

# The Theory of Taxation for Developing Countries

---

Edited by  
David Newbery  
Nicholas Stern

PUBLISHED FOR THE WORLD BANK

Oxford University Press

# Contents

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Preface  | xi  |
| Notation and Terminology   | xiv |
| Abbreviations  | xv  |
| 1. Introduction <i>David Newbery and Nicholas Stern</i>  | 3   |
| The Scope of the Analysis  | 7   |
| Some Omissions   | 12  |
| Conclusions  | 14  |
| PART 1. THEORY   | 19  |
| 2. The Theory of Optimal Commodity and Income Taxation:<br>An Introduction <i>Nicholas Stern</i> | 22  |
| The Scope of Modern Theories   | 23  |
| The Standard Assumptions   | 26  |
| Optimal Taxation   | 27  |
| The Social Welfare Function  | 46  |
| Applications to General Arguments  | 49  |
| Tax Reform   | 52  |
| Conclusions  | 54  |
| Appendix: Lump-Sum Grants and Indirect Taxes   | 55  |
| Notes  | 59  |
| 3. Aspects of the General Theory of Tax Reform <i>Nicholas Stern</i>                             | 60  |
| Production in the Standard Models of Optimal Taxation  | 61  |
| Incidence of Indirect Taxes  | 66  |
| Some Partial-Equilibrium Issues  | 70  |
| The General Theory of Reform and Shadow Prices   | 74  |
| Trade, Optimal Taxation, and Reform  | 82  |
| A Review of the General Principles   | 83  |
| Conclusions  | 89  |
| Appendix: Normalization and the Choice of Untaxed Goods  | 90  |
| 4. Econometric Issues for Tax Design in Developing Countries<br><i>Angus Deaton</i>              | 92  |
| A Simple Model of Taxes and Tax Reforms  | 93  |
| The Specification of Preferences and Technology  | 96  |
| Data and Estimation  | 107 |
| Conclusions  | 112 |

|  |   |     |
|--|---|-----|
| 5. Dynamic Issues  | <i>David Newbery and Nicholas Stern</i> | 114 |
| The Arrow-Debreu Model and Some Problems                                       | 115                                     |     |
| Investment Policy  | 119                                     |     |
| Tax Policy in Growth Models  | 124                                     |     |
| The Dynamics of Government Revenue Requirements                                | 132                                     |     |
| Costs, Innovation, and Market Structure  | 137                                     |     |
| Conclusions  | 139                                     |     |
| Notes  | 140                                     |     |
| 6. Taxation, Cost-Benefit Analysis, and Effective Protection                   | <i>Christopher Bliss</i>                | 141 |
| Positive and Normative Economics   | 142                                     |     |
| The Explanation of Tariffs   | 144                                     |     |
| Effective Protection   | 147                                     |     |
| Taxation Theory  | 152                                     |     |
| Optimal Taxation and Cost-Benefit Analysis with Tariffs                        | 154                                     |     |
| Further Implications for Cost-Benefit Analysis                                 | 157                                     |     |
| The Developing Country   | 158                                     |     |
| Appendix: Mathematical Details   | 159                                     |     |
| Notes  | 161                                     |     |
| PART 2. STRUCTURAL ISSUES AND TAXATION   |   | 163 |
| 7. Taxation and Development  | <i>David Newbery</i>                    | 165 |
| The Special Characteristics of Developing Countries                            | 167                                     |     |
| Consequences of the Special Features of<br>Developing Economies for Tax Design | 175                                     |     |
| Planning, the Public Sector, and the Problem of Coordination                   | 192                                     |     |
| The Relationship between Tax Structure and the<br>Level of Development         | 193                                     |     |
| Differences in Objectives and Political Constraints                            | 195                                     |     |
| Administrative Capacity and the Problem of Tax Evasion                         | 200                                     |     |
| Conclusions  | 202                                     |     |
| Notes  | 204                                     |     |
| 8. Quantitative Characteristics of the Tax Systems<br>of Developing Countries  | <i>Vito Tanzi</i>                       | 205 |
| The Level of Taxation  | 218                                     |     |
| The Structure of Taxation  | 222                                     |     |
| Other Aspects  | 236                                     |     |
| Appendix: Supplementary Tables   | 239                                     |     |
| Notes  | 241                                     |     |
| 9. Tax Reform in Developing Countries  | <i>Richard Musgrave</i>                 | 242 |
| Tax Reform and Development Policy  | 243                                     |     |
| The Pattern of Distribution  | 246                                     |     |
| Income versus Consumption Base   | 250                                     |     |
| Personal Income Tax  | 251                                     |     |
| Company Taxation   | 256                                     |     |
| Product Taxes  | 259                                     |     |
| Taxes on Property and Land   | 261                                     |     |
| Conclusions  | 262                                     |     |
| Note   | 263                                     |     |

