
ECONOMIC
EFFECTS OF
FUNDAMENTAL
TAX REFORM

Henry J. Aaron
William G. Gale
Editors

BROOKINGS INSTITUTION PRESS
Washington, D.C.

Contents

1. Introduction 1
Henry J. Aaron and William G. Gale

Part One Saving, Investment, and Economic Growth

2. Tax Reform, Capital Allocation, Efficiency, and Growth 29
Alan J. Auerbach
Comment by R. Glenn Hubbard
3. The Effects of Fundamental Tax Reform on Saving 83
Eric M. Engen and William G. Gale
Comment by B. Douglas Bernheim

Part Two Behavioral Effects

4. Fundamental Tax Reform and Employer-Provided Health Insurance 125
Jonathan Gruber and James Poterba
Comment by David Cutler
5. Taxes, Mortgage Borrowing, and Residential Land Prices 171
Dennis R. Capozza, Richard K. Green, Patric H. Hendershott
Comment by Douglas Holtz-Eakin

6. The Impact of Fundamental Tax Reform on Nonprofit Organizations 211
Charles T. Clotfelter and Richard L. Schmalbeck
Comment by Bruce K. MacLaury
7. Fundamental Tax Reform and Labor Supply 247
Robert K. Triest
Comment by Hilary Williamson Hoynes

Part Three Incidence

8. Distributional Effects of Fundamental Tax Reform 281
William G. Gale, Scott Houser, and John Karl Scholz
Comment by Louise Sheiner
9. Lifetime Effects of Fundamental Tax Reform 321
Don Fullerton and Diane Lim Rogers
Comment by Laurence J. Kotlikoff

Part Four Administrative and Transitional Issues

10. Which Is the Simplest Tax System of Them All? 355
Joel Slemrod
Comment by Jane G. Gravelle
11. Transition Issues in Moving to a Consumption Tax: A Tax Lawyer's Perspective 393
Ronald A. Pearlman
Comment by Robert Hall

Part Five Finance and International Effects

12. Treatment of Financial Services under Income and Consumption Taxes 437
David F. Bradford
Comment by John B. Shoven

13. Fundamental Tax Reform in an International Setting	465
<i>James R. Hines Jr.</i>	
Comment by J. Gregory Ballentine	
 Contributors	 503
 Participants	 505
 Index	 507
 Tables	
1-1. Comparing the Tax Plans	8
2-1. Current Effective Tax Rates, by Industry	40
2-2. Simulation Parameters of Current Tax System and Proposed Reforms	52
2-3. Macroeconomic and Welfare Effects of Tax Reforms, with No Adjustment Costs	58
2-4. Macroeconomic and Welfare Effects of Tax Reforms, with Adjustment Costs	62
2-5. Effects of Two Tax Reforms on an Open Economy	64
2-6. Effects of Tax Reforms, Assuming Alternative Labor Supply Responsiveness	65
3-1. Tax-Preferred Saving Incentive Accounts and Household Financial Assets, 1976-94	86
3-2. Decomposition of U.S. Personal Saving, 1971-93	86
3-3. Tax-Preferred Assets, Debt, and Household Net Worth, 1976-94	88
3-4. Interest Elasticity of Saving and Saving Rates in the Precautionary Saving Model	98
3-5. Interest Rate, Saving, and Household Welfare Effects in a Switch from Hybrid Income-Consumption Tax to Consumption Tax	100

3-6.	Effects of Tax Reform on Pension Coverage and Pension-Induced Changes in Total Saving, Exploratory Calculations	106
3A-1.	Interest Rate, Saving, and Household Welfare Effects in Switch from Hybrid Income-Consumption Tax to Consumption Tax, Accounting for Sensitivity to Households' Saving Preferences	112
4-1.	Composition of Employee Compensation, 1960, 1980, 1993	127
4-2.	Expenditures for Health Services and Supplies, by Type of Payer, 1991	129
4-3.	Covered Benefits in Group Health Plans, 1992-93	130
4-4.	Distribution of Estimated Expenditures on Employer-Provided Health Insurance for Sample Households, 1994	133
4-5.	Tax Subsidies to Employer-Provided Health Insurance	135
4-6.	Effect of Fundamental Tax Reform on Demand for Employer-Provided Health Insurance	142
4-7.	Distributional Analysis of Fundamental Tax Reform and the Demand for Employer-Provided Health Insurance	143
5-1.	Loan-to-Value Ratios, by Household Income and Age of Household Head	175
5-2.	House Values, by Household Income and Age of Household Head	176
5-3.	Regressions Explaining Loan-to-Value Ratios, Australia and United States	177
5-4.	Homeownership Rate, by Household Income and Age of Household Head	178
5-5.	Average Increase in Mortgage Debt among Homeowners, Arising from USA Tax, by Household Income and Age of Household Head	180
5-6.	Metropolitan Statistical Areas with Highest and Lowest Average Marginal Tax Rates, 1970, 1980, 1990	185
5-7.	Effect on Housing Prices of Eliminating Property Tax and Mortgage Interest Deductions, by Metropolitan Statistical Area	192

