

# Rabbinic Categories

Construction and Comparison

*by*

Jacob Neusner



**BRILL**  
LEIDEN · BOSTON  
2005

## CONTENTS

|               |      |
|---------------|------|
| Preface ..... | xiii |
|---------------|------|

### PART ONE

#### THE CANONICAL CONSTRUCTION OF RABBINIC CATEGORIES

##### I. The Categories of the Halakhic Documents

|  |    |
|--|----|
| 1. The Categories of the Mishnah: The Topical Theory of Halakhic Category-formation.....   | 5  |
| i. How do we recognize a category when we see one? .....   | 5  |
| ii. Four plausible theories of category-formation and the one that was chosen for the Halakhah .....   | 7  |
| iii. The Mishnah's categories: defined by topic, articulated by proposition .....  | 11 |
| iv. Categories defined by authority .....  | 46 |
| a. Eduyyot .....   | 46 |
| b. Abot.....   | 46 |
| v. Categories dictated by Scripture .....  | 48 |
| vi. The Mishnah's mode of category-formation .....   | 49 |
| vii. The documentary origin of the Mishnah's categories .....  | 50 |
| 2. Halakhic Categories after the Mishnah: From the Tosefta through the Bavli .....   | 55 |
| i. Why the Mishnah's topical-propositional categories logically best suit the task of Halakhic exposition and therefore persisted in the successor-documents ..... | 55 |
| ii. The expansion of the Halakhah: the identification of new topical or analytical category-formations .....   | 57 |
| iii. The Tosefta's anomalous composites.....   | 60 |
| a. New topics .....  | 60 |
| b. New propositions or analytical principles .....   | 60 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| iv. The Yerushalmi's anomalous composites .....  | 61  |
| a. New topics .....  | 61  |
| b. New propositions or analytical principles .....   | 61  |
| v. The Bavli's anomalous composites .....  | 61  |
| a. New topics .....  | 61  |
| b. New propositions or analytical principles .....   | 62  |
| vi. The Bavli's rules of Halakhic category-formation .....   | 63  |
| vii. The Bavli's judgment on the received repertoire of<br>categories .....  | 67  |
| viii. Why this, not that? .....  | 68  |
| ix. Halakhic categories beyond the Mishnah .....   | 70  |
| <br>   |     |
| 3. Sifra: The Exegetical Alternative to the Topical Theory of<br>Categorizing the Halakhah .....   | 73  |
| i. From the topical to the exegetical mode of<br>category-formation .....  | 73  |
| ii. The documentary definition of categories: the case of<br>Sifra .....   | 74  |
| iii. How Sifra presents a topic treated also in the Mishnah....  | 77  |
| iv. The categories of Leviticus compared with those of the<br>Mishnah .....  | 80  |
| v. How the Mishnah presents a category treated also in<br>Scripture .....  | 81  |
| vi. The Scriptural-exegetical alternative to the topical<br>theory of categorizing the Halakhah .....  | 87  |
| vii. The documentary definition of Sifra's categories: what is<br>at stake? .....  | 88  |
| viii. Contrasting the Mishnah's Topical-Propositional<br>Principle of Category-Formation with Sifra's<br>Exegetical-Polemical Counterpart..... | 91  |
| ix. The documentary origin of Sifra's forms, topical<br>program, and classifications .....   | 107 |
| <br>   |     |
| II. The Categories of the Aggadic Documents  |     |
| <br>   |     |
| 4. Genesis Rabbah: The Exegetical Theory of Categorizing the<br>Aggadah .....  | 113 |
| i. The exegetical mode of category-formation addresses<br>Scriptural narrative .....   | 113 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| ii. Exegesis and proposition: Separate tasks and the distinctive forms devised to accomplish those tasks.....  | 116 |
| iii. The exegetical work: A representative sample .....  | 118 |
| iv. The exegetical construction: An outline of the representative sample .....   | 137 |
| v. No categories comparable to the Halakhic construction of the Mishnah, no cogent polemics comparable in documentary effect to the theological enterprise of Sifra .. | 146 |
| <br>   |     |
| 5. Leviticus Rabbah: The Propositional Theory of Categorizing the Aggadah .....  | 149 |
| i. The propositional mode of category-formation addresses Scripture .....  | 149 |
| ii. A sample <i>parashah</i> of Leviticus Rabbah: topic, proposition .....   | 152 |
| iii. The cogency of the topical exposition .....   | 170 |
| iv. Topical categories, implicit propositions in Leviticus Rabbah .....  | 180 |
| v. Categorical origins: biblical exegesis or theological syllogism? .....  | 184 |
| vi. Exegesis and syllogistic discourse: the role of Scripture ....   | 185 |
| vii. The unity of the Aggadah and the Halakhah: different topics, common mode of category-formation.....   | 186 |
| <br>   |     |
| 6. Pesiqta deRab Kahana: The Formation of Extra-Scriptural Aggadic Categories.....   | 189 |
| i. Beyond Scripture: categories shaped by the liturgical calendar, its topics and their propositions.....  | 189 |
| ii. The propositional mode of category-formation abandons Scripture .....  | 193 |
| iii. A sample <i>pisqa</i> of Pesiqta deRab Kahana: topic, proposition .....   | 194 |
| iv. The cogency of the topical proposition .....   | 210 |
| v. The topics and their propositions .....   | 219 |
| vi. Beyond Scripture: the astral categories .....  | 221 |
| vii. The role of Scripture.....  | 224 |
| viii. Categorical Perfection: the absolute and fixed order of the document.....  | 226 |

