THE PALESTINE PROBLEM IN INTERNATIONAL LAW AND WORLD ORDER

W. Thomas Mallison and Sally V. Mallison

W. Thomas Mallison is Professor of Law and Director of the International and Comparative Law Program at the George Washington University, Washington D.C., U.S.A.

Sally V. Mallison is Research Associate of the International and Comparative Law Program at the George Washington University, Washington D.C., U.S.A.



Contents

.

Intr Cha	face oduction apter 1. International Law Appraisal of the Balfour claration	xv 1 18
Intr	oduction	18
I.	Historical Background of the Central Zionist Objectives	19
II.	Public Law Sources and Criteria of the Present Chapter	22
III.	Analysis of the Negotiations Leading to the Declaration	24
	 A. Negotiating Objectives 1. British Objectives 2. Zionist Objectives 3. Jewish Objectives 	24
	 B. The Six Drafts and the Final Text 1. The Foreign Office Preliminary Draft 2. The Zionist Preliminary Draft 3. The Zionist Draft – July 18, 1917 4. The Balfour Draft 5. The Milner Draft 6. The Milner-Amery Draft 7. The Final Text 	31
IV.	Interpretation of the Meaning of the Declaration	47
	 A. The Favor Clause in Context 1. The Zionist Interpretation 2. The Juridical Interpretation 	48
	B. The Safeguard Clauses in Context	55

Page

٠

		 The First Safeguard: Palestinian Rights The Second Safeguard: Jewish Rights 	
	C.	The Declaration in "Plain Meaning" Inter- pretation	60
V.		Itilateral International Agreement to the four Declaration	62
	А. В.	The League of Nations Mandate for Palestine The Anglo-American Convention on Pales-	63 69
	C.	tine Customary International Law Agreement to the Declaration	69
VI.	Inte tion	ernational Law Limitations upon the Declara- n	71
	-	r 2. The Juridical Status and Political Activi- the Zionist Organization/Jewish Agency	79
I.	Th	e Basic Juridical Issues	79
II.		e Context of the "Jewish People" Claims and eir Continuing Implementation	79
III.	Th	e Subjects of International Law	87
IV.	as a the	e Claims to Constitute the Zionist Organization a Public Body from the First Zionist Congress to e Termination of the League of Nations Man- te for Palestine – 1897–1948	89
		The Early Claims to Constitute the Zionist Organization as a Public Body	89
	В.	The Zionist Organization at the Paris Peace Conference	91
	C.	The Zionist Organization as a Public Body Constituted by the Mandate for Palestine	91
	D.	Determination of Public Body Status by The Permanent Court of International Justice in the Mavrommatis Palestine Concession Cases	9 5
	E.	Implementation of the Public Body Status 1. Implementation Inside Palestine: the "Shadow Government"	98

	2. Implementation Outside Palestine: the International Public Body	
V.	The Claims to Continue the Public Body Status of the Zionist Organization from the Establishment of the State of Israel in 1948 to the Present	103
	A. The Continuation of Zionist Organization Public Body Functions	103
	 B. The Zionist Organization/Jewish Agency Status Law 1. Legislative history 2. Interpretation of the Statute a. Introductory Provisions b. The Purview Concerning Status 	106
	 C. The Covenant Between the Government of Israel and the Zionist Executive 1. Interpretation of the Covenant a. Immigration and Other Functions of the Executive b. Juridical Subordination of the Organization to the State a. Coordinating Record and Official Record 	117 117
	 c. Coordinating Board and Official Procedure 2. The Coordination Board as an Instrument for Implementation of "Jewish People" Immigration 	123
VI	 D. The Juridical Effects of the Claim to Continue the Public Body Status: the Creation of a Single Zionist-Israel Sovereignty The Zionist Organization/Jewish Agency under the 	126
	United States Foreign Agents Registration Act apter 3. The United Nations and The Palestine	135
	Partition Resolution	142
I.	The Development of International Law by the United Nations	1 42
	A. International Law-Making	142
	 B. The United Nations as an International Law- Maker 	
II.	The Palestine Partition Resolution 181 (II)	145 151

