# Israel Between Conflict and Accommodation:

## The Transformation of Collective Identities

*A Study of a Multi-Melting Pot Process*

Dissertation Thesis
Department of Peace and Development Research
Göteborg University
Autumn 1996
© Michael Schulz

This Dissertation is part of a research programme at the Department of Peace and Development Research, Göteborg University, called *Challenges to the Nation-state.* Within that research programme, the section on *Sub-national challenges to the nation-state* serves as a framework for this thesis.

# Table of Contents

**ABSTRACT**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS** ..... III

**GRAPHS, FIGURES, MAPS AND TABLES** ..... IX

**PREFACE** ..... XVII

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ..... XXIV

**LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS** ..... XXVIII

**ARABIC & HEBREW WORDS** ..... XXIX

ARABIC ..... XXIX
HEBREW ..... XXIX

**CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION** ..... 1

1.1. THESES OF THE STUDY ..... 7
*1.1.1. The Polarisation Thesis* ..... 8
1.1.1.1. The Arab Radicalisation Thesis ..... 9
1.1.1.2. The Jewish Intransigence Thesis ..... 11
1.1.1.3. The Jewish Polarisation Thesis ..... 12
*1.1.2. The Ethnicization Thesis* ..... 13
1.1.2.1. Ethnicization of the Jewish population ..... 13
1.1.2.2. The Arab Mobilisation Thesis ..... 16
*1.1.3. The Judaization Thesis* ..... 17
*1.1.4. The Israelization Thesis* ..... 19
1.2. THE RESEARCH PROJECT ..... 21
1.3. AIM/RESEARCH QUESTIONS ..... 22
*1.3.1. Specific Questions* ..... 23
1.4. THEORETICAL SETTING ..... 24
*1.4.1. Integration* ..... 24
*1.4.2. Amalgamation* ..... 25
*1.4.3. Acculturation* ..... 25
*1.4.4. Identification* ..... 26
*1.4.5. Analytical Scheme* ..... 26
1.5. DELIMITATIONS ..... 28
*1.5.1. Temporal delimitation* ..... 28
*1.5.2. Spatial delimitation* ..... 29
1.6. DEFINITIONS ..... 30
1.7. MATERIALS ..... 31

1.8. METHODOLOGY ..... 32
*1.8.1. Data Collecting* ..... 33
*1.8.2. Procedure* ..... 34
*1.8.3. The Survey* ..... 34
1.8.3.1. Measuring Instrument ..... 36
1.8.3.2. Arabs and Jews in the 1995 sample ..... 37
1.8.3.3. Ethnic categories of the Jewish and Arab samples ..... 39
1.8.3.3.1. Israeli Jews ..... 39
1.8.3.3.2. Israeli Arabs ..... 42
1.8.3.4. Fieldwork ..... 42
1.8.3.5. Evaluation ..... 43
1.8.3.5.1. Representativeness ..... 43
1.8.3.5.2. Reliability ..... 44
1.8.3.5.3. Validity ..... 44
1.9. DISPOSITION ..... 45

**CHAPTER 2. CONCEPTUAL CLARIFICATIONS ..... 48**

2.1. IDENTITY: ETHNIC AND NATIONAL BELONGINGS ..... 48
*2.1.1. Ethnic and National Identity* ..... 49
*2.1.2. The Human Need of Belonging* ..... 50
2.2. PERSPECTIVES ON ETHNICITY AND NATIONALISM ..... 54
*2.2.1. Ethnicity as a Social Phenomenon* ..... 58
2.2.1.1. Nations and Nationalism ..... 61
2.2.1.2. Ethnic Group Formation ..... 64
2.3. NEW APPROACHES IN THE STUDY OF NATIONAL/ETHNIC CONFLICTS ..... 66
2.4. WHY FOCUS ON INTEGRATION? ..... 69

**CHAPTER 3. APPROACHES TO THE STUDY OF ETHNICITY IN ISRAEL ..... 71**

3.1. ISRAELI SOCIETY AND ETHNIC RELATIONS ..... 73
*3.1.1. The Melting-pot* ..... 74
*3.1.2. The Class Approach* ..... 78
3.1.2.1. Oriental-Ashkenazi divisions of labour ..... 78
3.1.2.2. Internal Colonialism: Arab-Jewish relations ..... 81
3.1.2.3. Apartheid: Arab-Jewish relations ..... 82
*3.1.3. The Pluralist Approach* ..... 84
*3.1.4. Summary of Approaches* ..... 89
3.2. THE MULTI-MELTING POT APPROACH ..... 90

