



---

# Federalism and Economic Union in Canada

KENNETH NORRIE,  
RICHARD SIMEON  
AND  
MARK KRASNICK

*Published by the University of Toronto Press in cooperation  
with the Royal Commission on the Economic Union and  
Development Prospects for Canada and the Canadian  
Government Publishing Centre, Supply and Services Canada*

University of Toronto Press  
Toronto    Buffalo    London

# CONTENTS

---



FOREWORD *ix*  
INTRODUCTION *xi*  
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS *xv*  
AUTHORS' INTRODUCTION *xvii*

## **PART I**

### **Principles of Federalism 1**

CHAPTER 1  
**Introduction 3**

CHAPTER 2  
**Functional Models of Federalism 7**  
Least-Cost Models 7  
Public-Choice Theories 12

CHAPTER 3  
**Federalism and Democracy 17**

CHAPTER 4  
**Federalism and Community Identities 23**

CHAPTER 5  
**The British North America Act 29**

## **PART II**

**The Institutions of Federalism: Principles, Practices and Problems 35**

## **CHAPTER 6**

**Introduction** 37

## **CHAPTER 7**

**The Division of Powers** 41

**Structuring a Division of Powers** 42

Detailed or Broad? 42

Watertight Compartments or Concurrence? 43

General and Residual Clauses 44

Symmetry or Asymmetry? 45

Citizen and State 47

**Evolution of the Division of Powers** 49

**Explanations** 54

## **CHAPTER 8**

**Refereeing the Constitution** 61

**The Courts** 61

**Constitutional Amendment** 64

## **CHAPTER 9**

**Intergovernmental Fiscal Arrangements** 69

**Principles** 70

The Case for Decentralization 70

The Case against Decentralization 71

**Canadian Experience** 80

Tax Collection Agreements 81

Intergovernmental Transfers 87

Equalization 99

## **CHAPTER 10**

**Mechanisms and Processes of Intergovernmental Relations** 121

**Structure and Process** 122

**Factors Affecting the Intergovernmental Relationship** 131

## **CHAPTER 11**

**Assessment and Some Directions for Reform** 139

**Assessment: The Functional Approach** 140

**Assessment: Federalism and Democratic Values** 154

**Assessment: Reconciling Loyalties** 161

The Orientations of Canadians 162

Explaining the Saliencé of Community Tensions 169

Directions for Reform 176

## **CHAPTER 12**

**Quebec: A Special Case?** 183

**The Evolution of Quebec Nationalism** 184

**The Quiet Revolution** 186

**Reactions to Quebec Nationalism** 187

**Conclusion** 190

**CHAPTER 13**

**Conclusion: The Living Canadian Constitution? 193**

**PART III**

**Federalism and Economic Performance 197**

**CHAPTER 14**

**Introduction 199**

**CHAPTER 15**

**Conceptual Framework 201**

**CHAPTER 16**

**Principles of Integration 207**

**CHAPTER 17**

**Calculating Efficiency and Redistributive Impacts of Economic Policies 213**

**A Simple Partial-Equilibrium Model 213**

**Tariffs as an Illustration 216**

**General Equilibrium Analysis 219**

**CHAPTER 18**

**Canada as a Customs Union 223**

**Trade in Goods and Services, by Region 223**

**Interregional Aspects of the Tariff 233**

**A Simple Two-Region Trade Model 233**

**Interregional Trade with Transport Costs 235**

**Estimates of the Regional Impact of Tariffs 236**

**Internal Trade Barriers 239**

**Government Procurement Policies 240**

**Agricultural Marketing Boards 243**

**Trucking Regulations 246**

**Liquor Policies 247**

**General Equilibrium Calculations 248**

**Directions for Reform 248**

**Judicial Enforcement 252**

**Federal Enforcement 253**

**Policing through Intergovernmental Cooperation 254**

**CHAPTER 19**

**Canada as a Common Market 257**

**Factor Mobility and Economic Performance: Principles 257**

**Factor Mobility and Aggregate Output 258**

**Factor Mobility and Regional Disparities 259**

**Mobility and Regional Fairness 261**

**Barriers to Factor Mobility 264**

**Barriers to Labour Mobility 265**

Barriers to Capital Mobility	269
Issues and Directions for Reform	271
Regional Disparities	273
Patterns and Explanations of Disparities	273
Interregional Adjustment	277
Regional Economic Development Policy	280
Issues and Directions for Reform	288

## CHAPTER 20

### Canada as an Economic Union 293

#### Principles 294

#### Background 297

#### Stabilization Policy 302

##### Monetary Policy 302

##### Fiscal Policy 304

##### Incomes Policies 305

##### Exchange Controls 306

##### Summary 306

#### Trade and Foreign Policies 307

#### Sectoral Policies 311

##### Transportation 312

##### Communications 313

##### Financial Institutions 314

##### Securities 316

##### Fisheries 317

##### Natural Resources 317

#### Regional Fairness 320

#### Conclusion 323

## PART IV

### Challenges to Federalism 327

## CHAPTER 21

### The Future of Canadian Federalism 329

#### Clearing the Old Agenda 329

#### The Emergence of New Interests 330

#### The Role of Restraint 330

#### The Future International Environment 333

#### The Future of Quebec Nationalism 335

#### A New Government in Ottawa 335

## CHAPTER 22

### Conclusions 339

## NOTES 343

## BIBLIOGRAPHY 344

## APPENDIX A: Commission Research Studies Cited, by Author 347