r

	Α.	 The Background of the Partition Resolution The General Assembly Special Session on Palestine The United Nations Special Committee on Palestine (UNSCOP) 	151
	B.	The Plan of Partition with Economic Union1. General Provisions2. Human Rights Provisions	159
		The Juridical Status of the Partition Resolution 1. Claims of Invalidity	166
	2.	Claims of Validity3. The Continuing Validity of the Partition Resolution	
Ch		r 4. The Fundamental Palestinian Rights in ernational Law	174
I.	The	e Individual Right of Return	174
	Α.	The Background of the Right of Return in Practice and Law	174
	В.	 General Assembly Resolutions Applying the Right of Return 1. Resolutions 194 (III) and 513 (VI) Concerning the 1947–1948 Refugees 2. Resolutions 2452 (XXIII), 2535 (XXIV) and 2963 (XXVII) Concerning the 1947–1948 and 1967 Refugees 3. Resolutions 3089 (XXVIII), 3236 (XXIX), and Subsequent Resolutions Concerning the Inalienable Right to Return to the Area of Palestine 	178
	C.	Security Council Resolutions	187
II.	Th	e National Rights of the People of Palestine	188
	Α.	The Recognition of the Palestinians as a People	189
•	B.	The Right of Self-Determination in Inter- national Law	192
	C.	The Application of the Right of Self-	

.

•

		Determination to the People of Palestine: General Assembly Resolutions 2649 (XXV), 2672C (XXV), 3089D (XXVIII), and 3236 (XXIX) and Subsequent Ones	197
	D.	The Geographical Area to Which Palestinian Self-Determination Applies	2 01
III.		e Rights and Obligations for Each of Two States Palestine	204
Ch	apte	r 5. The Juridical Status of Jerusalem	207
I.	Jer	usalem: Religion and Sovereignty	207
II.	The	e United Nations and Jerusalem	209
	Α.	General Assembly Resolutions	211
	В.	Security Council Resolutions	220
	C.	Basic Juridical Principles of the United Nations Concerning Jerusalem	228
III.	AS	Survey of Proposed Solutions for Jerusalem	229
	Α.	Israeli Domination of the Entire City	229
	B.	A Divided Arab–Israeli City	233
	C.	Internationalization	235
	D.	Partial Internationalization	237
	Ε.	Conclusion	238
Ch		er 6. A Juridical Analysis of the Israeli Settle- nts in the Occupied Territories	24 0
I.		e International Law Applicable in Occupied	240
II.		praisal of the Claims of the Government of ael Under the Criteria of International Law	244
	Α.	'Introduction to the Claims	244
	В.	The Zionist Ideological Claims Based upon Politico-Religious Grounds	250
	C.	The Claims that the Geneva Civilians Conven- tion Is Not Applicable in the Territories Occupied since June 1967	252

.

.

		1. The Claim Postulating the Necessity that	
		the "Legitimate Sovereign" Be Displaced	
		by the Occupant 2. The Claim of Title to Territory Based on	
		2. The Claim of Title to Territory Based on "Defensive Conquest"	
		3. The Claim of Unusual Circumstances: Sui Generis	
		4. The Claim that the Civilians Convention	
		Has Not Been Previously Applied	
		5. The Implicit Claim that the Civilians	
		Convention Is the Only Law on the Subject	
	D.	The Claim that Assumes the Applicability of	
		the Civilians Convention but Contends that	
		Its Specific Provision Concerning the Settle-	
		ments Has Not Been Violated	262
III.	The	e Objective of the Israeli Settlement Policy	268
IV.	Co	nclusions	272
Ch		r 7. The 1982 Israeli Attack on the Palestine eration Organization and Invasion of Leba-	
	nor	n: Appraisal Under International Law	276
Pul	blish	er's Note: Chapter 7	276
I.	The	e Factual Situation	277
	Α.	The Background: The Lebanese Internal Con-	
		flict	277
	В.	The International Conflict and the July 24,	
		1981 Cease-Fire	279
	C.	The Attack-Invasion	290
II.	Ag	gression and Self-Defense in the World Legal	
		der	291
	А.	The International Law Criteria	291
		1. The United Nations Charter Framework	
		2. The United Nations Definition of Aggres-	
		sion	
		 The Legal Requirements for Self-Defense Anticipatory Self-Defense 	
		T. AILICIPALULY JEII-DEIELISE	

