

Armand Hatchuel and Benoît Weil

# Experts in Organizations

A Knowledge-Based Perspective  
on Organizational Change

Translated by Liz Libbrecht

<b>TECHNISCHE HOCHSCHULE DARMSTADT</b>
Fachbereich 1
<u>Gesamtbibliothek</u>
<u>Betriebswirtschaftslehre</u>
Inventar-Nr. : 46.523
Abstell-Nr. : A.15/1055
Sachgebiete: _____
_____
_____



Walter de Gruyter · Berlin · New York 1995

# Contents

Acknowledgements .....	XI
Introduction .....	1
1 Expertise faced with diversity .....	3
2 Expertise as an object of management .....	4
3 Expert systems: a questionable development .....	6
4 Two ways of dealing with the same material .....	6
Part 1 .....	9
Chapter 1	
Exploring expertise	
Objectives and materials of a study .....	11
1 Expert systems: the attributes of an approach .....	12
1.1 Elements of the method .....	13
1.2 A new management technique .....	14
2 Expert systems: a vehicle in the domain of expertise .....	16
3 Research material: expert systems in the industrial world .....	19
3.1 Naval: a paradoxical experience .....	19
3.2 Long-term follow-up of projects .....	20
3.3 A methodology for monitoring projects .....	21
3.4 Three basic hypotheses: rationalization with a participatory nature .....	23
Chapter 2	
Artisan, repairer, strategist	
Different facets of expertise .....	27
1 Knowledge and reasoning: where is the boundary? .....	27
1.1 A practical but limiting distinction .....	28
1.2 Classification of expert systems: getting back to the nature of expertise .....	29
2 “Doing know-how” or the artisan’s expertise .....	30
2.1 The preparation of routings for metal processing .....	30
2.2 The representation of “doing know-how”: a typical structure for expert systems .....	32

2.3	The role of calculations and technological models .....	34
3	“Understanding know-how” or the repairer’s expertise .....	36
3.1	“Doing know-how” and “understanding know-how” .....	36
3.2	Cornélius: maintaining a flexible cell .....	37
3.3	Appropriate knowledge for diagnosis: the development of a suitable physiology .....	38
4	“Combining know-how” or the strategist’s expertise .....	43
4.1	Naval: planning the use of oilrigs .....	44
4.2	The GESPI project: untangling the web in a large station .....	49
4.3	Technology and expertise .....	53
5	A paradigm for multiple expertise? .....	54
Chapter 3		
Life of Expertise and Metamorphosis of actors		
Birth, crises and development of expert systems .....		
		57
1	Birth of the project: myths and innovators .....	58
1.1	Mythologization of an industrial problem .....	59
1.2	Innovators: specialists or interveners? .....	62
2	Experts in organizations: nature of expertise and position of the actors .....	64
2.1	Workshop planners: a trade born with Taylorism .....	65
2.2	Station traffic planners: logic of the station .....	66
2.3	Maintenance specialists: organizing expertise hierarchically .....	67
2.4	Scheduling oilrigs: experts or negotiators? .....	68
3	Dynamics of the projects: multiple lines of transformation .....	69
3.1	TOTEM: the basis of a new engineering science .....	70
3.2	GESPI: from station traffic planner to network planner .....	72
3.3	Cornélius: the problem of transferring expertise .....	73
3.4	Naval: the loss of actors and their expertise .....	75
4	Organizational change: production of expertise and metamorphosis of actors .....	77
4.1	The limits of organization seen as a game .....	79
4.2	Production of expertise and control of the framework of collective action .....	82
Chapter 4		
The nature of management techniques		
Dynamics and unexpected repercussions of rationalization .....		
		85
1	Portrait of an expert system project: from myth to stakes .....	86
1.1	A mobilizing myth .....	86
1.2	Enhancing and sharing knowledge .....	87
1.3	Transformation of expertise and discovery of stakes .....	88

2	From operational research to expert systems: a new industrial logic .....	89
2.1	Operational research: modelling to optimize .....	90
2.2	Operational research and expert systems: different origins .....	92
2.3	Expert systems: operational research dedicated to new industrial logics .....	92
2.4	Forgotten lessons of operational research: the problematics of integration .....	94
3	On the nature of management techniques .....	95
3.1	“Rational myths” .....	96
3.2	A ternary structure .....	97
3.3	Use of a management technique: reacting to three types of incompleteness .....	100
4	The AI actor: an autarchic producer of expertise .....	100
5	The unexpected repercussions of rationalization: the progressive discovery of collective action .....	102

