

# Redefining Judaism in an Age of Emancipation

Comparative Perspectives on  
Samuel Holdheim (1806–1860)

*Edited by*  
Christian Wiese



BRILL  
LEIDEN • BOSTON  
2007

## CONTENTS

|                              |      |
|------------------------------|------|
| Abbreviations.....           | ix   |
| Contributors .....           | xi   |
| Introduction                 |      |
| <i>Christian Wiese</i> ..... | xvii |

### PART I

#### REFORMER, SCHOLAR, POLITICAL THINKER

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| “Most of My Brethren Find me Unacceptable”:<br>The Controversial Career of Rabbi Samuel Holdheim<br><i>Michael A. Meyer</i> ..... | 3   |
| From Nationality to Religion: Samuel Holdheim’s Path to the<br>Extreme Side of Religious Reform<br><i>Andreas Gotzmann</i> .....  | 23  |
| The Politics of Religion in the Thought of Samuel Holdheim<br><i>Ken Koltun-Fromm</i> .....                                       | 63  |
| Holdheims Years in Schwerin: The Rabbi as an Ecclesiastical<br>Councilor<br><i>Carsten Wilke</i> .....                            | 80  |
| Holdheim’s Attitude towards Karaism as Expounded in<br>“Ma’amar Ha-Ishut”<br><i>Katrien de Graef</i> .....                        | 109 |

## PART II

HOLDHEIM IN THE CONTEXT OF THE REFORM  
CONTROVERSIES

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Samuel Holdheim and the German Circumcision Debates,<br>1843–1876<br><i>Robin E. Judd</i> .....  | 127 |
| Samuel Holdheim and the Prayerbook Reform in Germany<br><i>Klaus Herrmann</i> .....  | 143 |
| The Problems of Moderate Reform: The History of the<br>Berlin Liturgical Reforms, 1844–1862<br><i>Margit Schad</i> .....   | 169 |
| Samuel Holdheim and Zacharias Frankel on the Legal<br>Character of Jewish Marriage: An Overlooked Debate<br>in Nineteenth-Century Liberal Judaism<br><i>David Ellenson</i> ..... | 191 |

## PART III

## RADICAL REFORM IN COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Samuel Holdheim and Zacharias Frankel:<br>Comparative Perspectives<br><i>Andreas Brämer</i> .....  | 209 |
| Holdheim and Zunz: From the Question of Rabbinical<br>Authority to a New Definition of the Ceremonial Laws<br><i>Céline Trautmann-Waller</i> ..... | 228 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Samuel Holdheim and Sigismund Stern: The Clash<br>between the Dogmatic and Historicist Approach in<br>Classical German Reform<br><i>Ralph Bisschops</i> .....                             | 241 |
| True Mosaic Religion: Samuel Hirsch, Samuel Holdheim,<br>and the Reform of Judaism<br><i>Judith Frishman</i> .....  | 278 |
| Samuel Holdheim's "Most Powerful Comrade in Conviction":<br>David Einhorn and the Debate Concerning Jewish<br>Universalism in the Radical Reform Movement<br><i>Christian Wiese</i> ..... | 306 |
| Bibliography .....  | 375 |
| Index .....   | 411 |