

What Should Be Taxed: Income or Expenditure?

JOSEPH A. PÉCHMAN
Editor

*A report of a conference sponsored by
the Fund for Public Policy Research
and the Brookings Institution*

Studies of Government Finance

THE BROOKINGS INSTITUTION

WASHINGTON, D.C.

Contents

E. Philip Howrey and Saul H. Hymans

The Measurement and Determination of
Loanable-Funds Saving 1

Review of Previous Studies 9

A First Look at Loanable-Funds Saving 17

A Closer Look at Loanable-Funds Saving 21

Principal Findings 29

Comments by Robert Z. Lawrence 31

Comments by Michael J. Boskin 34

Comments by John A. Brittain 41

Richard Goode

The Superiority of the Income Tax 49

General Comparison of the Taxes 50

Special Problems 63

Practicality of the Expenditure Tax 70

Combination of the Expenditure Tax with Other Taxes 71

Conclusion 72

David F. Bradford

The Case for a Personal Consumption Tax 75

Background: The Concepts of Income and Consumption 77

The Relative Difficulty of Implementing Income and Consumption

Bases 80

Defects of the U.S. Income Tax	90
Efficiency and the Choice between an Income Base and a Consumption Base	96
Equity	102
Conclusion	109
Bibliography	110
Comments by E. Cary Brown	113
Comments by Arnold C. Harberger	117
Comments by Alvin C. Warren, Jr.	120

William D. Andrews

A Supplemental Personal Expenditure Tax	127
General Description of the Tax	129
General Advantages of the Tax	136
Effects on Particular Items	142
Conclusion	150
Comments by Nicholas Kaldor	151
Comments by William A. Klein	157

Michael J. Graetz

Expenditure Tax Design	161
Background	162
Timing Issues: The Treatment of Financial Assets and Loans	166
Consumer Durables and Housing	184
Gifts and Bequests and the Taxation of the Family	197
Amounts Available for Consumption: Receipts	208
Deductions	222
Taxation of Business Income	239
International Issues	248
Administrative Considerations	255
Transitional Problems	261
Conclusion	275
Comments by Sven-Olof Lodin	276
Comments by Paul R. McDaniel	282

Joseph J. Minarik

Conference Discussion	297
The Expenditure Tax and Saving	297
The Expenditure Tax and Equity	302
Administration and Measurement under an Expenditure Tax	308
Transition to an Expenditure Tax	319
Summary and Conclusions	322

Conference Participants 325

Index 327

Tables

E. Philip Howrey and Saul H. Hymans

1. Derivation of Alternative Concepts of Personal Saving, 1975 5
 2. Derivation of Alternative Concepts of Gross Private Saving, 1975 6
 3. Relations of NIPA Personal Income to Personal Cash Receipts before and after Tax and Cash Flows Plus Noncash Receipts after Tax, 1975 7
 4. Relation of NIPA Private Receipts to Private Cash and Noncash Receipts after Tax, 1975 8
 5. Saving Rate Equations, 1951-74 18
 6. Personal Saving Equations Based on Authors' Income Decomposition, 1951-74 and Subperiod 26

William D. Andrews

1. Supplemental Personal Expenditure Tax Schedule for Married Couples Filing Joint Returns 135
 2. Supplemental Personal Expenditure Tax Schedule for Unmarried Persons 135

Michael J. Graetz

1. Average and Marginal Rates of Income Tax of a Married Person in Sweden, 1977 277
 2. Selected Tax Expenditures under the U.S. Individual Income Tax, Fiscal Year 1979 286