	Β.	 Appraisal of Government of Israel Claims Under the Criteria of International Law Claims of the Government of Israel to Lawful Self-Defense The Requirement of Peaceful Procedures The Requirement of Actual Necessity for Responding Coercion a. Armed Attack b. Anticipated Armed Attack 	302
	4.	The Requirement of Proportionality in Responding Defensive Measures	
	C.	The Character of the Attack-Invasion Under the Juridical Criteria	316
III.	Pris	e Humanitarian Law for the Protection of soners of War, Wounded and Sick Combatants, I of Civilian Persons and Objects	323
		•	
		The Historical Development of the Law	323
	Β.	 The Geneva Prisoners of War Convention (1949) 1. The Legal Criteria for Combatants a. The Requirement of Organization b. The Requirement of "Belonging to a Party to the Conflict" c. The Requirement of Responsible Military Command d. The Requirement of a Fixed Distinctive Sign e. The Requirement of Open Arms f. The Requirement of Compliance with the Laws and Customs of War (1) Analysis of the Requirement (2) Situations Where Reprisals Are Applicable 	329
		 Application of the Law Concerning P.O.W.s to the Fact Situation in Lebanon a. Denial of P.O.W. Status b. Violation of the Required Standard of Treatment of P.O.W.s and Civi- lian Detainees 	

.

	C.	 The Geneva Conventions Concerning the Protection of Wounded and Sick Combatants and of Civilian Persons and Objects The Scope of Protection Under the Con- ventions Protection for Wounded and Sick Com- batants and Civilians and for Medical Personnel and Facilities Protection of Civilians and Their Property 	355
	D.	1. The Legal Criteria Concerning Weapons	376
		2. Application of the Criteria Concerning Weapons	3
	E.	The Crime of Genocide 1. The Elements of the Crime	387
	F.	2. The Application of the Law Grave Breaches of the Civilians Convention	400
Cha		er 8. The Solution of the Palestine Problem thin the World Legal Order	407
I.	Th	e Source of the Problem	407
II.		e Proposals to Solve the Problem and Achieve ace in Palestine	413
	Α.	Plans Advanced Outside of the United Nations	413
	B.	The Zionist–Israel Plan	415
	C.	The Two-State Solution of the World Com- munity Acting Through the United Nations	416
III.	W	e Urgent Necessity for Enforcement of the orld Legal Order through Implementation of e Two-State Solution	419
A	pei	ndices	425
1. 2. 3. 4.	Ba Cl	ne Basle Program (August 1897) Alfour Declaration – Facsimile (November 2, 1917) hart of Successive Drafts of the Balfour Declaratic ate of Israel – The Law of Return (1950)	

5. ⁻	State of Israel - World Zionist Organization-Jewish	
	Agency (Status) Law (1952)	431
6.	Covenant Between the Government of Israel and The	
	Zionist Executive (1952)	433
7.	Appendix to the Covenant Between the Government and	
	the Executive of the Jewish Agency 1	437
8.	30 Israel Laws 43	441
	Basic Law: Jerusalem, Capital of Israel (1980)	443
	Israel: Law on Golan Heights (1981)	444
	World Zionist Organization Master Plan for the Develop-	
	ment of Settlement in Judea and Samaria (1979-1983)	
	Relevant Parts of United Nations General Assembly	
	Resolutions:	4 46
		-
12.	Resolution 181 (29 November 1947) [in part]	459
13.	Resolution 2535B (10 December 1969)	461
14.	Resolution 2625 (24 October 1970) [in part]	462
15.	Resolution 3089D (7 December 1973)	464
16.	Resolution 3236 (22 November 1974)	466
	Resolution 3237 (22 November 1974)	467
18.	Resolution 35/169E (15 December 1980)	468
19.	Resolution ES-7/8 (19 August 1982)	470
20.	Resolution ES-7/9 (24 September 1982)	470
	Security Council Resolutions:	
	Resolution 242 (22 November 1967)	472
	Resolution 338 (15 October 1973)	473
23.	Resolution 465 (1 March 1980)	474
	Resolution 497 (12 December 1981)	476
	Resolution 508 (5 June 1982)	477
	Resolution 509 (6 June 1982)	478
27.	Spanish Draft Resolution (8 June 1982)	478
	Resolution 511 (18 June 1982)	479
29.	Resolution 512 (19 June 1982)	480
	Resolution 513 (4 July 1982)	48 1
	Resolution 515 (29 July 1982)	482
32.	Resolution 520 (17 September 1982)	482
33.	Resolution 521 (19 September 1982)	483
34.	Geneva Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prison-	

