University of Michigan

Holt, Rinehart and Winston

New York Chicago San Francisco Atlanta Dallas
Montreal Toronto London Sydney

CONTENTS

Preface vii

Part One DECISION ANALYSIS IN APPLICATION 1

Chapter One INTRODUCTION 3

1.1 Good Decisions 4
1.2 Decision Analysis as a New Technology 5
Assignments 6

Chapter Two THE ORE CASE: STRUCTURE, PROBABILITY, AND EXPECTED VALUE 8

2.1 Structure of the Problem 9
2.2 Probabilities 10
2.3 Expected Value and Folding Back the Decision Tree 11
2.4 Subsequent Acts 16
Assignments 18

Chapter Three THE ORE CASE: INFORMATION AND PROBABILITY ASSESSMENT 19

3.1 The Value of Perfect Information 19
3.2 The Value of Imperfect Information 22
3.3 Probability Assessment 24
3.4 Sensitivity Analysis 27
3.5 Uncertain Quantities 31
Assignments 36

Chapter Four THE ORE CASE: TIME, CRITERIA, AND UTILITY 39

4.1 Accounting for Time 39
4.2 Nonmonetary Criteria 40
4.3 Analysis of Attitude Toward Risk 43
Assignments 52

Chapter Five DECISION-TREE EXERCISES 53

5.1 Widgets Inc. 53
5.2 New England Railroad Company 54

Chapter Six DECISION-TREE CASELET 55

6.1 Waggoner Engineering Corporation (A) 55
6.2 Waggoner Engineering Corporation (B) 57
6.3 Waggoner Engineering Corporation (C) 58
6.4 Waggoner Engineering Corporation (D) 59

Chapter Seven DECISION ANALYSIS IN USE 61

7.1 Actual and Potential Impact on Management 61
7.2 Growing Use 62
7.3 Impact on Decision Making 63
7.4 How Decision Analysis is Integrated into Organizations 67
7.5 Use of Consultants 68
7.6 Realizing the Potentials 70
7.7 Cost Versus Benefits 71
7.8 Learning the Craft of Decision Analysis 72
Assignments 73

Chapter Eight A CASE STUDY IN THE APPLICATION OF DECISION ANALYSIS G. Eskin 74

8.1 A Packaging Problem 74
8.2 Getting Probability Estimates 75
8.3 Presenting Results to Management 78
8.4 Decide Now or Test? 78
Assignments 80

Part Two MODELING 81

Chapter Nine CERTAINTY MODELS AND ADJUSTMENTS 86

9.1 The Evaluation of Outcomes 86
9.2 Using a Certainty Model for Decisions with Immediate Effects 87
9.3 Comments on Wendt's Evaluation 92
9.4 Summary and Generalization of the Analysis 95
9.5 Preliminary Outline for Constructing a Certainty Model for a Decision Problem 98
Assignments 99

Chapter Ten ADJUSTMENTS AND MULTIPLE CRITERIA 104

10.1 Introduction 104
10.2 A Certainty Model for a More Complex Problem 105
10.3 Adjustment 110
10.4 Adjustments for Multiple Criteria: Weighting 114
10.5 Using Curves to Adjust for Multiple Criteria 118
10.6 Expanded Outline for Constructing Certainty Models 121
Assignments 122

Chapter Eleven KRESGE HOME COMFORTS, INCORPORATED: EXERCISE ON VALUATION OF NONMONETARY CONSEQUENCES 129

Assignments 130

Chapter Twelve TIME VALUE CRITERIA IN CERTAINTY MODELS 133

12.1 Introduction 133
12.2 The Use of Present Values 133
12.3 Differences Between Outcomes: The Use of a Base for Evaluation 137
12.4 The Calculation of Outcome Values 139
12.5 Some Further Aspects of the Tennessee Paper Evaluation 141

12.6 Basic Characteristics of Tennessee Paper's Evaluation Method; Linearity, Discount Factors, and Cash Flows 143
12.7 The Selection of a Main Criterion in Business Decision Making 145
12.8 Certainty Models for Choices among Actions with Future Effects 147
Assignments 148

Chapter Thirteen SIMPLE UNCERTAINTY MODELS, PROBABILITIES, AND VALUE DISTRIBUTIONS 156

13.1 Introduction 156
13.2 Simple Uncertainty Models 157
13.3 Assessment of Probabilities for Events 160
13.4 Assessment of Many-Event Probability Distributions 167
13.5 Predictive Variables, Terminal Valuations, and Their Distributions 171
13.6 Using the Output of a Simple Uncertainty Model: Value Distributions 175
13.7 Outline for Simple Uncertainty Models: Inputs and Outputs 179
Assignments 180

