

# LANGUAGE, ACTION, AND CONTEXT

THE EARLY HISTORY OF PRAGMATICS  
IN EUROPE AND AMERICA, 1780–1930

BRIGITTE NERLICH

DAVID D. CLARKE

*University of Nottingham*

JOHN BENJAMINS PUBLISHING COMPANY  
AMSTERDAM/PHILADELPHIA

# Contents

Acknowledgements xiii

## 0 Introduction I

- 0.1 Is there a history of pragmatics? I
- 0.2 Why should there be a history of pragmatics? 2
- 0.3 What is pragmatics? 3
  - 0.3.1 Pragmatics, pragmatism and speech act theory 4
- 0.4 How do we trace the history of pragmatic ideas? 6
- 0.5 The scope and limits of this book 8
- 0.6 Sources for pragmatic insights in the 19th and 20th century 9
- 0.7 Survey of the history of pragmatics 12

## 1 Prologue to protopragmatics: Locke's semiotic philosophy 14

- 1.1 Introduction 15
- 1.2 Locke's philosophy of the semiotic act 17
- 1.3 Locke's influence in Europe and America 20
  - 1.3.1 A brief look at the history of semiotics 21
- 1.4 An afterword on Kant, Locke and metaphor 23

## 2 Protopragmatics in Germany: pragmatics as part of a Romantic philosophy of language 25

- 2.1 Introduction 25
- 2.2 Kant: language and reason 27
  - 2.2.1 Language as representation 27
  - 2.2.2 Schema, sign and symbol 28
  - 2.2.3 The influence of Kant's *Darstellungs*-theory of language and his theory of organism 30
- 2.3 Post-Kantian philosophies of language and communication 32
  - 2.3.1 1795 – at the origin of German pragmatics 32
  - 2.3.2 Fichte: an ideal theory of the origin of language 33
  - 2.3.3 Roth: representation and communication 36
  - 2.3.4 Vater: language and its pragmatic context 40
  - 2.3.5 Bernhardt: dialogical hermeneutics 42

- 2.3.6 Pragmatic elements in Humboldt's philosophy of language 51
- 2.3.7 Schleiermacher: language system and language use 57
- 3 Protopragmatics in France: pragmatics as part of an 'ideological' theory of language and thought 61**
  - 3.1 Introduction 61
  - 3.2 The roots: The general grammar of Port-Royal 63
    - 3.2.1 The parts of speech 64
    - 3.2.2 Affirmatio – act of mind and act of speech 65
    - 3.2.3 Conclusion and outlook 67
  - 3.3 Du Marsais: language and discourse 67
    - 3.3.1 Language and rhetoric 68
    - 3.3.2 Proposition and enunciation 69
    - 3.3.3 Pronouns 71
  - 3.4 The debate about word order 71
    - 3.4.1 Du Marsais and logical word order 71
    - 3.4.2 Condillac and the order of ideas 72
    - 3.4.3 Batteux and 'pragmatic' word order 74
  - 3.5 From acts of thought to acts of language 76
    - 3.5.1 Condillac on assertion 76
    - 3.5.2 The *Idéologues* 77
    - 3.5.3 The importance of the 'petits mots' in the act of speech 79
  - 3.6 Conclusion 83
- 4 A period of transition in the development of French pragmatics 85**
  - 4.1 Maine de Biran: language, the will and the self 85
  - 4.2 Eclectic spiritualism 86
  - 4.3 Garnier: speech acts and understanding 87
  - 4.4 Weil: word order in speech and language 90
- 5 Protopragmatics in England: pragmatics as part of a common-sense theory of the mind 94**
  - 5.1 The roots 95
    - 5.1.1 James Harris: general grammar and general categories of speech acts 95
    - 5.1.2 Berkeley: the pragmatic uses of speech 96
    - 5.1.3 Burke: pragmatic uses of speech, and rhetoric 98
    - 5.1.4 Hume: the promise and the obligation to keep it 99
    - 5.1.5 Hobbes: a pragmatic philosophy of language and society 100
  - 5.2 Reid: speech acts as social acts 103
    - 5.2.1 Life and work 103
    - 5.2.2 Reid's influence 105

- 5.2.3 Language and signs 106
- 5.2.4 Speech acts 109
- 6 A period of transition in the development of English pragmatics 112**
  - 6.1 Stewart: language, system and use 112
  - 6.2 Smart: a contextualist theory of language 114
- 7 Pragmatism and behaviourism in America 118**
  - 7.1 Introduction 118
  - 7.2 Pragmatism: use and truth 120
    - 7.2.1 What is pragmatism? 120
    - 7.2.2 James's moral and psychological pragmatism 121
    - 7.2.3 Dewey's instrumentalism 123
  - 7.3 Peirce's semiotics 125
    - 7.3.1 Semantics 127
    - 7.3.2 Pragmatics 128
  - 7.4 Mead: mind, self and the social act 130
    - 7.4.1 From gesture to symbol and self 132
  - 7.5 Morris: behaviourist pragmatics 134
    - 7.5.1 Morris and Carnap's conceptions of syntax, semantics and pragmatics 135
    - 7.5.2 Morris's behaviourist pragmatics 137
  - 7.6 De Laguna: pragmatic behaviourism 139
    - 7.6.1 The social function of language 140
  - 7.7 Pragmatism and pragmatics 143
  - 7.8 Whitney: the pragmatic evolution of language 146
  - 7.9 Conclusion 149
- 8 A Period of transition: realist and idealist approaches to language use 150**
  - 8.1 The roots: Kant's pragmatic anthropology 150
  - 8.2 Herbart: A practical approach to language and communication 151
    - 8.2.1 Herbart on language 152
  - 8.3 Madvig: a realistic theory of language, its use and origin 155
    - 8.3.1 Language, its use and evolution in communication and context 156
    - 8.3.2 Impact 159
  - 8.4 Steinthal: an idealist theory of language, its use and origin 160
    - 8.4.1 The origin of language 161
    - 8.4.2 Language and understanding 162
    - 8.4.3 Conclusion 164
  - 8.5 Lazarus: a theory of meaning and understanding 165

