

ANALYSIS AND ARGUMENTATION IN RABBINIC JUDAISM

Jacob Neusner

BARD COLLEGE

Studies in Judaism

**University Press of America,® Inc.
Lanham • New York • Oxford**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	xi
INTRODUCTION	xiv

PART ONE

A PRELIMINARY PROBE: TYPES OF ANALYSIS IN TRACTATE MOED QATAN

1. MOED QATAN, CHAPTER ONE	3
i. Mishnah	3
ii. Tosefta	6
iii. Yerushalmi	8
iv. Bavli	12
v. Types of Analysis. An Initial Proposal	19
2. MOED QATAN, CHAPTER TWO	21
i. Language-Analysis: The close reading of the language of the rule, yielding insight based on the wording	21
ii. Category-Criticism: Taxonomic inquiry into category-formations of the law and the comparison and contrast thereof	23
iii. Rationality: The reason behind the rule, yielding the possibility of transcending the limits of the case	26
iv. Analogy-Criticism: Finding the correct analogy for the identification of the governing rule	26
v. Types of Analysis	26

PART TWO

A SECONDARY PROBE: TYPES OF ANALYSIS IN SELECT TRACTATES: QIDDUSHIN, ABODAH ZARAH

3. QIDDUSHIN	33
i. Language-Analysis	33
a. Mishnah	33
b. Tosefta	33

c.	Yerushalmi	33
d.	Bavli	33
ii.	Category-Criticism	40
a.	Mishnah	40
b.	Tosefta	40
c.	Yerushalmi	40
d.	Bavli	43
iii.	Rationality	43
a.	Mishnah	43
b.	Tosefta	43
c.	Yerushalmi	43
d.	Bavli	43
iv.	Analogy-Criticism	43
a.	Mishnah	43
b.	Tosefta	43
c.	Yerushalmi	43
d.	Bavli	45
v.	Scriptural Foundations of the Halakhah	47
a.	Mishnah	47
b.	Tosefta	47
c.	Yerushalmi	47
d.	Bavli	51
vi.	Types of Analysis	56
4.	ABODAH ZARAH	57
i.	Language-Analysis	57
a.	Mishnah	57
b.	Tosefta	57
c.	Yerushalmi	57
d.	Bavli	57
ii.	Category-Criticism	57
a.	Mishnah	57
b.	Tosefta	57
c.	Yerushalmi	57
d.	Bavli	57
iii.	Rationality	57
a.	Mishnah	57
b.	Tosefta	58
c.	Yerushalmi	58
d.	Bavli	59
iv.	Analogy-Criticism	62

a.	Mishnah	62
b.	Tosefta	63
c.	Yerushalmi	63
d.	Bavli	63
v.	Scriptural Foundations of the Halakhah	63
a.	Mishnah	63
b.	Tosefta	63
c.	Yerushalmi	63
d.	Bavli	64
vi.	Types of Analysis	66

PART THREE

TYPES OF ANALYSIS IN SELECTED MIDRASH COMPILATIONS

5.	GENESIS RABBAH	69
i.	Language-Analysis	70
ii.	Analogy- and Category-Criticism	71
iii.	Rationality	76
iv.	Scriptural Foundations of the Halakhah	87
v.	The Types of Analysis in Genesis Rabbah	91
6.	LEVITICUS RABBAH	93
i.	Language-Analysis	94
ii.	Analogy- and Category-Criticism	97
iii.	Rationality	101
iv.	Scriptural Foundations of the Halakhah	105
v.	The Types of Analysis in Leviticus Rabbah	108
7.	SIFRÉ TO NUMBERS	111
i.	The Priority of Scripture over Analogical-Contrastive Reasoning	111
ii.	Language-Analysis	114
iii.	Analogy- and Category-Criticism	119
iv.	Rationality	127
v.	Scriptural Foundations of the Halakhah	129
vi.	The Types of Analysis in Sifré to Numbers	135

vii. Conclusion: Types of Analysis of Rabbinic Judaism, Halakhic and Aggadic	136
--	-----

PART FOUR

A PRELIMINARY PROBE: TYPES OF ARGUMENTATION IN TRACTATE MOED QATAN

8. MOED QATAN CHAPTER ONE	141
i. Mishnah	144
ii. Tosefta	144
iii. Yerushalmi	146
iv. Bavli	147
v. The Types of Argumentation	150
9. MOED QATAN CHAPTER TWO	153
i. Arguments Based on Tradition and Reason	153
ii. Arguments Executed through Exegesis of Scripture	155
iii. The Types of Argumentation	155

PART FIVE

A SECONDARY PROBE: TYPES OF ARGUMENTATION IN SELECT TRACTATES: QIDDUSHIN, ABODAH ZARAH

10. QIDDUSHIN	159
i. Arguments Based on Tradition and Reason	159
a. Mishnah	159
b. Tosefta	159
c. Yerushalmi	159
d. Bavli	159
ii. Arguments Executed through Exegesis of Scripture	165
a. Mishnah	165
b. Tosefta	165
c. Yerushalmi	165
d. Bavli	166
iii. Arguments Concerning the Governing Analogy	168
a. Mishnah	168

b.	Tosefta	168
c.	Yerushalmi	168
d.	Bavli	168
iv.	The Types of Argumentation	168
11.	ABODAH ZARAH	169
i.	Arguments Based on Tradition and Reason	169
a.	Mishnah	169
b.	Tosefta	170
c.	Yerushalmi	171
d.	Bavli	171
ii.	Arguments Executed through Exegesis of Scripture	173
a.	Mishnah	173
b.	Tosefta	174
c.	Yerushalmi	175
d.	Bavli	176
iii.	Arguments Concerning the Governing Analogy	176
a.	Mishnah	176
b.	Tosefta	176
c.	Yerushalmi	176
d.	Bavli	176
iv.	The Types of Argumentation	176
12.	DIALECTICAL VERSUS NON-DIALECTICAL ARGUMENTS	177
i.	A Simple Typology of Argumentation: Dialectical versus Non-Dialectical Arguments	177
ii.	Defining the Dialectical Argument and Two Instances of a Non-Dialectical Argument	178
iii.	An Example of a Dialectical Argument	184
iv.	A Contrasting Example of an Argument of an Other-than-Dialectical Character	190
v.	The Importance of the Dialectical Argument in the Halakhic Literature	202
vi.	The Law behind the Laws	205
vii.	The Unity of the Law	208
viii.	Dialectics and the Intellectual Dynamics of the Halakhic Literature	212

PART SIX

TYPES OF ARGUMENT, AUTHENTIC AND INAUTHENTIC, IN MIDRASH-COMPILATIONS

13.	GENESIS RABBAH	217
	i. Dialectical Arguments	217
	ii. Non-Dialectical Arguments	217
	iii. Types of Argumentation in Genesis Rabbah	225
14.	LEVITICUS RABBAH	227
	i. Dialectical Arguments	227
	ii. Non-Dialectical Arguments	227
	iii. Types of Argumentation in Leviticus Rabbah	235
15.	SIFRÉ TO NUMBERS	237
	i. Dialectical Arguments	237
	ii. Non-Dialectical Arguments	237
	iii. Types of Argumentation in Sifré to Numbers	259
	iv. Conclusion: Types of Argumentation of Rabbinic Judaism: Halakhic and Aggadic	262