

To Understand a Cat

Methodology and philosophy

Sam S. Rakover

Haifa University

John Benjamins Publishing Company

Amsterdam / Philadelphia

Table of contents

Preface	IX
CHAPTER 1	
Scientification: Placing anecdotes and anthropomorphism under the umbrella of science as the first step	1
1.1 An ambush for a night moth	1
1.2 Some methodological thoughts: Anthropomorphism and anecdotes	5
1.2.1 Scientific observation and anecdotes	5
1.2.2 Scientific explanation and anthropomorphism	7
1.2.3 A methodological proposal: Equal hypotheses testing	13
1.2.4 Mechanistic explanations and mentalistic explanations	15
CHAPTER 2	
Anecdotes and the methodology of testing hypotheses	21
2.1 The living space of Max the cat	22
2.2 Pros and cons of observations of Max the cat	24
2.3 Construction and testing of hypotheses from anecdotes	29
2.4 Test of the hypothesis that Max ambushed the night moth for his amusement	33
2.5 Matching a mentalistic explanation to behavior: The Principle of New Application	36
CHAPTER 3	
Free will, consciousness, and explanation	43
3.1 The methodological status of indicators of private behavior	46
3.2 Indicators of free will in Max the cat	48
3.3 Discussion of indicators of free will	55
3.4 Indicators of free will, consciousness, and explanation	60
CHAPTER 4	
The structure of mentalistic theory and the reasons for its use	71
4.1 The structure of a theory	73
4.2 Why should one use a mentalistic explanation?	84

CHAPTER 5

Three-stage interpretation	93
5.1 Three-stage interpretation and the principle of new application	94
5.2 Comparison of the three-stage interpretation and other approaches to an explanation for complex behavior	103
5.3 Cannot Max's behavior, ultimately, be explained mechanistically, as simple learning?	105
5.3.1 Examples of behavioral episodes explained as simple learning processes	106
5.3.2 Are learning processes mechanistic or mentalistic?	107
5.3.3 An attempt to propose mechanistic explanations for mentalistic behavioral episodes	111
Pictures of Max the cat	116–122

CHAPTER 6

Multi-explanation theory	123
6.1 An explanation model, an empirical test, and a multi-explanation theory	123
6.2 Examples from Max's behavior and from psychology	129
6.3 Three methodological problems connected to the multi-explanation theory	133
6.3.1 The ad hoc explanation problem	134
6.3.2 The inconsistency problem	134
6.3.3 The incomparability problem	135
6.4 Guidelines for the solution of the three problems	136
6.4.1 How to determine a match between an explanation model and a given behavioral phenomenon	137
6.4.2 How should the explanatory units be organized?	143
6.4.3 Do the guidelines help solve the three problems: an ad hoc explanation, inconsistency, and incomparability of theories?	145
6.5 Multi-explanation theory, giving an explanation, and empirical test	146
6.5.1 Is the multi-explanation theory tested by use of the H-D method?	146
6.5.2 Is the explanation offered by the multi-explanation theory similar to the explanation offered in the natural sciences?	147

CHAPTER 7

Establishing multi-explanation theory (a): The mentalistic explanation scheme	153
7.1 A model, a mentalistic explanation scheme	154
7.1.1 A teleological explanation model and folk psychology	156
7.1.2 Teleological explanation and refutation	158
7.1.3 What is a suitable explanation scheme?	162
7.1.4 A mentalistic explanation model and scientific laws	164
7.2 A scheme of mentalistic explanation and other explanatory approaches	168
7.2.1 Intentional stance	168

7.2.2	Functional analysis and the status of empirical generalizations in psychology	171
7.2.2.1	Empirical generalization as supplying partial explanatory information	172
7.2.2.2	Transition from descriptive generalization to explanatory generalization	174
CHAPTER 8		
	Establishing multi-explanation theory (b): Methodological dualism	181
8.1	Mental causality	188
8.2	Functionalism and multiple realizability	191
8.3	The computer and the process of decomposition	195
8.4	Reduction	199
8.5	Multiple realizability and decomposition – methodological note	202
8.6	Consciousness	204
CHAPTER 9		
	Methodological dualism and multi-explanation theory in the broad philosophical context	213
9.1	Methodological dualism, Scientification, explanatory dualism, functionalism, and levels of explanation	213
9.2	Multi-explanation theory and other approaches to constructing theories	220
9.3	Multi-explanation theory, understanding, explanation, and emergent properties	226
9.3.1	Two kinds of explanation (scheme fitting, production mechanism) and the mosaic example	228
9.3.2	Emergent properties and the mosaic example	229
	References	233
	Subject index	247
	Name index	251