Chapter Fourteen PROBABILITY DIAGRAMS FOR UNCERTAINTY MODELS 184

14.1 Introduction 184
14.2 Computing Three-Event and Five-Event probability Distributions 185
14.3 Probability Diagrams 193
14.4 More Complex Probability Diagrams 199
14.5 Simplifications in Diagram Structure and Assessments 203
14.6 Outline for Using Probability Diagrams and Simplified Event Distributions to Compute Value Distributions for Uncertainty Models 207
Assignments 208

Chapter Fifteen ROSITEX COMPANY: THREE PART CASE 215

15.1 Initial Statement of the Problem 215
15.2 Consideration of Risks 224
15.3 Final Adjustments 234
Assignments 236

Chapter Sixteen COMPLEX DECISION TREES AND MODELS: I 238

16.1 Introduction 238
16.2 Complex Decision Trees 239
16.3 How to Design Complex Trees 246

Chapter Seventeen COMPLEX DECISION TREES AND MODELS: II 255

17.1 Design of a Complex Tree for Analysis of a Development Problem 255
17.2 Assessment of Probabilities for Complex Uncertainty Models 261
17.3 Uncertainty Models for Information-Getting Decisions 262
17.4 Summary 268
Assignments 269

Chapter Eighteen CLOSED UNCERTAINTY MODELS 278

18.1 Introduction 278
18.2 Inputs for a Closed Uncertainty Model 279
18.3 Solving a Closed Uncertainty Model 287
18.4 The Outputs from a Closed Uncertainty Model 289
18.5 Risk-Neutral Utility 292
18.6 Summary 295

Chapter Nineteen REVIEW EXERCISES: JOHNSON AGRIPRODUCTS 297

Assignments 299

Chapter Twenty REVIEW EXERCISES 301

20.1 Continental Stores, Incorporated (A) 301
20.2 Continental Stores, Incorporated (B) 303
20.3 Interpretation of Utility Curves 306
20.4 Olympic Fabricators Incorporated 306

Chapter Twenty-One ACME DRILLING COMPANY: I 310

Assignments 314

Chapter Twenty-Two ACME DRILLING COMPANY: II 316

Assignments 318

Chapter Twenty-Three ACME DRILLING COMPANY: III 319

Assignments 319

Chapter Twenty-Four ACME DRILLING COMPANY: IV 322

Assignments 323

Part Three USING DECISION ANALYSIS TO MAKE A SPECIFIC DECISION 327

Chapter Twenty-Five EXERCISE: PERSONAL FINANCIAL DECISION 329

25.1 Choice of Problem 329
25.2 Steps in the Assignment 330
25.3 Form of Write-Up 330

Chapter Twenty-Six THE WILSON CASE 331

26.1 Background 331
26.2 Setting the Terms of Reference 332
26.3 Detailed Structuring 333
26.4 Assessment of Inputs 337
36.5 Computing Outputs 338
26.6 Using Output of Model 341
26.7 Epilogue 347
Assignments 348

Chapter Twenty-Seven THE APPLIED ART OF ANALYZING A DECISION 349

27.1 Overview of Analytical Strategy 349
27.2 Dynamic Decision Analysis 354
27.3 Selecting Immediate Act Possibilities for Analysis 359
27.4 Valuation 363

27.5 Structure of a Decision Model 365
27.6 When and How Much Decision Analysis 371
27.7 Getting Help with Your Decision Analysis 375
Assignments 376

Chapter Twenty-Eight THE RETLON DIVISION CASE AND THE FORD CAR PRODUCT PLANNING CASE 377

28.1 The Retlon Division 377
Assignments 382
28.2 Ford Car Product Planning 382
Assignments 392

Chapter Twenty-Nine ASSIGNMENTS ON DECISIONS WITH ILL-STRUCTURED CRITERIA 393

29.1 Assignment 1: A Student Analyzes a Career Decision 393
29.2 Assignment 2: Personal Career Decision 400
29.3 Assignment 3: Employment of a Statistician 400
29.4 Assignment 4: The Role of Adviser 401

Part Four INFORMATION AND ASSESSMENT 403

Chapter Thirty COHERENCE OF PROBABILITY ASSESSMENT 406

30.1 Introduction 406
30.2 The Drive for Coherence 407
30.3 Rules of Probability 408
30.4 Direct Assessment of Probabilities for a Single Fork 414
30.5 Cumulative Probabilities 418
30.6 The Assessment of Probabilities for Multiple Forks 420
Assignments 422

