

JOHN PHILOPONUS' CRITICISM
OF ARISTOTLE'S
THEORY OF AETHER

BY
CHRISTIAN WILDBERG

1988

WALTER DE GRUYTER · BERLIN · NEW YORK

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	VII
Abbreviations	XIII
1. Introduction	1
PART I	
2. The Foundation of Aristotle's Theory of Aether	9
2.1 Aether and Eternity	9
2.1.1 αἰθήρ and aether	9
2.1.2 Eternity in Aristotle	12
2.2 The Prologue: <i>De caelo</i> I 1	16
2.2.1 The subject-matter of natural science: 268 a 1–6 ..	17
2.2.2 The argument of <i>De caelo</i> I 1, 268 a 6–b 10	19
2.3 Mathematics and Physics in <i>De caelo</i> I 1	28
2.4 Conclusion	37
3. The Existence of Aether: <i>De caelo</i> I 2	39
3.1 Gathering Premises	39
3.1.1 Nature as a principle of motion: 268 b 14–16	39
3.1.2 The division of locomotion: 268 b 17–26	44
3.1.3 The 'correlation' of motion and bodies: 268 b 26–269 a 2	49
3.1.4 The problem of the completeness of the division of motion	51
3.2 The Existence, Simplicity and Priority of Aether	56
3.2.1 The argument for the existence and simplicity of aether, 269 a 2–7	56
3.2.2 The naturalness of the celestial movement: 269 a 7–18	60
3.2.3 The simplicity and priority of the celestial element: 269 a 18–32	64
3.2.4 Additional arguments: 269 a 32–b 13	68
3.3 Conclusion	71

4. The Nature of Aether: <i>De caelo</i> I 3–4	73
4.1 Aristotle's Negative Celestial Physics	73
4.1.1 The denial of 'weight and lightness': 269 b 18–270 a 12	74
4.1.2 The denial of generation, increase, and alteration: 270 a 12–35	80
4.2 The Conclusion of the Argument and Additional Evidence	88
4.2.1 The eternal existence of aether	88
4.2.2 Additional evidence: 270 b 5–25	90
4.3 Contrariety and Circular Motion: <i>De caelo</i> I 4	92
4.3.1 Circular and rectilinear motion: 270 b 33–271 a 5	93
4.3.2 Contrariety in a circle: 271 a 5–33	94
4.4 Conclusion	98

PART II

5. Philoponus' Rejection of Aether: Book I	103
5.1 Introduction	103
5.2 On the Correlation of Natures and Motions	106
5.2.1 Fragments I/1–3	107
5.2.2 Fragment I/4	111
5.2.3 Fragment I/5	117
5.3 Against the Division of Locomotion: Fragments I/6–8	120
5.3.1 Fragment I/6	120
5.3.2 Fragment I/7	121
5.3.3 Fragment I/8	123
5.4 The Movement of the Firesphere	125
5.4.1 The movement of the firesphere in Aristotle's <i>Me- teorology</i>	125
5.4.2 Solutions to the problem of the firesphere	126
5.4.3 Philoponus on the movement of the firesphere: Fragments I/9–17*	130
5.5 Against the Priority of the Heavens	135
5.5.1 Fragment I/18	136
5.5.2 Fragments I/19–22	137
5.5.3 Fragments I/23–24	139
5.5.4 Fragments I/25–28	140
5.5.5 Fragments I/29*–32	143
5.5.6 Fragments I/33–36*	145
5.6 Conclusion	145

6. On the Nature of the Celestial Region: Books II and III . . .	147
6.1 The Structure and Argument of Book II	147
6.1.1 Fragments II/37–39	147
6.1.2 Fragments II/40–46	149
6.1.3 Fragments II/47 and 48	156
6.1.4 Fragments II/49 and 51	159
6.2 The Structure and Argument of Book III	165
6.2.1 Fragments III/52–56	166
6.2.2 Excursus to Fragment III/54: Philoponus on light and heat	175
6.2.3 Fragments III/57*–61*	181
6.3 Conclusion	185
7. The Celestial Body: Unalterable but Corruptible	187
7.1 The Structure and Argument of Book IV	187
7.1.1 Fragment IV/63	188
7.1.2 Fragments IV/64*–72	189
7.1.3 Fragments IV/73–74	195
7.1.4 Fragments IV/76–80	201
7.2 Excursus: Philoponus' Conception of 'The Three-dimen- sional'	204
7.2.1 Different interpretations of the three-dimensional	205
7.2.2 The fundamental levels of being in the <i>Physics</i> com- mentary	207
7.2.3 The three-dimensional: ὑποκείμενον and οὐσία	212
7.2.4 The three-dimensional in the <i>Contra Aristotelem</i>	219
7.3 The Structure and Argument of Book V	221
7.3.1 Fragments V/82–86	222
7.3.2 Fragments V/87–91	224
7.3.3 Fragments V/92–93	227
7.3.4 Fragments V/94–100	229
7.3.5 Fragments V/101–107	230
7.4 Conclusion	231
8. Conclusion	234
8.1 Retrospect	234
8.2 Aristotle and Philoponus: A Summary Comparison	236
8.3 The Application of Impetus Theory to the Motion of the Celestial Spheres	239

9. List of Fragments	247
10. Indices	251
11. Bibliography	265