Chapter 5

	Hidden crises of industrial expertise	
	Practical and cultural stakes in expert systems .....	105
1	Industrial stakes in expert systems: the hidden crises of industrial expertise .....	106
1.1	Conditions for transferring expertise: relevance and common knowledge .....	106
1.2	The increasing complexity of industrial expertise: proliferation and heterogeneity .....	108
1.3	The effects of technological and economic imbalances: singular expertise .....	111
1.4	Mutation of planning and design expertise and management tools .....	112
2	Firms as producers and legitimizers of expertise .....	116
2.1	Training approaches: new relations between work and learning ..	117
2.2	Weakening of hierarchical relations and dynamics of expertise ...	118

Chapter 6

	Conclusion .....	121
1	Problems of automating expertise .....	122
2	A more accurate perception of rationalization .....	123
3	The stakes of a better sharing of knowledge .....	123

## Part 2

Four case histories of expert systems .....	127
---	-----

Introduction .....	129
--------------------	-----

## Chapter 1

## TOTEM

The reconstruction of production planners' expertise .....	131
--	-----

1 Problem and context: metallurgy and variety .....	131
---	-----

1.1 Processing precious metals: consequences of diversity .....	131
---	-----

1.2 The role of production planners and routing .....	132
---	-----

1.3 Emergence of the project: the goals .....	133
---	-----

2 Expertise in action: production planners prepare their routing ....	134
---	-----

2.1 Example of a production routing .....	134
---	-----

2.2 Preparation of a production routing: steps in the reasoning .....	135
---	-----

2.3 Production routing: a complex task .....	137
--	-----

3 The reconstruction of automated knowledge: birth of a new type of routing .....	139
--	-----

3.1 TOTEM: an expert system for generating routings .....	139
---	-----

3.2 Developing TOTEM: the procedure .....	143
---	-----

3.3 Knowledge formalization: an instructive phase .....	145
---	-----

3.4 Division between technical expertise and operational expertise ...	147
--	-----

3.5 A judicious criterion for choosing applications: the existence of generalizable expertise .....	149
--	-----

4 The project and the development of stakes: towards an industrial transition .....	150
--	-----

4.1 Implementation and conditions for the integration of the system ..	150
--	-----

4.2 First elements in the evaluation of a project .....	152
---	-----

4.3 Emergence of a new type of methods engineer .....	154
---	-----

## Chapter 2

## Cornélius

Fragmented expertise of maintenance specialists .....	155
---	-----

1 Problem and context: controlling a facility .....	155
---	-----

2 Expertise in action: the maintenance team .....	157
---	-----

2.1 Operators of a highly automated flexible cell .....	157
---	-----

2.2 A two-tier maintenance service .....	159
--	-----

3 Reconstruction of automated knowledge: expertise and usage ....	159
---	-----

3.1 Cornélius: an expert system dedicated to maintenance .....	160
--	-----

3.2 Physiology of the machine: structuring knowledge bases .....	163
--	-----

3.3 Experimentation and fine-tuning: who were the users to be? .....	164
--	-----

3.4 Variety of uses, variety of knowledge .....	166
---	-----

4 The project and the development of stakes: lost relevance .....	168
---	-----

Chapter 3

GESPI

Discovery of station traffic planners' expertise ..... 171

1 Problem and context: activity in a large railway station ..... 171

1.1 The station: a railway traffic node ..... 171

1.2 A problem which calls for formalization ..... 172

2 Expertise in action: the station traffic planners ..... 173

2.1 Three levels of traffic control ..... 174

2.2 Limiting initial ambitions ..... 175

2.3 The unseen staff in the planning department ..... 175

3 Reconstruction of automated knowledge: progressive discovery of expertise ..... 176

3.1 GESPI: knowledge and reasoning ..... 176

3.2 The project underway ..... 179

4 The project and development of stakes: rethinking the station? ..... 186

4.1 GESPI in the hands of the planners ..... 186

4.2 Evolution of the traffic planners' job ..... 191

4.3 Multiple facets of project evaluation ..... 192

4.4 The planning department at the centre of the station and its changes ..... 195

4.5 Prospects for diffusing GESPI ..... 196

Chapter 4

Naval

Undefinable expertise of strategic planners ..... 199

1 Problem and context: oil exploration and instability ..... 200

1.1 Drilling: decentralization, uncertainties and commercial negotiations ..... 200

1.2 The stand-by crisis of 1982 ..... 202

2 Expertise in action: planning without a planner ..... 202

2.1 Response to the stand-by crisis: strengthening co-ordination mechanisms ..... 202

2.2 Planning with very few tools ..... 204

3 Reconstruction of automated knowledge: imbalance of expertise ..... 206

3.1 First steps of the project: who is the planning expert? ..... 206

3.2 Naval: building a programme ..... 208

3.3 A pilot for Naval: a system for experts ..... 213

4 The project and the development of stakes: a new status for the experts? ..... 214

4.1	Towards a central planning team .....	214
4.2	Effects of the counter-shock: the value of planning in a cyclic environment .....	215
4.3	End of the project: the loss of expertise .....	216
	Bibliography .....	219