5-8.	Effect of USA Tax on Housing Prices, by Metropolitan Statistical Area	193
5-9.	Effect of Flat Tax on Housing Prices, by Metropolitan Statistical Area	194
6-1.	Estimated Number of Tax-Exempt Nonprofit Organizations, 1990	212
6-2.	Revenues of Large Nonprofit Organizations, 1991	213
6-3.	Sources of Revenue of Charitable Organizations, by Subsector, 1992	214
6-4.	Selected Information on Taxpayers, by Adjusted Gross Income Class, 1992	216
6-5.	Actual and Predicted Changes in Itemized Charitable Giving after the 1986 Tax Act, by Sample and Selected Income Group	221
6-6.	Calculations of Tax Revenue and Contributions under Different Tax Plans and Behavioral Assumptions, 1996	229
6-7.	Actual and Simulated Corporate Contributions under Elimination of the Charitable Deduction, 1991	232
6-8.	Actual and Simulated Charitable Bequests under Elimination of the Estate Tax, 1993	234
6A-1.	Basic Data Used in Calculations of Corporate Contributions	240
6A-2.	Basic Data Used in Calculations of Charitable Bequests	243
7-1.	U.S. Federal Individual Income Tax Schedule, 1995	249
7-2.	Sample Characteristics, by Income Group	253
7-3.	Behavioral Parameters Used in Simulations of Hours of Work	258
7-4.	Simulation of Effects of Tax Reform on Hours Worked, Various Parameters	260
7-5.	Simulation of Effects of a VAT on Hours Worked, Parameter Set 1	261
7-6.	Simulation of Alternative Tax Reforms, Parameter Set 1	262
8-1.	The Distribution of Tax Liabilities and Transfer Payments, by Income Percentile, 1994	286

8-2.	The Effect of the Flat Tax on the Distribution of Tax Liabilities, by Income Percentile	290
8-3.	Percentage of Families in Each Income Decile with Tax Changes of Various Magnitudes	295
8-4.	Distributional Effects of the Flat Tax, by Age, Income Class, and Homeownership Status, 1994	296
8-5.	Distribution of Current Law and Flat Tax Burdens for Families, Age 40–50, 1994	298
8-6.	Distributional Effects of Alternative Tax Reform Proposals	300
8-7.	Distribution of Asset and Liability Holdings in the U.S. Population, 1992 Survey of Consumer Finances	304
8B-1.	Distribution of Taxes under Alternative Incidence Assumptions	312
9-1.	Changes in Effective Tax Rates on Capital from Switching to Proportional Consumption (VAT), Wage, and Income Taxes	327
9-2.	Economic Effects of Switching to Proportional Consumption (VAT), Wage, and Income Taxes	329
9-3.	Distribution of Intergenerational Welfare Effects under Eight Tax Proposals, by Age	332
9-4.	Distribution of Intragenerational Welfare Effects under Eight Tax Proposals, by Income Category	334
9-5.	Efficiency Gains from Eight Tax Replacements under Various Assumptions about Intertemporal and Leisure-Consumption Elasticities	336
10-1.	Quantitative Estimates of the Compliance Cost of the U.S. Income Tax System	360
10A-1.	Average Time Spent on Various Activities, by Type of Return and Preparer Status, 1983 Estimates	383
12-1.	Treatment of a Demand Deposit under the Income Tax	444
12-2.	Treatment of a Demand Deposit under a Subtraction-Type Consumption Tax	450
12-3.	Cash-Flow Treatment of a Demand Deposit	452

13-1.	Alternative U.S. Tax Treatment of International Transactions	474
13-2.	Foreign Activity in the United States, by Country of Ultimate Beneficial Owner, 1992	486
Figures		
5-1.	Housing Market Transitional Dynamics	204
7-1.	Budget Constraint for Individual with Two-Bracket Tax on Earnings	248
7-2.	Federal Marginal Tax Rates on Earned Income	250
7-3.	Budget Constraint for Individual with Three-Bracket Tax on Earnings	251
8-1.	Average Effective Tax Rates under Current Law and the Flat Tax	293