

# **Quasi-Experimentation**

**Design & Analysis Issues for Field Settings**



**Thomas D. Cook** NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY

**Donald T. Campbell** NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY

**Rand McNally College Publishing Company • Chicago**

# Contents

---

## Preface ix

## 1 Causal Inference and the Language of Experimentation 1

Introduction 1

The Language of Experimentation 2

The Concept of Cause 9

*Causation and the Positivist Tradition 10*

*Essentialist Theories of Causation 14*

*John Stuart Mill and Causation 18*

*Popper and Falsificationism 20*

*The Activity Theory of Causation 25*

*An Evolutionary Critical-Realist Perspective 28*

Implications of the Analysis of Causation 30

## 2 Validity 37

Statistical Conclusion Validity 39

*Introduction 39*

*Some Major Threats to Statistical Conclusion Validity 41*

*The Problem of "Accepting" the Null Hypothesis 44*

Internal Validity 50

*Introduction 50*

*Threats to Internal Validity 51*

*Estimating Internal Validity in Randomized Experiments and*

*Quasi-Experiments 55*

*Threats to Internal Validity That Randomization Does Not Rule Out 56*

*Assessing the Plausibility of Internal Validity Threats If a Randomized Experiment*  
*Has Been Implemented 58*

Construct Validity of Putative Causes and Effects 59

*Introduction 59*

*List of Threats to the Construct Validity of Putative Causes and Effects 64*

*Construct Validity, Preexperimental Tailoring, and Postexperimental*  
*Specification 68*

External Validity 70

*Introduction 70*

*List of Threats to External Validity 73*

*Models to Be Followed in Increasing External Validity 74*

Relationships Among the Four Kinds of Validity	80
<i>Internal Validity and Statistical Conclusion Validity</i>	80
<i>Construct Validity and External Validity</i>	81
<i>Issues of Priority Among Validity Types</i>	82
Some Objections to Our Validity Distinctions	85
Some Objections to Our Tentative Philosophy of the Social Sciences	91

### **3 Quasi-Experiments: Nonequivalent Control Group Designs 95**

Notational System	95
Three Designs That Often Do Not Permit Reasonable Causal Inferences	95
<i>The One-Group Posttest-Only Design</i>	96
<i>The Posttest-Only Design with Nonequivalent Groups</i>	98
<i>The One-Group Pretest-Posttest Design</i>	99
Some Generally Interpretable Nonequivalent Control Group Designs	103
<i>The Untreated Control Group Design with Pretest and Posttest</i>	103
<i>The Nonequivalent Dependent Variables Design</i>	118
<i>The Removed-Treatment Design with Pretest and Posttest</i>	120
<i>The Repeated-Treatment Design</i>	123
<i>The Reversed-Treatment Nonequivalent Control Group Design with Pretest and Posttest</i>	124
<i>The Cohort Design in Formal and Informal Institutions with Cyclical Turnover</i>	126
<i>The Posttest-Only Design with Predicted Higher-Order Interactions</i>	134
<i>The Regression-Discontinuity Design</i>	137

### **4 The Statistical Analysis of Data from Nonequivalent Group Designs**

**Charles S. Reichardt 147**

Introduction	147
Nonequivalent Group Designs Without Controlled Selection	148
<i>Elementary Analysis of Variance (ANOVA)</i>	150
<i>Analysis of Covariance (ANCOVA) with a Single Covariate</i>	153
<i>Analysis of Covariance with Multiple Covariates</i>	170
<i>Analysis of Variance with Blocking or Matching</i>	175
<i>Analysis of Variance with Gain Scores</i>	182
<i>Rationales for the Analysis</i>	185
<i>General Guidelines for Analyzing Data from Nonequivalent Groups Without Controlled Selection</i>	196
Analysis of the Regression-Discontinuity Design	202

### **5 Quasi-Experiments: Interrupted Time-Series Designs 207**

Introduction	207
<i>Types of Effects</i>	208
Simple Interrupted Time Series	209
Interrupted Time Series with a Nonequivalent No-Treatment Control Group Time Series	214
Interrupted Time Series with Nonequivalent Dependent Variables	218
<i>Interrupted Time Series with Removed Treatment</i>	221
<i>Interrupted Time Series with Multiple Replications</i>	222
<i>Interrupted Time Series with Switching Replications</i>	223
Some Frequent Problems with Interrupted Time-Series Designs	225
<i>Gradual Rather Than Abrupt Interventions</i>	226
<i>Delayed Causation</i>	227
<i>"Short" Time Series</i>	228
<i>Limitations of Much Archival Data</i>	230