- 8.6 After Steintal and Lazarus: Preview 168
- 8.7 Gerber: thought acts, speech acts and context 169
- 8.8 Paul: thought, sense and sentences 171
  - 8.8.1 Thought and sentence 172
  - 8.8.2 Sentence-types 174
  - 8.8.3 Conclusion and outlook 176

## 9 Pragmatics *avant la lettre* in Germany: language as an instrument to influence others 177

- 9.1 Wegener: a pioneer in pragmatic theory 177
  - 9.1.1 Speaking and understanding 178
  - 9.1.2 Speech acts, direct, indirect and deep-structural 179
  - 9.1.3 Language as action and representation of action 181
- 9.2 After Wegener: the sentence and its communicative functions 183
  - 9.2.1 Brugmann: syntax and the 'functions of the soul' 183
  - 9.2.2 Kalepky: the sentence as communicative act 185
- 9.3 A new psychology: Brentano's act psychology 187
  - 9.3.1 Marty: a functional theory of language 190
- 9.4 Ries: the grammarians' revenge – form vs. function 199
  - 9.4.1 Linguistics and psychology 199
  - 9.4.2 Thought, language and reality 200
- 9.5 A new philosophy: Husserl's phenomenology and the signifying act 202
  - 9.5.1 Sense, reference and speech acts 202
  - 9.5.2 Phenomenology, perception, parole and pragmatics 204
  - 9.5.3 Husserl: intentionality, reference, and the objectifying act 206
  - 9.5.4 Daubert: the question of the question 208
  - 9.5.5 Reinach: speech acts as social acts 211
  - 9.5.6 Lipps: a hermeneutical logic of language and communication 215
- 9.6 Koschmieder: a case of 'coincidence' 220
  - 9.6.1 The discovery of performatives 221
  - 9.6.2 Impact 222
- 9.7 Bühler: an integrated theory of language as system and language in use 224
  - 9.7.1 Life and work 224
  - 9.7.2 The three functions of language 227
  - 9.7.3 The Organon model 231
  - 9.7.4 Action, act, work, and structure 233
  - 9.7.5 Symbol field and deictic field 234
  - 9.7.6 The pragmatic dimension of language 235
  - 9.7.7 Impact 237

## **10 Pragmatics *avant la lettre* in France (and beyond): a theory of the speaking subject 240**

- 10.1 A new psychology: Taine's naturalism and positivism 240
- 10.2 Bréal: language and the speaking subject 243
  - 10.2.1 A pragmatic and dialogical theory of language 243
  - 10.2.2 Against the 'descriptive fallacy' in school grammars 246
  - 10.2.3 Subjectivity in language 246
- 10.3 The individual and social psychology of speech and language 248
  - 10.3.1 Functionalism in psychology and linguistics 248
  - 10.3.2 Paulhan: a psychology of speech acts 250
  - 10.3.3 Tarde: a microsociological analysis of language and conversation 253
  - 10.3.4 A brief glance at Bergson 256
  - 10.4.4 Leroy: a doctor's view of language 257
  - 10.4.5 Delacroix: between realism and idealism 258
  - 10.4.6 Meyerson: thought, action and ritual 262
- 10.5 A sociology of ritual acts 263
  - 10.5.1 Durkheim: social facts and social obligations 263
  - 10.5.2 Sociology and comparative linguistics 265
  - 10.5.3 Mauss, the total social fact and the total speech act 265
- 10.6 Language and speech, functions and contexts 270
  - 10.6.1 Bally: a linguistics of *la parole* 270
  - 10.6.2 Sechehaye: *langue* and *parole* 276
- 10.7 Functional linguistics and a theory of enunciation 278
  - 10.6.1 Guillaume: the psychomechanism of language 279
  - 10.6.2 Jakobson: indexicality and the functions of language 280
  - 10.6.3 Benveniste: the theory of enunciation 286

## **11 Pragmatics *avant la lettre* in England: a theory of signs and contexts 294**

- 11.1 The birth of pragmatics in England under the name of 'significs' 295
  - 11.1.1 An overview 295
  - 11.1.2 Victoria Welby: a moralist pragmatist 298
  - 11.1.2 Stout's psychology of meaning and context 302
  - 11.1.3 Ogden and Richards' behaviourist and pragmatist theory of meaning 312
- 11.2 British Contextualism 316
  - 11.2.1 Malinowski's theory of meaning, magic and use 317
  - 11.2.2 Interlude on Malinowski, contextualism, functionalism, pragmatism, and behaviourism 324
  - 11.2.3 Malinowski continued 331
  - 11.2.4 Gardiner, the act of speech and the theory of language 335
  - 11.2.5 Firth: the spectrum of meaning 359
- 11.3 Austin: problems with statements 366

**12 Conclusion 374**

**Appendix 377**

**Notes 404**

**References**

Primary sources 433

Secondary sources 467

**Index 489**