|                                      |     |
|--------------------------------------|-----|
| ix. Nature and renewal .....         | 227 |
| x. The astral category, Israel ..... | 228 |

### III. The Documentary Boundaries of Categories. The Bavli's testimony

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 7. The Bavli's Union of Halakhic and Aggadic Categories .....  | 235 |
| i. Aggadic categories in the Bavli .....   | 235 |
| ii. The three classifications of the Bavli's composites .....  | 236 |
| iii. Aggadic composites integrated into the Bavli's Halakhic<br>presentation: the case of the massive Aggadic categorical<br>construction in Bavli Abodah Zarah chapter one .....          | 237 |
| iv. How do the topical composites fit into the<br>Talmud-tractate Abodah Zarah and what do they<br>contribute that the Mishnah-tractate of the same name<br>would lack without them? ..... | 261 |
| a. Abodah Zarah and Scripture .....  | 264 |
| b. From Scripture to the Mishnah .....   | 266 |
| c. From the Mishnah to the Talmud: the Bavli's Aggadic<br>Category for Abodah Zarah .....  | 269 |
| v. The documentary basis for category-formation: do<br>categories circulate beyond documentary boundaries? .....   | 271 |

## PART TWO

### COMPARING THEOLOGICAL CATEGORY-FORMATIONS IN RABBINIC JUDAISM. GENERATIVE VERSUS INERT, PRIMARY VERSUS SUBORDINATE

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Introduction .....  | 277 |
| i. Mackubin Thomas Owens's Definition of a Good<br>Theory in Social Thought ..... | 277 |
| ii. The Categorical Construction of a Theory of the Social<br>Order .....         | 278 |
| iii. The Theological Category-Formations of the Aggadic<br>Compilations .....     | 279 |
| iv. The Aggadic Theological System .....  | 280 |
| v. The Aggadic Narrative of the Halakhic System .....                             | 284 |
| vi. The Category-Formations of the Halakhic System .....                          | 286 |