**CHAPTER 4. ETHNIC GROUPS IN ISRAEL ..... 98**

4.1. DEMOGRAPHIC CONSTITUTION OF ISRAEL ..... 100
*4.1.1. Ethnic Segmentation of Israel's Jews* ..... 104
*4.1.2. Ethnic/Religious Segmentation of Israeli non-Jews* ..... 108
*4.1.3. Official Leadership Attitudes towards Israeli citizens* ..... 112

**CHAPTER 5. ISRAELI STATE AND NATION BUILDING SINCE 1948** ..... 118

5.1. ISRAELI STATE BUILDING ..... 118
*5.1.1. The Jewish Nation-State Project* ..... 119
5.1.1.1. Zionism in the pre-State Period ..... 120
5.1.1.2. Secular Zionism in Israel ..... 124
5.1.1.3. Religious Zionism ..... 127
*5.1.2. The Israeli Nation-State Project* ..... 130
5.1.2.1. Post-Zionism ..... 131
*5.1.3. The Anti-State project* ..... 134

**CHAPTER 6. INTEGRATION** ..... 136

6.1. RESPONSIVENESS TO ETHNIC DEMANDS ..... 136
*6.1.1. Access* ..... 137
*6.1.2. Agenda* ..... 140
*6.1.3. Policy* ..... 143
6.1.3.1. Labour Party ..... 143
6.1.3.2. Meretz ..... 145
6.1.3.3. Democratic Arab Party ..... 146
6.1.3.4. Hadash ..... 147
6.1.3.5. Likud ..... 148
6.1.3.6. Moledet ..... 149
6.1.3.7. Shas ..... 150
6.1.3.8. Yahadut Hatorah Hame'uhedet ..... 150
6.1.3.9. Mafdal ..... 151
6.1.3.10 Tzomet ..... 151
*6.1.4. Output* ..... 152
*6.1.5. Impact* ..... 156
6.1.5.1. Ashkenazim ..... 156
6.1.5.2. Oriental/Sephardi Jews ..... 157
6.1.5.3. Israeli Arabs ..... 159
*6.1.6. Attitudes towards impact* ..... 162
6.1.6.1. Educational and cultural facilities ..... 162
6.1.6.2. Socio-economic differences among ethnic groups ..... 165
6.1.6.3. Due share in the state ..... 167
6.1.6.4. Identity and Politics ..... 171
6.2. SUMMARY ..... 173

**CHAPTER 7. AMALGAMATION** ..... 175

7.1. INTER-ETHNIC MARRIAGE IN ISRAEL ..... 177
*7.1.1. Attitudes towards inter-ethnic marriage among Jews* ..... 181
*7.1.2. Inter-ethnic marriage in Israel: the current situation* ..... 183
7.1.2.1. Inter-ethnic marriage/relationships among Jews ..... 183
7.1.2.2. Attitudes among Jews towards inter-ethnic marriage ..... 186
7.1.2.3. Inter-religious marriage among Arabs ..... 188
7.1.2.4. Attitudes among Arabs towards inter-religious

marriage ..... 189
7.2. INTER-ETHNIC FRIENDSHIP IN ISRAEL ..... 192
*7.2.1. Inter-ethnic friendship in Israel: the current situation* ..... 198
7.2.1.1. Ethnic origin of best friend among Israeli Jews ..... 199
7.2.1.2. Attitudes towards having best friend from another edah 200
7.2.1.3. Religious origin of best friend among Israeli Arabs ..... 201
7.2.1.4. Attitudes towards having best friend from another religion ..... 203
7.3. SUMMARY ..... 205

**CHAPTER 8. ACCULTURATION** ..... 207

8.1. VALUES AND ATTITUDES ..... 208
*8.1.1. Commitment towards Democracy* ..... 208
8.1.1.1. Political tolerance and democratic attitudes: the current situation ..... 210
*8.1.2. Legitimacy of Coexistence* ..... 213
8.1.2.1. Jewish attitudes towards Israeli Arabs ..... 214
8.1.2.2. Israeli Arab's position vis-à-vis Israel ..... 215
*8.1.3. The Arab-Israeli Conflict* ..... 216
8.1.3.1. Attitudes towards the Oslo Accord ..... 217
*8.1.4. Acceptance of Cultural Pluralism* ..... 220
8.2. EXPRESSION OF ETHNIC IDENTITY ..... 223
*8.2.1. Music taste* ..... 224
8.2.1.1. Musical preferences: the current situation ..... 227
8.2.1.2. Musical taste among the Jewish population ..... 227
8.2.1.3. Musical taste Among Arabs ..... 230
*8.2.2. The Extended Family: the Hamuleh system* ..... 234
*8.2.3. Hilulah and Memunah celebrations among Israeli Jews* ..... 237
8.4. SUMMARY ..... 243

