Similarity and analogical reasoning

Edited by

STELLA VOSNIADOU
ANDREW ORTONY

Technische Hochschule Darmstadt
Fachbereich 3
Institut für Psychologie
Staudenplatz 12, 6100 Darmstadt

The right of the University of Cambridge to print and publish all kinds of books was granted by law in 1534. The University has printed and published continuously since 1584.

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge New York New Rochelle Melbourne Sydney
Contents

Preface xi
List of contributors xiii

Similarity and analogical reasoning: a synthesis 1
STELLA VOSNIADOU and ANDREW ORTONY
Similarity and the structure of concepts 2
Analogical reasoning 6
Implications for instruction 13
Conclusion 15

Part I. Similarity and the structure of concepts 19

1 Similarity, typicality, and categorization 21
LANCE J. RIPS
The role of similarity in theories of categorization 23
Is similarity all there is to categorizing? 27
The independence of similarity and category judgments 38
Where did resemblance theory go wrong? 47

2 Similarity and decision making 60
EDWARD E. SMITH and DANIEL N. OSHERSON
The Kahneman & Tversky approach to decision making 61
Limitations of the Kahneman & Tversky approach 62
A similarity model 63
Applications to decision making 66
Extensions of the model to choice 71

3 Intraconcept similarity and its implications for interconcept similarity 76
LAWRENCE W. BARSALOU
Demonstrations of instability 77
Systematic assessments of instability 79
Sources of instability 86
A retrieval-based framework for dynamic knowledge representation

Intraconcept similarity

Implications for interconcept similarity

Conclusion

4 Two-tiered concept meaning, inferential matching, and conceptual cohesiveness

RYSZARD S. MICHALSKI

Introduction

Inference allows us to remember less and know more

Concept meaning is distributed between representation and interpretation

Some other views on concept representation

The two-tiered representation can reduce memory needed: an experiment

Conclusion

5 From global similarities to kinds of similarities: the construction of dimensions in development

LINDA B. SMITH

Introduction

An analysis of relational concepts

Hypothesis and evidence

Putting it together: the relational knowledge system

Conclusion: relations, similarity, and analogy

6 Comments on Part I: Psychological essentialism

DOUGLAS MEDIN and ANDREW ORTONY

What is psychological essentialism?

Commentary

Conclusion

Part II. Analogical reasoning

The mechanisms of analogical learning

DEDRE GENTNER

Analogical mapping

Kinds of similarity

An architecture for analogical reasoning

Competing views and criticisms of structure-mapping

Psychological evidence for structure-mapping

Decomposing similarity
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Implications for learning</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 A computational model of analogical problem solving</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KEITH J. HOLYOAK and PAUL R. THAGARD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design principles for a cognitive architecture</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The architecture of PI</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analogical problem solving in PI</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A computational framework for empirical findings</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Use of analogy in a production system architecture</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JOHN R. ANDERSON and ROSS THOMPSON</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The PUPS architecture</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analogy</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extending the analogy model</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparison to related work</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Toward a microstructural account of human reasoning</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAVID E. RUMELHART</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parallel distributed processing</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reasoning by similarity</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental models and mental simulation</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal reasoning</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Analogy and the exercise of creativity</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHILIP N. JOHNSON-LAIRD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer: an analogy that worked and an analogy that failed</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A formal theory of analogy</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A factual theory of analogy</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The interpretation of expository analogies</td>
<td>323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The discovery of profound analogies</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Comments on Part II: Levels of description in information-processing theories of analogy</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STEPHEN E. PALMER</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informational constraints: What is an analogy?</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavioral constraints: process models of analogical thought</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

Hardware constraints: the microstructure of analogical thought 342
Conclusion 344

13 Comments on Part II: The role of explanation in analogy; or, The curse of an alluring name 346
GERALD DEJONG
Introduction 346
Commentaries 347
General discussion 357
Conclusion 363

Part III: Similarity and analogy in development, learning, and instruction 367

14 Analogical learning and transfer: What develops? 369
ANN L. BROWN
Introduction 369
Learning, transfer, and development 371
Factors that affect flexible access to knowledge 386
Conclusion 406

15 Analogical reasoning as a mechanism in knowledge acquisition: a developmental perspective 413
STELLA VOSNIADOU
Analogical reasoning: definitional issues 414
Using analogical reasoning 422

16 Remindings in learning and instruction 438
BRIAN H. ROSS
Remindings in learning 439
Remindings in instruction 462
Conclusion 465

17 New approaches to instruction: because wisdom can’t be told 470
JOHN D. BRANSFORD, JEFFERY J. FRANKS, NANCY J. VYE, and ROBERT D. SHERWOOD
The problem of inert knowledge 471
Attempts to facilitate spontaneous access 476
Problem-oriented acquisition and issues of noticing 479
Implications for instruction 487
Conclusion 491
### Contents

18 Multiple analogies for complex concepts: antidotes for analogy-induced misconception in advanced knowledge acquisition 498  
RAND J. SPIRO; PAUL J. FELTOVICH, RICHARD L. COULSON, and DANIEL K. ANDERSON  
  
Overview 499  
  The perspective of advanced knowledge acquisition 500  
  The reductive force of analogy and analogy-induced misconceptions 502  
  Antidotes for analogy-driven misconception: multiple analogies and composite images 514  
  Conclusion 528  

19 Comments on Part III: The activation and acquisition of knowledge 532  
WILLIAM F. BREWER  
  Introduction 532  
  Similarity 534  
  Knowledge 536  
  Development 539  
  Instruction 540  
  Conclusion 544  

Afterword: Comments on Parts I, II, and III: A framework for a theory of comparison and mapping 546  
ALLAN COLLINS and MARK BURSTEIN  
  Types of correspondences 547  
  Contexts in which correspondences are formed 550  
  Issues for a theory of comparison and mapping 554  
  Conclusion 563  

Name index 567  
Subject index 575