Chomskyan Linguistics and its Competitors

Pius ten Hacken

equinox
LONDON OAKVILLE

Contents

Introduction 1

1 Research programmes 5
1.1 The empirical cycle 6
1.2 The role of research programmes 11
1.2.1 Problems with the empirical cycle 11
1.2.2 Approaches to the problems of the empirical cycle 14
1.3 Truth, progress, and revolutions 19
1.3.1 Truth 19
1.3.2 Progress 22
1.3.3 Revolutions 24
1.4 Research programmes in linguistics 29
1.4.1 From natural science to linguistics 29
1.4.2 From paradigms to research programmes 34

2 The research programme of Chomskyan linguistics 39
2.1 The nature of individual languages 41
2.1.1 Competence versus performance 42
2.1.2 Grammatical versus pragmatic competence 46
2.1.3 I-language versus E-language 49
2.1.4 Conclusion 52
2.2 The nature of data 53
2.2.1 Grammaticality judgements 54
2.2.2 Corpus data 57
2.2.3 Psycholinguistic experiments 60
2.2.4 Conclusion 63
2.3 The function of grammars 65
2.3.1 Grammar and competence 66
2.3.2 Idealisations 70
2.3.3 The problem of indeterminacy 73
2.4 The role of language acquisition 75
2.4.1 Language acquisition versus use of language 75
2.4.2 Linguistic universals 81
2.4.3 Extension of the model 83
2.4.4 Additional idealisations 90

2.5 The unity of the research programme of Chomskyan linguistics from its emergence to the 1980s 94
2.5.1 From Standard Theory to Principles and Parameters 95
2.5.1.1 The treatment of a passive sentence in ST and P&P 96
2.5.1.2 Implications of the differences 99
2.5.2 The early stages of Chomskyan linguistics 103
2.5.3 Conclusion 105
2.6 The position of the Minimalist Program in Chomskyan linguistics 106
2.6.1 Continuity and its problems 108
2.6.2 Two additional questions about language 109
2.6.2.1 Linguistics and brain science 111
2.6.2.2 The evolutionary origin of language 114
2.6.3 Extension of the model 118
2.6.4 Perfection 122
2.6.5 Conclusion 123

3 The Chomskyan revolution 129
3.1 The research programme of Post-Bloomfieldian linguistics 130
3.1.1 The nature and boundaries of a language 133
3.1.1.1 Bloomfield's conception of language 133
3.1.1.2 Post-Bloomfieldian conceptions of language 136
3.1.2 The nature of the data 139
3.1.3 The status of a grammar 142
3.1.3.1 Classification and prediction 144
3.1.3.2 Reality of structure 145
3.1.4 Approaches to non-uniqueness 149
3.2 A comparison of the two research programmes 156
3.2.1 Continuities 156
3.2.2 Differences 160
3.2.2.1 Mentalism 160
3.2.2.2 Indeterminacy 164
3.2.3 Incommensurability 166
3.2.3.1 Expressions of puzzlement 167
3.2.3.2 Observational adequacy 169
3.2.3.3 Descriptive and explanatory adequacy 171
3.3 Has there been a Chomskyan revolution? 175

4 Some modern competitors 183
4.1 Lexical-Functional Grammar 184
4.1.1 The crisis: psychological reality 186
4.1.2 A new research programme 189
4.1.3 The 'Competence Hypothesis' in Chomskyan linguistics 196
4.1.4 Comparison of the models of LFG and Chomskyan linguistics 197
4.1.5 Interaction of LFG and Chomskyan linguistics 200
4.1.5.1 The interpretation of psycholinguistic data 200
4.1.5.2 Language acquisition 202
4.1.5.3 Some theoretical notions 205
4.1.6 Conclusion 208
4.2 Generalised Phrase Structure Grammar 209
4.2.1 The crisis: generative grammar 210
4.2.2 A new research programme 212
4.2.3 Comparison of the models of GPSG and Chomskyan linguistics 217
4.2.4 Theoretical discussions and incommensurability 218
4.2.4.1 *Wanna*-contraction 219
4.2.4.2 X-bar theory 223
4.2.5 Conclusion 229
4.3 Head-driven Phrase Structure Grammar 231
4.3.1 The crisis: a 'meta-crisis'? 231
4.3.2 A new research programme? 234
4.3.3 Comparison of the model of HPSG with other models 241
4.3.4 Interaction of HPSG with other frameworks 242
4.3.5 Conclusion 243
4.4 Jackendoff's linguistics 245
4.4.1 The crisis: integrating semantics 246
4.4.2 Architecture and research programme 249
4.4.2.1 Syntactocentrism versus parallel architecture 249
4.4.2.2 Jackendoff's presentation of the research programme of Chomskyan linguistics 251
4.4.2.3 Theory versus research programme 253
4.4.3 The debate on the evolution of language 258
4.4.3.1 Recursion 259
4.4.3.2 Adaptation 262
4.4.3.3 Evolution and architecture 264
4.4.4 Conclusion 266
4.5 Conclusion 267

5 Aspects of language development and use 273
5.1 The nature of named languages 274
5.1.1 Why English cannot exist 274
5.1.2 Why English is a problematic notion 276
5.1.3 English as a phenomenon 279
5.2 Empirical aspects of language acquisition 281
5.2.1 Language acquisition as parameter setting 282
5.2.2 Learning strategies 285
5.2.3 The critical period hypothesis 290
5.2.4 Maturation versus continuity 293
5.3 Second language acquisition 300
5.3.1 The difference between first and second language acquisition 301
5.3.2 The logical problem of second language acquisition 304
5.3.3 The critical period in second language acquisition 307
5.3.4 The initial state of second language acquisition 309
5.4 Language change 317
5.4.1 A history of I-languages 318
5.4.2 An example: change of word order 320
5.5 Language and communication 324
5.6 Conclusion 327

References 332

Author index 352

Subject index 358