**CHAPTER 9. IDENTIFICATION** ..... 245

9.1. JEWISH IDENTITY FORMATION AND SOCIAL BOUNDARY SHAPING WITHIN ISRAEL ..... 245
*9.1.1. Jewish/Israeli Identity Perceptions* ..... 248
*9.1.2. The Jewish 'Internal' Identity Divergence* ..... 249
*9.1.3. Ethnic, national and civic identities among Jews in contemporary Israel* ..... 252
9.1.3.1. Religious identification ..... 257
9.1.3.2. The most important identities ..... 263
9.2. IDENTITY FORMATION AMONG ISRAELI ARAB AND SOCIAL BOUNDARY SHAPING WITHIN ISRAEL ..... 265
*9.2.1. Israeli Arab's Change of National Identity?* ..... 265
*9.2.2. Official Definitions of National Identity of the Israeli Arabs* ..... 267
*9.2.3. Religious identity* ..... 273

*9.2.4. Religious, national and civic identities among Arabs in contemporary Israel* ..... 275
9.3. SUMMARY ..... 284

**CHAPTER 10. CONCLUSIONS** ..... 286

10.1. ASYMMETRIC GROUP RELATIONS ..... 286
*10.1.1. Intra-Jewish relations* ..... 286
*10.1.2. Intra-Arab relations* ..... 287
*10.1.3. Arab-Jewish relations* ..... 287
*10.1.4. The present situation: indication of Integration* ..... 288
10.1.4.1. Integration ..... 288
10.1.4.2. Amalgamation ..... 289
10.1.4.3. Acculturation ..... 290
10.1.4.4. Identification ..... 291
10.2. PERSISTENT ASYMMETRIC INTER-GROUP RELATIONS? ..... 291
10.3. CURRENT TRENDS TOWARDS TRANSFORMATION OF COLLECTIVE IDENTITIES ..... 294
*10.3.1. Israelization vs. Judaization* ..... 295
10.3.1.1. Israelization-Judaization Types ..... 295
10.3.1.2. Israelization-Polarisation Types among Israeli Arabs ..... 301
*10.3.2. Ethnicization vs. Civicization* ..... 307
10.3.2.1. Ethnicization among Israeli Jews ..... 308
10.3.2.2. Ethnicization among Israeli Arabs ..... 313
*10.3.3. Implications of Trends* ..... 317
10.4. THEORETICAL IMPLICATIONS FOR THE STUDY OF ISRAELI ETHNICITY ..... 318
10.5. IMPLICATIONS FOR PEACE RESEARCH ..... 320
*10.5.1. Models for Conflict Resolution* ..... 320
10.5.1.1. Separation ..... 321
10.5.1.2. Autonomy ..... 321
10.5.1.3. Integration ..... 322

**APPENDICES** ..... 325

CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION ..... 325
*The 1995 Questionnaire* ..... 325
CHAPTER 3. APPROACHES TO THE STUDY OF ETHNICITY IN ISRAEL ..... 333
*Theoretical Comparison* ..... 333
CHAPTER 4. ETHNIC GROUPS IN ISRAEL ..... 344
CHAPTER 6. INTEGRATION ..... 347
CHAPTER 7. AMALGAMATION ..... 348
CHAPTER 9. IDENTIFICATION ..... 350

**REFERENCES** ..... 353

A NOTE ON THE LITERATURE ..... 353
*Nationalism and Ethnicity* ..... 353
*Conflict and Conflict Resolution* ..... 354

*Israeli Statehood and Zionism* ..... 355
*Relations between Ashkenazi and Oriental/Sephardi Jews* ..... 356
*Relations between Arabs and Jews* ..... 357
*Israeli Arabs and Palestinians* ..... 358
*Relations Between Secular and Religious* ..... 359
DOCUMENTS ..... 360
POLITICAL PLATFORMS ..... 360
INTERNET ADDRESSES ..... 361
PERIODICALS AND NEWSPAPERS ..... 361
LITERATURE ..... 361