

Environment Scarcity and Conflict

A study of Malthusian concerns

Leif Ohlsson



Department of Peace and
Development Research
Göteborg University

Contents

1. Environment, scarcity, and conflict – A debate and its origins	1
Why Malthusian concerns?	1
The great debate	3
The large processes of change	6
Technological change, particularly new information technologies	7
The still large yearly population increases	7
Demographic changes	8
The unavoidable environmental impacts resulting from the above	9
The strains that all of this puts on states, many of which are increasingly ill-equipped to handle these challenges	10
What kind of environmental impacts?	10
Scarcity of environmental space	11
The roots in the great debate	13
Environmental impacts in this study	15
What kind of resource scarcities?	15
Non-renewable resources	15
Renewable resources	18
Social resources	22
Resource scarcities in this study	23
What kind of conflicts?	24
Environment, scarcity and conflict – the great turning-point	25
The debate on “security”, and a caveat	27
Conflicts in this study	29
Layout of the study	30

Part I: Natural resource scarcity and the risk of conflict:

2. Environmental scarcity – Concepts, mechanisms, and cases	34
The North-American research (Homer-Dixon and the Toronto group)	35
Environmental scarcity – a new concept	37
Hypothesized mechanisms working towards conflict	39
Cases from the project on “Environmental Change and Acute Conflict”	39
Cases from “The Project on Environment, Population and Security”	41
Key findings of how environmental scarcity affects societies	42
The Swiss research (ENCOP)	44
A typology of environmentally induced conflicts	45
What does it take for an environmentally induced conflict to break out?	47
The Scandinavian research (PRIO)	49
The “environmental security” approach	50
The “causes of conflict” approach	51
What is the relation between the policy- and research sectors?	54

3. Causality problems in the study of environment, scarcity, and conflict	56
What is the nature of causal analysis within the social sciences?	57
The variability of the causal link between environmental scarcity and conflict	59
Is environmental scarcity really an independent variable?	61
The relationship between multicausality, interactivity and holism	62
Conditionalities of environmental scarcity as a causal factor	64
What is an explanation within the social sciences?	65
A basic theory: The intentional-actor model	67
Hypothesis testing – the unorthodox approach	71
Choosing a method	72
Do explanations also enable us to make predictions?	73
How do we compare the importance of causal factors?	75
Summing up	77
4. How environmental scarcity paved the way for genocide in Rwanda	80
Explaining genocide	85
The issue of Malthusian concerns in relation to Rwanda	86
An explanatory narrative of genocide in Rwanda	87
Agricultural conditions and population	87
Population movements in the Great Lakes area historically	89
Pre-colonial central power	89
History mythologized	90
Decolonization and Hutu rule	91
The first twenty-five years of independence	92
Food production hits a wall	92
Dependence on agriculture – failure to create a modern sector	93
Coffee market bust, and structural adjustment	94
Internal war, refugees, and famine	95
Demands for democracy and power-sharing – the final solution prepared	96
A spectrum of positions on Malthusian concerns and the role of scarcities	96
i) Avoiding Malthusian concerns	97
ii) Rejection of Malthusian concerns on principled grounds	97
iii) Intuitive acceptance of Malthusian concerns	99
iv) Determining the specific role of scarcities	100
v) Determining the role of the developmental model	101
vi) Empirical corroboration of Malthusian concerns and environmental scarcity	104
vii) Empirical refutation of the role of environmental scarcity	108
Refuting the refutation	112
The issue of rising inequalities and structural scarcity	113
The issue of coercing people to take part in genocide	114
The issues of regime legitimacy and manipulation of ethnicity	115
The issue of regime insecurity	116
The crucial methodological mistake	117
Malthusian concerns and the issue of determinism	119
Summing up the case against linking Malthusian concerns to determinism	122

The relation of actor-oriented approaches to determinism	122
The issue of free will in relation to determinism	123
A role for evil in social science explanations	124
Evil, responsibility and genocide in Rwanda	129
The perpetrators (i): "The innocent murderers"	130
The perpetrators (ii): "The willing executioners"	132
The perpetrators (iii): The loyal servants	135
The perpetrators (iv): The instigators	137
Limiting the space for evil	140
A role for evil and responsibility in international relations	141
Summing up	144

Part II: Social resource scarcity and the risk of conflict:

5. Social resource scarcity – Searching for the roots of a concept reformulated	146
Searching for the roots of a social resource conceptualization of scarcity ...	149
"The ingenuity gap": A full-blown model of social resource scarcity	150
"Narrow coalitions" and social resource scarcity	152
Institutional economics: The hidden costs of institutions	153
Adapting to population increase through institutions:	
Limitations and bias	154
Endogenous growth theory:	
Adaptive capacity undermined by scarcities	156
Roots in other concepts	157
Thresholds and sustainability levels of social resources	158
Social resource scarcity – a concept reformulated	161
Natural and social resource scarcity – uniting two discourses	162
The adaptive capacity of the state in focus	164
Key findings of the State Capacity project	165
The case study of China	168
Some remarks on the international consequences	
of water scarcity in China	169
The case study of Indonesia	170
The case study of Bihar (India)	172
Summing up social resource scarcity	172
6. Water, conflict, and social resource scarcity – The concept on trial	174
Water scarcity	176
Availability of water resources	176
Water use by category and sector	178
Potential sources of increased supply	178
Water needs and demands	179
The need for and consequences of demand management	180
Projections of water scarcity	182
Water scarcity – the emerging consensus	183
Water scarcity and the risk for international conflict	184
Zero-sum game or confidence-building	184
River basin versus states	185
Conflicting legal principles	186
Conflict resolution – water for peace	186

International water conflicts – the emerging consensus	187
Water scarcity and the risk for conflicts within countries	188
Policy tools for adapting to water scarcity within countries	188
The risk for conflicts within countries induced by water scarcity per se	191
The risk for conflicts induced by attempts to adapt to water scarcity	192
The risk for conflicts within countries – the emerging consensus	193
Applying the concept of social resource scarcity to the Nile Basin	195
Projected water scarcity in the Nile Basin	197
Risks of conflict between Nile Basin states over water resources	198
Social resource scarcity in the Nile Basin and the risk of conflicts due to lack of adaptive capacity	201
The Nile Basin - concluding remarks	205
An index for social water stress	206
Previous attempts	206
The Human Development Index as a proxy for social adaptive capacity	208
A combined HDI/Water stress index for Social Water Stress	209
Countries better or worse off due to lack or surplus of adaptive capacity	211
Strategic regions viewed by the SWSI conceptual glasses	213
7. Environmental scarcity, social resource scarcity, and development research	218
Malthusian concerns are about what life will be like	220
The sustainability aspect – rethinking limits to growth	220
The equity aspect – accepting what is	224
The adaptive capacity aspect – acting on what is	225
Policy-related research tasks generated by Malthusian concerns	228
Environmental scarcity and problems for development research	228
Problems caused by the lack of state capacity and social resource scarcity	230
Problems for the international system of states	233
A suggested general direction for policy-relevant research	237
Back to the future	240
The robustness of normalcy	241
The normality of chaos	242
Appendix:	
How the Social Water Stress/Scarcity Index was calculated	247
Full tables comparing hydrological and social water stress	249
A note on Swedish terminology	262
References	263