ers of War (12 August 1949): Article 4A

485

-

35. Geneva Convention Relative to the Protection of Civilian	
Persons in Time of War (12 August 1949): Articles 47 and	40.4
49 36. Common Articles 1 and 2 of the Four Geneva Conven-	486
tions of 1949 for the Protection of War Victims	487
37. 95 U.S. Statutes at Large 1526: Purposes for which	
military sales or leases by United States are authorized; report to Congress	487
38. 3 U.S. Treaties and Other International Agreements	107
4985: U.SIsrael Mutual Defense Assistance Agree-	
ments	489
39. Geneva Declaration on Palestine	492
40. Juridical Analysis of Security Council Resolution 242 of	
22 November 1967	495
Maps	
1. Palestine 1945: Land ownership	497
2. Palestine 1946: Distribution of Population	498
▲	
2. Palestine 1946: Distribution of Population	498
 Palestine 1946: Distribution of Population West Bank: Israeli Settlements (November 1982) Golan Heights: Israeli Settlements (March 1981) 	498 499
 Palestine 1946: Distribution of Population West Bank: Israeli Settlements (November 1982) Golan Heights: Israeli Settlements (March 1981) Gaza Strip: Israeli Settlements (September 1981) 	498 499 500
 Palestine 1946: Distribution of Population West Bank: Israeli Settlements (November 1982) Golan Heights: Israeli Settlements (March 1981) Gaza Strip: Israeli Settlements (September 1981) Jerusalem: Holy Places 	498 499 500 501
 Palestine 1946: Distribution of Population West Bank: Israeli Settlements (November 1982) Golan Heights: Israeli Settlements (March 1981) Gaza Strip: Israeli Settlements (September 1981) Jerusalem: Holy Places 	498 499 500 501 502
 Palestine 1946: Distribution of Population West Bank: Israeli Settlements (November 1982) Golan Heights: Israeli Settlements (March 1981) Gaza Strip: Israeli Settlements (September 1981) Jerusalem: Holy Places Jerusalem and Vicinity: Israeli Developed Areas 	498 499 500 501 502 503
 Palestine 1946: Distribution of Population West Bank: Israeli Settlements (November 1982) Golan Heights: Israeli Settlements (March 1981) Gaza Strip: Israeli Settlements (September 1981) Jerusalem: Holy Places Jerusalem and Vicinity: Israeli Developed Areas Palestine 1922–1947 Palestine 1948–1967 	498 499 500 501 502 503 504
 Palestine 1946: Distribution of Population West Bank: Israeli Settlements (November 1982) Golan Heights: Israeli Settlements (March 1981) Gaza Strip: Israeli Settlements (September 1981) Jerusalem: Holy Places Jerusalem and Vicinity: Israeli Developed Areas Palestine 1922–1947 Palestine 1948–1967 Index	498 499 500 501 502 503 504 505 506
 Palestine 1946: Distribution of Population West Bank: Israeli Settlements (November 1982) Golan Heights: Israeli Settlements (March 1981) Gaza Strip: Israeli Settlements (September 1981) Jerusalem: Holy Places Jerusalem and Vicinity: Israeli Developed Areas Palestine 1922–1947 Palestine 1948–1967 	498 499 500 501 502 503 504 505 506 558
 Palestine 1946: Distribution of Population West Bank: Israeli Settlements (November 1982) Golan Heights: Israeli Settlements (March 1981) Gaza Strip: Israeli Settlements (September 1981) Jerusalem: Holy Places Jerusalem and Vicinity: Israeli Developed Areas Palestine 1922–1947 Palestine 1948–1967 Index	498 499 500 501 502 503 504 505 506

. ~

•

• • . .

.