

The Killing of Death
Denying the genocide against the Tutsi
Roland Moerland



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	vii
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xv
<i>Table of figures</i>	xvii
INTRODUCTION	1
Chapter 1	
Setting the scene	3
1.1. Introduction.....	3
1.2. 'I am not one of those who deny the genocide of the Tutsis.'.....	4
1.3. Beyond the stereotypical.....	8
1.4. A problematic issue?.....	10
1.4.1. Understudied.....	11
1.4.2. Harmful.....	13
1.4.3. Linguistic community.....	14
1.4.4. Global impact.....	15
1.4.5. Underestimated.....	15
1.4.6. Implausibility of genocide.....	16
1.4.7. Theoretical grounding.....	18
1.5. Criminology's neglect of genocide and its denial.....	20
1.5.1. Supranational criminology.....	21
1.5.2. Challenges.....	22
1.6. Outline of study, research questions and sensitising frameworks.....	24
Part I. Exploration.....	24
Chapter 2. Genocide and denial.....	25
Chapter 3. Genocide denialism.....	26
Part II. Inspection.....	26
Chapter 4. Official denial of the genocide against the Tutsi.....	27
Chapter 5. Recycling official denial.....	27
Part III. Reflection.....	29
Chapter 6. Broader implications.....	29
Chapter 7. A look in the mirror.....	30
Sensitising frameworks.....	32
1.7. Data collection.....	34
1.7.1. From exploration to inspection.....	34
1.7.2. Interviews.....	35
Interpreters.....	36
Interview protocol.....	37

1.7.3.	Observations	38
1.7.4.	Mining the internet	39
1.7.5.	Relevance of the data	39
1.8.	Some last notes on the scope of the study	40
PART I. EXPLORATION.....		43
Chapter 2		
Genocide and denial		45
2.1.	Introduction.....	45
2.2.	Genocide	45
2.3.	Dimensions of genocide	49
2.3.1.	Annihilation	49
2.3.2.	A people.....	53
2.3.3.	Action.....	56
2.3.4.	Agents.....	59
2.3.5.	Intention.....	61
	Intention vs. motivation.....	63
2.3.6.	Genocide ideology	64
2.4.	Explaining genocide, introducing denial	65
2.4.1.	A complex process.....	65
2.4.2.	100 days?	67
2.4.3.	The last stage?.....	70
2.5.	Denial.....	71
2.6.	Dimensions of denial.....	74
2.6.1.	Defence.....	75
2.6.2.	Paradox of denial	77
2.6.3.	Normal	79
2.6.4.	Interpersonal	81
2.6.5.	Adaptive.....	87
2.7.	The object of denial	91
2.8.	Concluding remarks	94
Chapter 3		
Genocide denialism		97
3.1.	Introduction.....	97
3.2.	Denial, an act of genocide?	98
3.2.1.	Charny's classification of denials of known genocides	100
3.2.2.	The original crime	102
3.3.	Genocide denialism	104
3.3.1.	Denial of genocide and genocide denial.....	105
	Denial of genocide	106
	Genocide denial	107

3.3.2.	“Denial” in effect and denial-related consequences	110
	“Denial” in effect	111
	Denial related consequences	113
3.3.3.	Innocent denial?	114
3.4.	Meaning in motion and the performativity of language	115
3.5.	Speech act theory and genocide denial as social action	118
3.5.1.	Denying in “effect” – Perlocutionary acts	120
3.5.2.	Doing genocide denial – Illocutionary acts	121
3.5.3.	The power of convention	124
3.5.4.	Rationalising genocide	126
3.5.5.	Excuses and justifications	129
3.6.	Concluding remarks	132
PART II.	INSPECTION	135
Chapter 4		
Official denial of the genocide against the Tutsi		137
4.1.	Introduction	137
4.2.	Agents of genocide denial	138
4.2.1.	The Rwandan Interim Government – <i>Le peuple rwandais accuse</i>	138
4.2.2.	Rassemblement pour le Retour des Réfugiés et la Démocratie au Rwanda – <i>La vérité sur le drame rwandais</i>	141
4.2.3.	The Rwandan Armed Forces – The search for the truth on the Rwandan tragedy	144
4.3.	A discourse theoretical approach	147
4.3.1.	Reality?	148
4.3.2.	Discourse, struggle and hegemony	150
4.3.3.	Articulation, elements, moments and nodal points	151
4.4.	The discursive construction of official genocide denial – The Rwandan Tragedy	153
4.4.1.	Lack of understanding	155
4.4.2.	Misleading media campaign	158
4.4.3.	Age-long interethnic conflict	160
4.4.4.	Contra-revolutionary and anti-democratic warfare	161
4.4.5.	Interethnic massacres	164
4.4.6.	Genocide against the Hutu	167
	Numbers game	170
4.4.7.	International ramifications	171
	Uganda	172
	Belgium	172
	United States	173
	United Nations Assistance Mission to Rwanda	173
4.4.8.	Equitable justice	175
	The ultimate Orwellian Inversion	178