Chapter Thirty-One VERIDICALITY OF PROBABILITY ASSESSMENTS 424

31.1 Introduction 424
31,2 Proper Scoring Rules 425
31.3 Calibration 429
31.4 Resolution 434

31.5 Calibration Versus Resolution 435
31.6 Conclusion 437
Assignments 437

Chapter Thirty-Two DIRECT ASSESSMENT OF MANY-EVENT PROBABILITY DISTRIBUTIONS 450

32.1 Introduction 450
32.2 Density Functions 451
32.3 Fractiles 453
32.4 Cumulative Probabilities 454
32.5 Reconciliation of Inconsistencies 456
Assignments 458

Chapter Thirty-Three INDIRECT ASSESSMENT OF PROBABILITIES 459

33.1 Introduction 459
33.2 Solving a Probability Diagram—Calculation Versus Simulation 460
33.3 When Many-Event Variables Are Dependent 466
Assignments 469

Chapter Thirty-Four TV CASSETTE EXERCISE: DECOMPOSED ASSESSMENT OF A PRODUCT 470

34.1 Informal Assessment 470
34.2 Decomposed Assessment 471
34.3 Formulas for Decomposing a Product 471
34.4 Reconciling Assessments 472
Assignments 473

Chapter Thirty-Five INFERENCE FROM EVIDENCE 474

35.1 Introduction 474
35.2 Bayes' Theorem 475
35.3 Extent and Causes of Conservatism 479
35.4 Bayes' Theorem as Applied to Many-Event Situations 483
35.5 Many Events and Conservatism 488
35.6 Techniques for Using Historical Frequencies and for Assessing Likelihood Ratios 489
Assignments 498

Chapter Thirty-Six INFORMATION-GATHERING DECISIONS 500

36.1 A Typical Example 500
36.2 Information Versus Operating Decisions 501
36.3 *Simplifying Probability Assessment* 507
36.4 When the Information-Generating Process Is Simple 510
36.5 Evaluating Information Decisions in Terms of Uncertainty Reduction 511
36.6 Assessing the Accuracy of Estimates 515
Assignments 517

Chapter Thirty-Seven THE ALIAD COMPANY (I): PRODUCT PLANNING BASED ON MARKET RESEARCH 520

37.1 Company Background 520
37.2 New Information 521
37.3 Current Uncertainties 522
37.4 Possible Gains from Marketing Research 523
Assignments 524

Chapter Thirty-Eight THE ALIAD COMPANY (II): ANALYSIS OF PRODUCT PLANNING AND MARKET RESEARCH PROBLEMS 525

38.1 Provisional Decision 525
38.2 Applying Decision Theory 526
38.3 Abecole's Outline of the Formal Analysis 526
38.4 Objectives 527
38.5 The Analysis 528
38.6 Masse's Reaction to the Analysis 528
Assignments 546

Part Five DECISION ANALYSIS FOR THE ORGANIZATION 549

Chapter Thirty-Nine DECISION ANALYSIS IN THE ADMINISTRATION OF AN ORGANIZATION 550

39.1 Delegation 550
39.2 Getting Input from the Organization 555

39.3 Organizational Arrangements for Decision Analysis 556
39.4 The Reader as a Proselytizer or Staff Specialist in an Organization 557
39.5 Introducing Decision Analysis into a Business Organization 558
39.6 Developing Decision Analysis as a "New Product" 562
Assignments 564

Chapter Forty NATIONAL GRAIN CORPORATION 566
Assignment 567

Chapter Forty-One THE DECISION TO SEED HURRICANES R. A. Howard, J. E. Matheson, and D. W. North 568

41.1 Decision to Permit Operational Seeding 568
41.2 Decision Under Uncertainty 571
41.3 Uncertainty in Hurricane Wind Changes 572
41.4 Effect of Seeding 574
41.5 Assigning Probabilities to the Hypotheses 576
41.6 Probability Distributions on Wind Speed 578
41.7 Wind Changes and Property Damage 580
41.8 Further Analysis of the Decision to Seed 581
41.9 Government Responsibility 584
41.10 Value of Information 587
41.11 Value of Further Seeding Experiments 590
41.12 Another Approach to Determining the Value of Seeding Experiments 592
41.13 Generalizing the Value of Additional Information 595
41.14 Experimental Capability Decision 596
41.15 Conclusions from the Analysis 597
41.16 Role of Decision Analysis 597
Assignments 598

Chapter Forty-Two MORGAN METAL PRODUCTS INCORPORATED 599
Assignments 602

Bibliography 605
Glossary 609
Index 611