

THE FIFTH BRANCH

Science Advisers as Policymakers

Sheila Jasanoff

Harvard University Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England
1990

Contents

1. Rationalizing Politics	1	
The Rise of Social Regulation	2	
Science and Policymaking	4	
Expertise and Trust	9	
The Contingency of Knowledge	12	
The Reform Debate	15	
An Alternative Approach	17	
2. Flawed Decisions	20	
Nitrites	21	
2,4,5-T	24	
Love Canal	26	
Estimates of Occupational Cancer	29	
The Technocratic Response	32	
A Critical Counterpoint	36	
3. Science for the People	39	
The Rationale for Public Science	40	
The "New" Expert Agency	43	
Scientific Advice and Open Government	45	
Judicial Review of Science Policy	49	
The Weakening of the Paradigm	57	
4. Peer Review and Regulatory Science	61	//
The Traditions of Peer Review	62	
Peer Review in Practice	64	

Instructive Failures	69
Regulatory Science: Content and Context	76
Implications for Regulatory Peer Review	79
 5. EPA and the Science Advisory Board	 84
Early Political Challenges	84
A New Cooperation	89
Boundary Exercises	95
SAB's Impact on Policy	97
Conclusion	99
 6. The Science and Policy of Clean Air	 101
CASAC and the NAAQS Process	102
Science and Standards	104
Redefining CASAC's Role	112
The Carbon Monoxide Controversy	120
CASAC's Effectiveness: Bridging Science and Policy	121
 7. Advisers as Adversaries	 123
The Scientific Advisory Panel	124
Implementing the Impossible	127
Ethylene Dibromide	130
Dicofol	137
Alar	141
A Fragmentation of Authority	149
 8. FDA's Advisory Network	 152
The Scientific Evaluation of Drugs	154
Expertise and Food Safety	165
Advice and Decision	177
 9. Coping with New Knowledge	 180
The Quest for Principled Risk Assessment	181
Formaldehyde: An Uncertain Carcinogen	193
Conclusion	206

10. Technocracy Revisited	208
A Public-Private Partnership for Science	209
Risk Assessment without Politics	216
The Public Board of Inquiry	222
Wider Applications	226
11. The Political Function of Good Science	229
From Advice to Policy	230
Acceptable Risk	232
Scientific Advice as Legitimation: Negotiation and Boundary Work	234
Defining "Good Science"	236
Normative Implications	241
Conclusion	249
Notes	253
Index	293