## **6 The Statistical Analysis of the Simple Interrupted Time-Series Quasi-Experiment**

**Leslie J. McCain and Richard McCleary 233**

Introduction 233

The Problem with Ordinary Least Squares Regression 234

Autoregressive Integrated Moving Average (ARIMA) Models 235

*The Deterministic and Stochastic Components of a Time Series* 235

*Defining ARIMA (p, d, q)* 236

*Noise Model Identification* 240

*Estimation of  $\phi$  and  $\theta$  Values* 251

*Diagnosis* 251

ARIMA Seasonal Models 253

*Multiplicative ARIMA Seasonal Models* 253

*Identifying the Seasonal Model* 255

The Intervention Components 261

*Abrupt, Constant Change* 262

*Gradual, Constant Change* 263

*Abrupt, Temporary Change* 264

*Which Transfer Function Should Be Used?* 265

Summary of the Modeling Strategy 268

*Identification* 268

*Estimation* 268

*Diagnosis* 268

*Intervention Hypothesis Test* 269

Three Examples 270

*The Effects of Charging for Calls to Directory Assistance* 270

*The Effects of a Flood on a Local Economy* 278

*The Effects of a Gun Control Law on the Incidence of Armed Robbery* 282

Conclusion 292

## **7 Inferring Cause from Passive Observation 295**

Treatment as a "Dummy Variable" in a Regression Analysis 298

Causal Modeling by Path Analysis 301

Cross-Lagged Panel Correlations 309

The Causal Analysis of Concomitancies in Time Series *Melvin M. Mark* 321

*Ordinary Least Squares (OLS) Regression When Trend or Seasonality Is Present* 321

*OLS Regression When Trend and Seasonality Are Absent or Removed* 324

*Generalized Least Squares (GLS) Regression* 326

*Distributed Lag Models* 327

*The Simple Cross-Correlation Function* 327

*Prewhitening by the Presumed Cause* 330

*The Independent Prewhitening of Both Series* 331

*Spectral Analysis Methods* 333

*Some Generic Problems* 335

*Issues Not Addressed* 338

Concluding Comments on Moving from Passive Observation to Deliberate Manipulation 339

## **8 The Conduct of Randomized Experiments 341**

Introduction 341

*The Functions of Random Assignment* 341

*What Random Assignment Does Not Do* 342

*When Random Assignment Is Not Feasible or Desirable* 344

*This Chapter* 346

Major Obstacles to Conducting Randomized Experiments in Field Settings	347
<i>Withholding the Treatment from No-Treatment Control Groups</i>	347
<i>Faulty Randomization Procedures</i>	350
<i>Sampling Variability and the Number and Choice of Units for Randomization</i>	354
<i>Treatment-Related Refusals to Participate in the Planned Experiment</i>	356
<i>Treatment-Related Attrition from the Experiment</i>	359
<i>Heterogeneity in the Extent of Treatment Implementation</i>	366
<i>The Treatment in the No-Treatment Control Group</i>	367
<i>Unobtrusive Treatment Implementation</i>	369
Situations Conducive to Randomized Experiments	371
<i>When Lotteries Are Expected</i>	372
<i>When Demand Outstrips Supply</i>	374
<i>When an Innovation Cannot Be Delivered in All Units at Once</i>	375
<i>When Experimental Units Can Be Temporarily Isolated: The Equivalent Time Samples Design</i>	377
<i>When Experimental Units Are Spatially Separated or Interunit Communication Is Low</i>	378
<i>When Change Is Mandated and Solutions Are Acknowledged to Be Unknown</i>	380
<i>When a Tie Can Be Broken</i>	381
<i>When Some Persons Express No Preference Among Alternatives</i>	381
<i>When You Can Create Your Own Organization</i>	382
<i>When You Have Control over Experimental Units</i>	383
Conclusion	384

## **References 387**

## **Name Index 397**

## **Subject Index 401**