CHARACTER EVIDENCE

An Abductive Theory

DOUGLAS WALTON
University of Winnipeg, Canada

Springer

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements xi

Introduction xiii

1
The Problem of Character Evidence 1
1.1 Individual Worth and Respect for Character 2
1.2 Ruling on Relevance of Character Evidence in Trials 5
1.3 Problem of the Two-sided Nature of Character Evidence in Law 9
1.4 Innuendo and Attacks on Character 15
1.5 Character Assassination and Panegyric Discourse 17
1.6 Reputation and Character 20
1.7 Character Attacks and *Ad Hominem* Arguments 24
1.8 A Problem of Reasoning and Evidence 27
1.9 Character Properties in Law and Ethics 29
1.10 Character Evidence in Law and Artificial Intelligence 33

2
Defining and Judging Character 39
2.1 Bias and Character 40
2.2 Habit, Propensity and Motive 43
2.3 Agents, Practical Reasoning and Character 46
2.4 Character as the Property of an Agent 49
2.5 Evaluating Witness Testimony 52
2.6 The Structure of Abductive Reasoning 56
2.7 Character as an Interpersonal Notion 61

2.8 Evidence for Character Judgments 64
2.9 Drawing Conclusions by Abductive Reasoning from Given Data 67
2.10 Differentiating Character, Motive and Bias 74

3
Integrity and Hypocrisy 79
3.1 The Three Central Characteristics of Integrity 80
3.2 Judging a Person's Integrity 82
3.3 Commitment and Integrity 84
3.4 A Case Where a Person's Integrity is in Doubt 87
3.5 Living Up to a Commitment 88
3.6 Integrity and Living Up to a Commitment 90
3.7 Character Attack Based on Alleged Hypocrisy 94
3.8 Evaluation of the Alleged Hypocrisy Case 98
3.9 Evidence for Judgments of Integrity and Hypocrisy 101
3.10 The Defeasibility of Character Judgments 105

4
Simulative Reasoning and Plan Recognition 109
4.1 Collingwood's Theory of Reenactment 110
4.2 Simulative and Autoepistemic Reasoning 112
4.3 Strategic Use of Simulative Reasoning 116
4.4 Scripts and Stories 119
4.5 Simulative Practical Reasoning 123
4.6 Plan Recognition 125
4.7 Characteristics of Simulative Practical Reasoning 128
4.8 Combination of Simulative and Abductive Reasoning 130
4.9 Abstraction and Chaining 133
4.10 Defeasible Reasoning 135

5
Multi-Agent Dialogue 139
5.1 Plausible Reasoning 140
5.2 Plan Recognition and Dialogue 146
5.3 Sources of Dialogue Evidence 149
5.4 Commitment in Dialogue 153
5.5 Legal Evidence and Examination Dialogue 155
5.6 Examination Dialogue and Conversational Postulates 159
5.7 A Dialectical Theory of Explanation 162
5.8 A Dialectical Argumentation Scheme for Abduction 165

5.9 Abductive Evidence for Courage Judgments 170
5.10 Abductive Evidence for Integrity Judgments 174

6
A Multi-Agent System for Character Evidence 177
6.1 Character-Based Inferences 178
6.2 Inferences Linking Evidence to Character 181
6.3 Generalizations and Fallacies 185
6.4 Character-Based Evidence Contrasted to Other Evidence 189
6.5 Argumentation Schemes 192
6.6 *Ad Hominem* Arguments 196
6.7 Plan Recognition and Practical Inconsistency 200
6.8 Simulative Reasoning in *Ad Hominem* Arguments 204
6.9 The PFARD Multi-Agent Dialogue System 207
6.10 Summary of the Method 214

Bibliography 221
Index 231