|  |  |     |
|--|--|-----|
| 10. Public Policy and the Labor Market in Developing Countries                   | <i>Gary Fields</i>                       | 264 |
| The Analytical Framework and Its Empirical Foundations                           |  | 265 |
| Public Policy in Models with Wage Dualism  |  | 269 |
| Conclusions  |  | 276 |
| Notes  |  | 277 |
| PART 3. CASE STUDIES IN TAX REFORM   |  | 279 |
| 11. Alternative Sources of Government Revenue: Illustrations from India, 1979–80 | <i>Ehtisham Ahmad and Nicholas Stern</i> | 281 |
| The Composition of Indirect Taxes: Theory  |  | 283 |
| The Taxation of Inputs   |  | 298 |
| Federal and State Taxes  |  | 299 |
| A Comparison of Alternative Sources of Revenue                                   |  | 304 |
| Commodity Taxes  |  | 310 |
| The Personal Income Tax and Comparisons with Indirect Taxes                      |  | 312 |
| Nonmarginal Reforms  |  | 315 |
| Extensions of the Model: The Supply Side   |  | 322 |
| Conclusions  |  | 329 |
| Notes  |  | 332 |
| 12. Some Lessons from Mexico's Tax Reform  | <i>Francisco Gil Díaz</i>                | 333 |
| The Tax Environment of a Small Open Economy                                      |  | 334 |
| The Major Items of the Tax Reform  |  | 335 |
| Some Broad Results of the Tax Reform   |  | 348 |
| The Incidence of the Mexican Tax System on Family Income                         |  | 349 |
| Conclusions  |  | 354 |
| Appendix: Estimates of the Incidence of the Inflationary Tax                     |  | 356 |
| Notes  |  | 359 |
| PART 4. THE THEORY OF AGRICULTURAL TAXATION                                      |  | 361 |
| 13. Agricultural Taxation: The Main Issues                                       | <i>David Newbery</i>                     | 366 |
| The Applicability of the Standard Model  |  | 366 |
| Tax Incidence in Agriculture   |  | 371 |
| Tax Incidence in the Urban Sector with Nontraded Food Crops                      |  | 373 |
| The Debate on Agricultural Taxation and the Terms of Trade                       |  | 376 |
| Instruments for Agricultural Taxation  |  | 379 |
| Directions for Future Research   |  | 384 |
| Conclusions  |  | 385 |
| Notes  |  | 385 |
| 14. The Theory of Tax Design for Developing Countries                            | <i>Anthony Atkinson</i>                  | 387 |
| A Simple Example of a Peasant Economy  |  | 389 |
| The Equity-Efficiency Tradeoff in Our Simple Model                               |  | 392 |
| Direct and Indirect Taxation in the Peasant Economy                              |  | 397 |
| Optimal Taxation   |  | 399 |
| Extensions of the Analysis   |  | 404 |

