Origins of Objectivity

TYLER BURGE

CLARENDON PRESS • OXFORD
# Contents

Preface xi  

## PART I

1. Introduction 3
   - Individual Representationalism 12
   - A Different Standpoint 22

2. Terminology: What the Questions Mean 30
   - Representation 30
   - Representation-as and Representational Content 34
   - Representation Failure and Representation As Of 42
   - Objectivity 46
   - Particulars, Attributes, Properties, Relations, Kinds 54
   - Resources and Conditions 56
   - Constitutive Conditions and Natures 57
   - Summary 59

3. Anti-Individualism 61
   - Anti-Individualism: What It Is 61
   - General Grounds for Anti-Individualism 73
   - Anti-Individualism Regarding Perception 82
   - The Shape of Perceptual Psychology 87
   - Perceptual Psychology Presupposes Anti-Individualism 98
   - Perceptual Capacities Shared Across Species 101
   - Individual Representationalism and Perceptual Psychology 103
   - Perception and Concepts 104
   - Anti-Individualism and Individual Representationalism 105

## PART II

4. Individual Representationalism in the Twentieth Century’s First Half 111
   - Individual Representationalism in Psychology 112
### Contents

Individual Representationalism in Mainstream Philosophy Before the Mid-Twentieth Century 115

Individual Representationalism in “Continental” Philosophy Before the Mid-Twentieth Century 129

5. Individual Representationalism after Mid-Century: Preliminaries 137
   - The Demise of Logical Positivism, Behaviorism, and Descriptivism 140
   - Descriptivism and the Causal Picture of Reference 143
   - Individual Representationalism and Anti-Individualism: Again 149

   - Kant 154
   - Strawson—Two Projects 156
   - Strawson on Kant 160
   - Strawson on Solipsism 162
   - Strawson on Feature Placing 163
   - Strawson on Particular-Identification in Thought 171
   - Strawson on Criteria for Representation 176
   - Postlude: Strawson on Criteria in Identificational Reference 180
   - Evans on Strawson 181
   - Evans on Constraints on Objective Reference in Perception 184
   - Evans on Demonstrative, Perceptual Thought 191
   - Evans on Conditions for Representing Kinds and Particular Objects 194
   - Evans on Spatial Representation in Thought 199
   - Neo-Kantian Individual Representationalism: Summary 208

7. Language Interpretation and Individual Representationalism: Quine and Davidson 211
   - Quine’s Starting Point: The Argument from Default Neutrality 212
   - Interlude: Evans’s Critique of Quine on Referential Indeterminacy 216
   - Communication and Evidence: Quine’s Notion of the Empirical 223
   - Before Objective Reference: The Pre-Individuative Stage 227
   - Truth Conditions and Structure 230
   - The Pre-Individuative Stage: Proximal Stimulation and the Physical Environment 232
   - Divided Reference: The Supplemental Linguistic Apparatus 235
   - Quantification 238
   - Further Elements in Quine’s Individuative Apparatus 250
   - The Basic Assumption 254
   - Identity and Resemblance 260
   - Davidson on Conditions for Objective Empirical Representation 264
   - Davidson’s Two Arguments 267
   - Davidson on Belief 276
### Contents

Language-Centered Individual Representationalism: Summary 281
A Retrospective on Individual Representationalism 283

**PART III**

8. Biological and Methodological Backgrounds 291
   - Deflationary Conceptions of Representation; Biological Function and Representational Function 292
   - Representational Function and Natural Norms 308
   - The Lower Border of Perception: Sensory Information Registration and Perception 315
   - Perception and the Environment: The 'Disjunction Problem' 319
   - Primitive Agency 326
   - Perceptual Psychology and the Distinction between Sensory Information Registration and Perception 342
     - Convergence 347
     - Lightness Constancy 351
     - Planar Slant from Planar Surface Texture 355
     - Depth from Convexity of Image Regions 359

9. Origins 367
   - Perception as the Individual's 369
   - Perception as Sensory 376
   - Perception as Representation 379
   - Perception as Objectification 396
   - Perception as Objectification as Opposed to Perception as Extraction of Form 416
   - Phylogenetic Distribution of Perceptual Systems 419
   - Examples of the Sensory-Registration/Perception Distinction 421
   - Perception, Representation, Propositional Knowledge 430

10. Origins of Some Representational Categories 437
    - Perception and Body 437
      - Body Representation as Originating in Perception 438
      - Singular Applications in Perception of Bodies 450
      - General Elements in Perception of Bodies: Conditions for Body Attribution 454
      - Perception of Body and Attribution of Solidity and Generic Shape 465
    - Perception and Origins of Mathematical Capacities 471
      - Estimating Numerosity and Ratios of Aggregates 472
      - Mathematical Tracking of Indexed Particulars 483
      - The Two Mathematical Capacities 490
    - Perception and Origins of Spatial Representation 492
x Contents

Beaconing 498
Path Integration 499
Landmark Use 507
Map Use 509
Spatial Representation in Navigation by Jumping Spiders and Other Arthropods 514
Perception and Origins of Temporal Representation 518
Association, Computation, Representation 529

11. Glimpses Forward 532
The Epistemic Status of Constitutive Principles Governing Perception 532
The Upper Border of the Perceptual: Perception and Propositional Attitudes 537
Propositional Attitudes, Individual Representationalism, and Conceptualization of Perception 544
Origins, Levels, and Types of Objectivity 547

Bibliography 552
Author Index 583
Subject Index 591