Job Creation and Destruction

Steven J. Davis John C. Haltiwanger Scott Schuh



The MIT Press Cambridge, Massachusetts London, England

Contents

TablesxiFiguresxvForewordxviiAcknowledgmentsxxiIntroduction1

1 Concepts, Measurement, and Data 9

- 1.1 Job Creation and Destruction 9
- 1.2 Job Reallocation and Worker Reallocation 11
- 1.3 The LRD: Data and Measurement 13

2 Basic Facts about Job Creation and Destruction 17

- 2.1 Magnitude 18
- 2.2 Persistence 21
- 2.3 Concentration 26
- 2.4 Cyclicality 31
- 2.5 The Connection between Job Reallocation and Worker Reallocation 34

3 Similarities and Differences by Industry and Other Sectors 37

- 3.1 Variation across Industries 38
- 3.1.1 Implications for Worker Flows 38
- 3.1.2 Excess Job Reallocation and Plant-Level Heterogeneity 38
- 3.1.3 Which Industries Create the Most Jobs? 40
- 3.2 Variation across Regions 41
- 3.3 Variation by Wage Level 43
- 3.3.1 Wages and Net Job Growth 43
- 3.3.2 Wages and Gross Job Flows 46
- 3.4 Variation by Exposure to International Trade 47

- 3.5 Variation by Productivity Growth, Factor Intensity, and Degree of Specialization 50
- 3.6 Quantifying the Role of Between-Sector Employment Shifts 52
- Sectoral Variation in the Persistence of Job Creation and Destruction 53

4 Differences by Size and Age of Plants and Firms 57

- 4.1 Context and Motivation 57
- 4.2 Measuring Employer Size and Employer Age 58
- 4.3 Job Creation and Destruction Rates by Employer Size 60
- 4.4 The Size Distribution Fallacy 62
- 4.5 Netting Out Reality 64
- 4.6 The Regression Fallacy 66
- 4.7 An Unsuitable Database 70
- 4.8 What Fraction of New Manufacturing Jobs Did Small Employers Create? 72
- 4.9 Job Creation and Destruction Rates by Plant Age 76
- 4.10 The Durability of Jobs by Employer Size and Age 78

5 Job Flows and Business Cycles 83

- 5.1 Context and Motivation 84
- 5.2 The Prevailing View of Business Cycles 84
- 5.2.1 The Macroeconomic Framework 84
- 5.2.2 Some Empirical Underpinnings of the Prevailing View 85
- 5.2.3 Implications for Layoffs 89
- 5.2.4 Predictions for Job Creation and Destruction Dynamics 90
- 5.3 Time-Series Evidence on Creation and Destruction 91
- 5.3.1 Total Manufacturing 91
- 5.3.2 Variation among Sectors and Plant Types 94
- 5.3.3 A Summary of the LRD Evidence 99
- 5.3.4 Evidence Based on Other Data Sources 99
- 5.4 Some Theoretical Elements of a Richer View of Recessions 103
- 5.4.1 The Role of Heterogeneity and Reallocation Frictions 104
- 5.4.2 Allocative Shocks as Driving Forces behind Aggregate Fluctuations 106
- 5.4.3 Aggregate Shocks and Reallocation Timing Effects 109
- 5.4.4 Information Spillovers, Allocative Shocks, and Aggregate Fluctuations 110
- 5.5 A Case Study: Restructuring in the Steel Industry 112
- 5.6 Differences among Recessions 118

6 Job Flows, Worker Flows, and Unemployment over the Business Cycle 125

- 6.1 Context and Motivation 126
- 6.2 The Relationship between Job Flows and the Unemployment Rate 126
- 6.3 Gross Worker Flows—Concepts and Magnitudes 128
- 6.4 The Time-Series Relationship between Worker and Job Flows 134
- 6.4.1 Total Unemployment Flows 134
- 6.4.2 Unemployment Flows by Reason 138
- 6.4.3 Unemployment Flows by Age and Sex 143
- 6.4.4 Putting the Pieces Together 146
- 6.4.5 Some Missing Pieces 149
- 6.5 Appendix: Seasonal Variation in the Flows 150

7 Economic and Policy Implications 153

- 7.1 The Limitations of Our Statistical Portrait 154
- 7.2 Heterogeneity in Job Growth Outcomes 157
- 7.2.1 The Magnitude and Pervasiveness of Job Reallocation 157
- 7.2.2 Reasons for Heterogeneity 158
- 7.2.3 Heterogeneity, Ignorance, and Economic Policy 159
- 7.3 Targeted Industrial and Commercial Policies 161
- 7.3.1 Arguments for Targeted Policies 161
- 7.3.2 Heterogeneous Business Performance and the Efficacy of Targeted Policies 165
- 7.3.3 Should the Government Pursue Targeted Commercial Policies? 168
- 7.4 Preferential Policy Treatment on the Basis of Employer Size 169
- 7.5 Laws and Policies Governing Worker and Job Flows 172
- 7.6 Worker Retraining, Relocation and Job-Finding Programs 173
- 7.7 International Trade, Job Security, and Specific Human Capital Investment 174
- 7.8 Aggregate Stabilization Policies 176

8 A Postscript on Prospects for Data Development 181

- 8.1 The Standard Statistical Establishment List 182
- 8.2 The Bureau of Labor Statistics 202 Dataset 183
- 8.3 A National Wage Records Database 185
- 8.4 Possibilities and Practicalities 186

189

Technical Appendix 187

A.1 Theoretical Concepts 188 A.1.1 Gross Job Creation, Destruction, and Reallocation A.1.2 Net Job Creation 190 A.1.3 Persistence of Job Creation and Destruction 191 A.2 The Longitudinal Research Database (LRD) 192 A.2.1 Longitudinality 192 A.2.2 ASM Sampling and Panels 194 A.2.3 Sample Frame Maintenance 196 A.3 Adjusting the Raw Data 197 A.3.1 Annual Employment Data 197 A.3.2 Quarterly Employment Data 198 A.3.3 Missing Values and Processing Errors 199 A.4 Measurement Methodology 200 A.4.1 Measurement Mechanics 200A.4.2 Imputation in the First Periods of ASM Panels 204 A.4.3 Retiming Quarterly Births and Shutdowns 205A.5 Statistical Precision 208 A.6 Published versus Sample Data 211 A.6.1 Published Data 212 A.6.2 Comparisons of Levels and Growth Rates 214 A.6.3 Decomposition of Published Data 216A.6.4 A Hypothetical Panel 218 A.6.5 Adjustments to Job Flows Data 219 A.7 Sector Definitions 220 A.7.1 Industry 220 A.7.2 Geography 222 A.7.3 Plant Characteristics 223 # Two-Dimensional Sectoral Classifications A.7.4 230 A.8 Using the Data 230A.8.1 The Data Diskette 230A.8.2 Levels of Gross Job Creation and Destruction 231 A.8.3 Alternative Aggregate Data Classifications 233 A.8.4 Quarter Definitions and Seasonality 234 A.8.5 Change in the SIC Industry Definition 236 A.8.6 Analysis of Startups and Shutdowns 236 A.9 How to Obtain the Data 236

References 239 Index 255