

Beyond Positivism: Economic Methodology in the Twentieth Century

BRUCE J. CALDWELL

University of North Carolina at Greensboro

London

GEORGE ALLEN & UNWIN

Boston

Sydney

ATH

Technische Hochschule Darmstadt
Fachbereich Rechts- und Wirtschaftswissenschaften
Fachgebiet Wirtschaftspolitik (VWL VI)

B 731

Contents

1	Introduction	<i>page</i> 1
PART ONE TWENTIETH CENTURY PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE		
2	Logical Positivism	
	The Vienna Circle	11
	The Logical Positivist Program	13
	Notes	17
3	The Positivist Tradition Matures – The Emergence of Logical Empiricism	
	Introduction	19
	The Search for a Criterion of Cognitive Significance	20
	The Status, Structure, and Function of Theories and Theoretical Terms	23
	The Nature of Scientific Explanation	27
	A Representative Logical Empiricist	30
	Notes	32
4	The Philosophical Attack on Logical Empiricism	
	Introduction	36
	Confirmation, Induction, and Popper's Methodological Falsificationism	38
	Theories and Theoretical Terms	45
	The Nature of Scientific Explanation	53
	Summary	62
	Notes	63
5	Contemporary Philosophy of Science — The Growth of Knowledge Tradition	
	Introduction	68
	Thomas Kuhn	70
	Paul K. Feyerabend	79
	Imre Lakatos	85
	Contemporary Philosophy of Science – A Dilettante's Review and Commentary	89
	Notes	93
PART TWO SOME ESSAYS ON POSITIVISM AND ECONOMIC METHODOLOGY		
6	Robbins versus Hutchison – The Introduction of Positivism in Economic Methodology	

Robbins's Essay	page 99
Robbins and the Austrians	103
Hutchison's Introduction of Positivism	106
Philosophical Evaluation	112
The Austrian Revival	117
The Inadequacy of the Usual Attacks on Austrian Methodology	119
Some Doubts about Falsificationism in Economics	124
The Critique of Austrian Methodology	128
Notes	135

7 Hutchison versus Machlup – On Indirect Testing and the Rationality Postulate

Machlup's Attack	139
Hutchison's Ambiguous Response	142
Philosophical Evaluation	143
The Rationality Postulate, – An Overview	146
Some Questions Concerning the Rationality Postulate	147
Summary and Conclusion	164
Notes	168

8 Friedman's Methodological Instrumentalism

Friedman's Marketing Masterpiece	173
Philosophical Evaluation	175
A Restatement – Friedman as a Methodological Instrumentalist	178
The Philosophical Rejection of Instrumentalism	179
The Methodological Critique of Friedman's Position	181
Summary and Conclusion	184
Notes	186

9 Samuelson – Operationalism, Descriptivism, and Explanation in Economics

Introduction	189
Samuelson's Operationalism and Machlup's Critique	189
An Anachronistic View of Scientific Explanation	192
Wong's Critique of Revealed Preference Theory	195
Does Explanation Exist in Economics?	199
Notes	205

PART THREE PROVISIONAL ANSWERS TO SOME UNSETTLED QUESTIONS

10 Is Philosophy of Science Useful for Understanding Methodology

The Benefits of Understanding the Philosophical Issues	211
Can Philosophy of Science Make Economic Methodology Better?	215
Can Other Approaches Be Taken?	216
Notes	218

11 Prescription, Description, and Theory Appraisal	
Confirmationism and Falsificationism	<i>page</i> 221
The Theory Choice Problem and the Growth of Knowledge Tradition	223
The Integration of Prescription and Description	228
Notes	230
12 Confirmationism and Falsificationism in Economics	
Confirmationism and the Practice of Economists	231
Falsificationism and the Rhetoric of Methodologists	235
Notes	242
13 A Program for Economic Methodologists – Methodological Pluralism	
Methodological Pluralism	245
Answers to Some Possible Objections	250
Notes	252
Notes for Further Reading – Philosophy of Science	253
Notes for Further Reading – Methodology of Economics	256
Bibliography – Philosophy of Science	258
Bibliography – Methodology of Economics	265
Index	273