

# Language, thought and consciousness

*An essay in philosophical psychology*

---

Peter Carruthers

*Professor of Philosophy and Director, Hang Seng Centre for  
Cognitive Studies, University of Sheffield*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# Contents

---

<i>Preface</i>	page xi
Introduction	I
1 The geography of the issues	9
1.1 Conceptual versus natural modality	9
1.2 Implications for philosophy and psychology	13
1.3 Of wolves and wolf-children	16
1.4 Stalnaker's intelligent Martians	20
1.5 Anti-realist arguments	22
1.6 Realism in mind	25
1.7 Innateness and theory of mind	29
1.8 Thinking: images or sentences?	31
2 Which language do we think with?	40
2.1 The evidence from scientific psychology	40
2.2 The evidence of introspection: images and imaged sentences	49
2.3 The scope and strength of the introspective thesis	52
2.4 Objections and elucidations	55
2.5 Fallible introspection and Fodor	60
2.6 Individuating propositional attitudes	62
2.7 Animals and infants	65
2.8 Language-learning and sub-personal thought	67
3 Thought-based semantics	73
3.1 The argument from foreign believers	73
3.2 Grice's thought-based semantics	76
3.3 Two objections	78
3.4 Searle's version of thought-based semantics	83
3.5 A marriage of Searle and Fodor?	85
3.6 Causal co-variance theories	88
3.7 Misrepresentation, and asymmetric causal dependence	91
3.8 The <i>all Ss</i> problem	96
4 Holism and language	103
4.1 From mental realism to Mentalese	103
4.2 The demand for scientific vindication	105
4.3 The problem of holism	107

4.4	Between holism and atomism	111
4.5	Arguments for holism	114
4.6	The need for a language-based semantics	120
4.7	Language-based semantics 1: functional-role semantics	123
4.8	Language-based semantics 2: canonical acceptance conditions	127
5	First steps towards a theory of consciousness	133
5.1	Retrospect: the need for a theory of consciousness	133
5.2	Conscious versus non-conscious mental states	135
5.3	Cartesian consciousness	140
5.4	Why Cartesianism won't do	143
5.5	What kind of theory do we want?	147
5.6	Kirk: presence to central decision-making	150
5.7	Higher-order discrimination and feel	154
5.8	The case for higher-order thought theory	157
6	Second (-order) steps towards a theory of consciousness	164
6.1	Theory 1: actual and conscious	164
6.2	Theory 2: actual and non-conscious	166
6.3	Theory 3: potential and non-conscious	170
6.4	Theory 4: potential and conscious	174
6.5	Dennett 1978: availability to print-out	176
6.6	Dennett 1991: multiple drafts and probes	178
6.7	Time and indeterminacy	183
6.8	Dennett on the place of language in thought	187
7	A reflexive thinking theory of consciousness	194
7.1	Reflexive thinking theory	194
7.2	Contrasts and advantages	198
7.3	Conscious versus non-conscious thinking	201
7.4	Objections and elucidations	204
7.5	The problem of unity	208
7.6	The problem of phenomenal feel	212
7.7	A Cartesian Theatre?	217
7.8	Animals and infants revisited	220
8	The involvement of language in conscious thinking	225
8.1	An architecture for human thinking	225
8.2	An evolutionary story	231
8.3	The argument from introspection revisited	234
8.4	Working memory and the central executive	245
8.5	The thesis of natural necessity (weak)	251
8.6	Objections and elucidations	259
8.7	The thesis of natural necessity (strong)	263
8.8	The scope and significance of NN	269
	Conclusion	277
	<i>References</i>	280
	<i>Index</i>	287