

Elmar Widder

A Fair Trial at the International Criminal Court? Human Rights Standards and Legitimacy

**Procedural Fairness in the Context of Disclosure of Evidence and
the Right to Have Witnesses Examined**

Contents

| | |
|---|------|
| Figures | XV |
| Abbreviations | XVII |
| Table of Cases | XIX |
| Chapter 1: Introduction | 1 |
| 1. The object of this thesis and its research questions | 2 |
| 2. Fairness, justice and legitimacy | 8 |
| 3. Origins and fundamental treaties of the right to a fair trial | 11 |
| 4. International criminal procedure—looking ahead | 19 |
| 5. Methodology | 26 |
| 5.1 The object of the investigation | 27 |
| 5.2 Original contribution and formulating a hypothesis | 27 |
| 5.3 Legal theory and the usage of data | 29 |
| 5.3.1 Legal theory | 29 |
| 5.3.2 Usage of data | 30 |
| Chapter 2: The European Court of Human Rights | 33 |
| 1. Locating the obligation to disclose evidence | 33 |
| 1.1 The right to a fair trial—Article 6 of the ECHR | 33 |
| 1.2 Equality of arms | 36 |
| 1.3 Right to adversarial proceedings | 41 |

| | | |
|-----|---|----|
| 2. | Disclosure of evidence at pre-trial stage..... | 43 |
| 2.1 | Equality of arms and adversarial proceedings under Article 5 (4)..... | 44 |
| 2.2 | The presence of the charged at pre-trial level..... | 46 |
| 2.3 | Access to documents..... | 47 |
| 2.3 | Evaluation..... | 53 |
| 3. | Disclosure and non-disclosure of evidence at trial stage..... | 54 |
| 3.1 | Reasons for limitation—leading judgments..... | 54 |
| 3.2 | The general concept behind the ECtHR's decisions at trial stage..... | 59 |
| 3.3 | Critical evaluation of <i>ex parte</i> hearings..... | 61 |
| 3.4 | Aspects of timing and disclosure..... | 62 |
| 4. | Confrontation and the right to call defence witnesses..... | 66 |
| 4.1 | Background information..... | 68 |
| 4.2 | The necessity to restrict the right to confrontation—good reason for non-attendance..... | 70 |
| 4.3 | Counterbalancing measures before the case of Al-Khawaja and Tahery [GC]..... | 72 |
| 4.4 | The 'classical' sole or decisive rule..... | 74 |
| 4.5 | Al-Khawaja and Tahery [GC]—the post Al-Khawaja approach..... | 76 |
| 4.6 | Discussion..... | 79 |
| 4.7 | Interim results..... | 82 |

Chapter 3: The UN Human Rights Committee, the Inter-American Court of HR and the African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights.....85

| | | |
|-----|--|----|
| 1. | Observations of the HRC and Article 14 of the ICCPR..... | 85 |
| 1.1 | Disclosure of evidence..... | 86 |
| 1.2 | Confrontation and the right to call defence witnesses..... | 92 |
| 1.3 | Discussion..... | 96 |
| 2. | The Inter-American Court of Human Rights..... | 97 |
| 2.1 | The right to a fair trial—Article 8 ACHR..... | 98 |

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| 2.2 | Disclosure of evidence at pre-trial and trial stage..... | 102 |
| 2.3 | Confrontation and the right to call defence witnesses | 106 |
| 2.4 | Evaluation..... | 108 |
| 3. | The African Court on Human and People's Rights—AfCtHPR..... | 108 |
| 3.1 | The right to a fair trial—Article 7 of the Banjul Charter..... | 110 |
| 3.2 | Disclosure of evidence at pre-trial and trial stage..... | 112 |
| 3.3 | Confrontation and the right to call defence witnesses | 115 |
| 3.4 | Discussion..... | 117 |

Chapter 4: Fair trial guarantees at the two

| | | |
|-----|--|------------|
| | UN <i>ad hoc</i> tribunals..... | 123 |
| 1. | Introduction | 123 |
| 1.1 | Equality of arms | 124 |
| 1.2 | The practical application of equality of arms at the early stages | 130 |
| 1.3 | An authoritative test of proportionality? The ECtHR and the ICTY | 132 |
| 1.4 | Procedural implications..... | 134 |
| 2. | Disclosure obligations and their relationship to fairness..... | 138 |
| 3. | Confrontation and the right to call defence witnesses..... | 147 |
| 4. | Analysis | 154 |

Chapter 5: The International Criminal Court.....157

| | | |
|-------|---|-----|
| 1. | Prosecution disclosure in the light of the fair trial..... | 158 |
| 1.1 | General rights and disclosure at pre-confirmation stage— an overview | 159 |
| 1.1.1 | Bulk rule v. totality rule..... | 164 |
| 1.1.2 | Time frame and format of the Prosecutor's disclosure obligations | 168 |
| 1.1.3 | Comparison of terminology | 171 |

| | | |
|---|---|------------|
| 1.2 | Disclosure at trial stage, restrictions and <i>ex parte</i> hearings..... | 175 |
| 1.2.1 | Aspects of timing and presentation of the inculpatory evidence..... | 175 |
| 1.2.2 | Restrictions of disclosure and <i>ex parte</i> hearings..... | 178 |
| 2. | The right to have witnesses examined | 182 |
| 3. | Synopsis and formal assessment of the first part of the hypothesis | 193 |
| 4. | Fairness, disclosure and investigative procedures..... | 196 |
| 4.1 | Developing an assumption of fairness..... | 196 |
| 4.2 | Open questions to the Rome Statute | 205 |
| Chapter 6: Parameters of Procedure..... | | 211 |
| 1. | Legitimacy and court procedure..... | 213 |
| 1.1 | Parameters of legitimacy..... | 213 |
| 1.2 | Legitimate procedure | 218 |
| 2. | Conclusion | 221 |
| Chapter 7: The court procedure at the ECCC | | 223 |
| 1. | The ECCC's different model in comparison to the ICC..... | 224 |
| 2. | The Cambodian model—an alternative?..... | 228 |
| 3. | The Investigation Oversight Office..... | 230 |
| Chapter 8: Conclusion | | 235 |
| Bibliography..... | | 239 |