

**BEYOND
POSITIVISM AND
RELATIVISM**

*Theory, Method,
and Evidence*

LARRY LAUDAN



WestviewPress
A Division of HarperCollinsPublishers

Contents

Preface

ix

Part One

Introduction

- 1 **“The Sins of the Fathers ... ”: Positivist Origins of Postpositivist Relativisms** 3
1. Translation and the Linguistic Turn, 6
 2. The Thesis of Methodological Subjectivity, 14
 3. The Mystique of the Algorithm, 17
 4. The Underdetermination Thesis, 19
 5. The Cumulativity/Progress Thesis, 21
 6. The Demarcation Debacle, 23
- Conclusion, 24

Part Two

Theory and Evidence

- 2 **Demystifying Underdetermination** 29
- Introduction, 29
- Vintage Versions of Underdetermination, 31
- Ampliative Underdetermination, 43
- Underdetermination and the “Sociologizing of Epistemology,” 50
- Conclusion, 53
- Appendix, 54
- 3 **Empirical Equivalence and Underdetermination, with Jarrett Leplin** 55
- Introduction, 55
1. Problems with Empirical Equivalence, 56
 2. Underdetermination, 63
 3. Formal Constraints on Epistemology, 69

Part Three

Methods and Progress

- 4 **A Problem-Solving Approach to Scientific Progress** 77
- Desiderata, 77
 - The Aim of Science, 78
 - Kinds of Problem-Solving: A Taxonomy, 79
 - Progress Without Cumulative Retention, 81
 - The Spectrum of Cognitive Modeling, 82
 - Theories and Research Traditions, 83
 - Adequacy and Promise, 84
 - Patterns of Scientific Change, 85
 - Science and the Nonsciences, 85
 - The Comparative Nature of Theory Evaluation, 86
 - Conclusion, 86
- 5 **For Method: Answering the Relativist Critique of Methodology of Kuhn and Feyerabend** 88
- Kuhn on Method, 89
 - Feyerabend's Critique of Method: Science Without Rules, 99
 - References*, 111
- 6 **Reconciling Progress and Loss** 113
1. The Celestial Mechanics of Newton and Descartes, 117
 2. The Electrical Theories of Nollet and Franklin, 117
 3. Caloric and Early Kinetic Theories of Heat, 118
 4. The Geology of Lyell and His Predecessors, 118.
- References*, 122

Part Four

Choosing the Aims and Methods of Science

- 7 **Progress or Rationality? The Prospects for Normative Naturalism** 125
- Introduction, 125.
 - The Rejection of Rational Reconstructibility as a Metamethodological Criterion, 126
 - A Naturalistic Metamethodology, 131
 - Methodological "Rules" and Methodological "Facts," 134
 - Choosing Between Methodologies, 136
 - A Key Role for History, 137
 - Progress, Not Rationality, 138
 - Conclusion, 140

- 8 The Rational Weight of the Scientific Past:
Forging Fundamental Change in a Conservative Discipline** 142
- A General Thesis About Changing Standards, 144
 Preserving the Tradition, 146
 Reconstituting the Tradition, 150
 Conclusion, 152
References, 153
- 9 Normative Naturalism: Replies to Friendly Critics** 154
- A. What Is Normative Naturalism? 154
 B. If It Ain't Broke, Don't Fix It, 167
 C. Aim-less Epistemology? 173
References, 179

Part Five

History and Sociology of Science

- 10 The Pseudo-Science of Science?** 183
1. Introduction, 183
 2. The Attack on 'Philosophical' Views of Belief, 186
 3. The 'Scientific' Character of the Strong Program, 188
 4. The True, the Rational, and the Successful, 192
 5. The Avowed Primacy of the 'Sociological Turn', 201
 6. Conclusion, 204
 Appendix: More on Bloor, 205
- 11 The Demise of the Demarcation Problem** 210
- Introduction, 210
 The Old Demarcationist Tradition, 211
 A Metaphilosophical Interlude, 215
 The New Demarcationist Tradition, 218
 Conclusion, 222
- 12 Science at the Bar—Causes for Concern** 223
- Appendix: More on Creationism, 227
- 13 Dominance and the Disunity of Method:
Solving the Problems of Innovation and Consensus,
with Rachel Laudan** 231
1. Introduction: Three Problems, 231
 2. Solutions to the Problems, 233
 3. Shifting Standards and Drifting Continents, 235

4. Conclusion, 241
Appendix, 241
References, 242

<i>List of Credits</i>	245
<i>Notes</i>	247
<i>Selected Bibliography</i>	271
<i>About the Book and Author</i>	273
<i>Index</i>	274