|   |   |     |
|---|---|-----|
| 15. Optimal Taxation and Shadow Pricing in a Developing Economy                           | <i>Christopher Heady and Pradeep Mitra</i>                    | 407 |
| The Structure of the Model  | 409   |     |
| Analytical Results  | 411   |     |
| Numerical Results   | 413   |     |
| Conclusions   | 423   |     |
| 16. The Taxation and Pricing of Agricultural and Industrial Goods in Developing Economies | <i>Raaj Kumar Sah and Joseph Stiglitz</i>                     | 426 |
| Outline of the Chapter  | 430   |     |
| The Basic Model   | 431   |     |
| A Simple Analysis of Agricultural and Industrial Pricing                                  | 432   |     |
| The Structure of Prices in the Agricultural Sector  | 438   |     |
| The Structure of Prices in the Industrial Sector  | 444   |     |
| Migration and Unemployment  | 448   |     |
| Further Extensions  | 449   |     |
| Tax Analysis for Developing versus Developed Economies                                    | 452   |     |
| Caveats and Misgivings  | 453   |     |
| Conclusions   | 457   |     |
| Notes   | 458   |     |
| PART 5. EMPIRICAL STUDIES OF AGRICULTURAL TAXATION  |   | 463 |
| 17. Multimarket Analysis of Agricultural Pricing Policies in Korea                        | <i>Avishay Braverman, Jeffrey Hammer, and Choong Yong Ahn</i> | 467 |
| The Korean Problem  | 469   |     |
| The Model   | 471   |     |
| Results   | 478   |     |
| Conclusions   | 486   |     |
| Appendix  | 487   |     |
| Notes   | 487   |     |
| 18. Identifying Desirable Directions of Agricultural Price Reform in Korea                | <i>David Newbery</i>  | 489 |
| Summary of Lessons Learned  | 490   |     |
| A Brief Description of the Korean Problem   | 491   |     |
| Policy Analysis   | 498   |     |
| The Marginal Social Cost of Rural Price Interventions                                     | 503   |     |
| The Marginal Social Costs of Urban Price Interventions                                    | 505   |     |
| The Calculation of Social Weights   | 506   |     |
| Quantifying the Social Cost of Raising Revenue  | 508   |     |
| Sensitivity of the Results to Other Parameters  | 511   |     |
| Conclusions   | 512   |     |
| Appendix 18-1. Calculating the Tax Rates on Cereals                                       | 513   |     |
| Appendix 18-2. Calculating the Demand Elasticities  | 514   |     |
| Appendix 18-3. Data Used in Calculations  | 518   |     |
| Notes   | 520   |     |

|  |  |     |
|--|--|-----|
| 19. Short-Run Macroeconomic Effects of Agricultural Pricing Policies                         | <i>Sweder van Wijnbergen</i>           | 521 |
| Relative Food Prices and Export Competitiveness  |  | 522 |
| Model Description  |  | 525 |
| Simulating an Agricultural Price Reform  |  | 526 |
| Conclusions  |  | 529 |
| PART 6. TAXATION AND PRICING IN OTHER SECTORS  |  | 531 |
| 20. The Incidence of Fuel Taxes: A Comparative Study of Three Countries                      | <i>Gordon Hughes</i>                   | 533 |
| Analytical Method and Data Requirements  |  | 535 |
| The Impact of Fuel Taxes on Prices   |  | 540 |
| Expenditure Transfers and the Distribution of Real Income                                    |  | 546 |
| Conclusions  |  | 555 |
| Notes  |  | 558 |
| 21. Pricing Publicly Supplied Goods and Services   | <i>Michael Katz</i>                    | 560 |
| A Model  |  | 562 |
| Price and Rationing Changes  |  | 564 |
| Price and Quality Changes  |  | 573 |
| Menus of Options for Consumers   |  | 583 |
| The Presence of Other Taxes and Subsidies  |  | 585 |
| Conclusions  |  | 587 |
| Notes  |  | 588 |
| 22. Efficiency and Equity Implications of Subsidies to Secondary Education in Kenya          | <i>Jane Armitage and Richard Sabot</i> | 589 |
| The Dual Secondary System in Kenya   |  | 591 |
| Methods and Data   |  | 595 |
| Private and Social Rates of Return to Government and Harambee Schools and Some Adjustments   |  | 598 |
| Access to Government Schools and Family Background   |  | 607 |
| Conclusions  |  | 609 |
| Notes  |  | 611 |
| 23. The Effects of Domestic Taxes on Foreign Private Investment                              | <i>Mark Gersovitz</i>                  | 615 |
| The Large Host   |  | 616 |
| No Taxation of Foreign Capital   |  | 616 |
| Foreign Tax Rules and Developing Country Taxation of Foreign Firms under Separate Accounting |  | 618 |
| The Formula Apportionment Alternative  |  | 624 |
| Country Risk   |  | 627 |
| Attracting Foreign Investment: Tax Holidays  |  | 632 |
| Conclusions  |  | 633 |
| Notes  |  | 634 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| PART 7. FINDINGS AND IMPLICATIONS   | 637 |
| 24. Optimal Tax Theory and Development Policy:<br>Directions for Future Research <i>Peter Diamond</i> | 638 |
| First- and Second-Best Analyses   | 638 |
| Policy Recommendations  | 641 |
| Optimal Tax Theory  | 643 |
| 25. Conclusions <i>David Newbery and Nicholas Stern</i>   | 648 |
| Contributions   | 649 |
| Problems and Omissions  | 651 |
| Further Work  | 654 |
| Final Remarks   | 658 |
| Bibliography  | 659 |
| Affiliations of Contributors  | 679 |
| Index   | 681 |