## I. Generative Versus Inert Category-Formations

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 8. Generative Category-Formations: The Synergy of Sin, Repentance, and Atonement .....                                     | 299 |
| i. The Systemic Centrality of Sin-Atonement-Repentance ..  | 299 |
| ii. Sin .....  | 300 |
| iii. Repentance .....  | 305 |
| iv. Atonement .....  | 310 |
| v. Generative Versus Inert Category-Formations: The Case at Hand .....   | 316 |
| a. Does the Category Sin-Atonement-Repentance Describe Most of the Relevant Data? .....                                    | 316 |
| b. Does the Category Sin-Atonement-Repentance Yield a Theory of the Future, possessing Predictive Quality? .               | 316 |
| c. Does the Category Sin-Repentance-Atonement Yield Norms of Public Policy? .....  | 317 |
| 9. An Inert Category-Formation: The Kingdom of Heaven .....  | 319 |
| i. Why Does the Formula, 'Kingdom of Heaven' Figure in the Systemic Comparison of Category-Formations? .....               | 319 |
| ii. What does 'Kingdom of Heaven' look like when it is systemically generative—active and integral? .....                  | 321 |
| iii. How is the Kingdom of Heaven Defined? .....   | 324 |
| iv. The Kingdom of Heaven in Halakhic Formulation .....  | 326 |
| v. The Kingdom of Heaven in Aggadic Exposition .....   | 334 |
| vi. Generative Versus Inert Category-Formations: The Case at Hand .....  | 344 |
| a. Does the Category Kingdom of Heaven Describe Most of the Data, Halakhic and Aggadic that Relate to God's Dominion ..... | 344 |
| b. Does the Category Kingdom of Heaven Yield a Theory of the Future, possessing Predictive Quality? ...                    | 345 |
| c. Does the Category Kingdom of Heaven Yield Norms of Public Policy? .....   | 345 |
| vii. What Indicates the Inert, as against the Generative, Category-formation? .....  | 346 |

## II. Primary versus Subordinate Category-Formations

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 10. Primary Category-Formations: Israel/Gentiles .....  | 351 |
| i. The Systemic Primacy of Israel/Gentiles .....  | 351 |
| ii. Species of a Common Genus? .....  | 354 |
| iii. Israel .....   | 359 |
| iv. The Gentiles .....  | 364 |
| v. Primary Versus Subordinate Category-Formations: The<br>Case at Hand .....  | 375 |
| a. Does the Category Israel/Gentiles Describe Most of<br>the Relevant Data? .....   | 375 |
| b. Does the Category Israel/Gentiles Yield a Theory of<br>the Future, possessing Predictive Quality? .....  | 376 |
| c. Does the Category Israel/Gentiles Yield Norms of<br>Public Policy? .....   | 376 |
| 11. The Messiah-Theme: Its Diverse Roles in the Eschatological<br>Narrative of the Resurrection of the Individual Israelite and<br>the Advent of the world to Come for Corporate Israel ..... | 377 |
| i. The Subordinate Situation of the Messiah-Theme in the<br>Aggadic Eschatology .....   | 377 |
| ii. The Messiah and the Resurrection of the Dead .....  | 380 |
| iii. The Sage-Messiah .....   | 390 |
| iv. The Messiah and the World to Come .....   | 397 |
| v. Primary Versus Subordinate Category-Formations: The<br>Messiah-Theme .....   | 401 |
| a. Does the Category, the Messiah-Theme, Describe<br>Most of the Relevant Data? .....   | 402 |
| b. Does the Category, the Messiah-Theme, Yield a<br>Theory of the Future, possessing Predictive Quality? ...  | 402 |
| c. Does the Category, the Messiah-Theme, Yield Norms<br>of Public Policy? .....   | 403 |
| vi. Conclusion .....  | 403 |
| Appendix: Systems and their Contents: Canon and<br>Category-Formation .....   | 405 |
| i. Category Formation and the Canon. A Preliminary<br>Statement .....   | 406 |
| ii. Challenges to the Canonical Principle of<br>Category-Formation .....  | 409 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| iii. Describing a System Whole: The Canonical Principle in<br>Category-Formation ..... | 411 |
| iv. Comparing Wholes: The Centrality of Redaction .....                                | 414 |
| v. The Argument of <i>The Integrity of Leviticus Rabbah</i> .....                      | 415 |
| vi. The Integrity of a Document in the Canon of Judaism ....                           | 421 |
| vii. From 'Judaism' to <i>Torah</i> .....  | 422 |