4.5. Discursive developments	179
4.6. Concluding remarks	183
Chapter 5	
Recycling official denial	187
5.1. Introduction	187
5.2. Agents of recycling	189
5.2.1. Edward S. Herman and David Peterson: The politics of genocide	189
5.2.2. Keith Harmon Snow: The political economy of genocide	191
5.3. The discursive construction of recycling	194
5.3.1. Misunderstandings and propaganda	195
5.3.2. Apologists and purveyors of the inversion of truth	197
5.3.3. Bursts of violence against the Tutsi and genocide against the Hutu	200
5.3.4. Serving Western and US interests	202
5.3.5. Victor's justice	204
5.4. Recycling official genocide denial ...	205
5.5. Secondary or primary genocide denial?	207
Genocidal intent	210
5.6. Genocide denial: Violence?	212
5.6.1. Facilitating violence	213
Defining violence	215
5.6.2. Constituting violence	216
5.6.3. The power to enact linguistic violence	220
5.6.4. The violence of genocide denial	222
5.7. Concluding remarks	225
PART III. REFLECTION	231
Chapter 6	
Broader implications	233
6.1. Introduction	233
6.2. Academic engagement	234
6.2.1. Endorsing genocide denial	234
6.2.2. Selective and mendacious use?	236
6.2.3. Academic rigor	237
6.2.4. Problematic language	241
6.2.5. The other side of the story	244
6.3. Criminal defence	251
6.3.1. Defending the Hutu cause	251
6.3.2. Defending the anti-imperialist cause	253
6.3.3. Military I	257
6.3.4. Proving survival	261
6.4. Governmentality	265

6.4.1.	Genocide deniers must be countered at every turn	265
6.4.2.	Criminalising denial	267
6.4.3.	Critique and reform	271
6.4.4.	The perils of criminalisation	275
	Proportional?.....	275
	Does it work?.....	276
	Legality?	277
	Genocide?	278
6.4.5.	Political use	280
6.4.6.	History	283
	Accusing human rights defenders	286
	Acknowledgment?	287
6.5.	Defending human rights	289
6.5.1.	The power of horror.....	289
6.5.2.	Slander	291
6.5.3.	Marginalisation.....	293
6.6.	Concluding remarks	296
Chapter 7		
A look in the mirror		301
7.1.	Introduction.....	301
7.2.	Genocide studies	302
7.2.1.	Too narrow?.....	303
7.2.2.	Too broad?	305
7.3.	Criminological studies	309
7.3.1.	Leviathan's faithful servant	309
7.3.2.	A discipline in denial?	311
7.3.3.	Unintended, but problematic	312
	Institutionalised child abuse	313
	Low self-control	313
	Catalyst to genocide	315
	My early "critical" analysis	317
7.4.	A favourable scientific climate	319
7.4.1.	Scientific revisionism.....	320
7.4.2.	Modernism and post-modernism.....	322
7.5.	A criminological nightmare?.....	325
7.5.1.	Destruction or deconstruction?	325
7.5.2.	Resistance: counter discourse and taking sides	327
7.5.3.	A fundamental paradox?.....	330
	Positioning – Relativism or realism?	332
7.6.	Safeguarding reality	334
7.6.1.	Criminalisation?.....	334
7.6.2.	Toleration?.....	336
7.6.3.	Unmasking.....	337
7.6.4.	Strategic issues	337
7.7.	Concluding remarks	338

Chronological overview of significant interviews, consultations and events . . . 341
Selected bibliography 347
Curriculum vitae 385