

# VIOLENCE THROUGH ENVIRONMENTAL DISCRIMINATION

Causes, Rwanda Arena, and Conflict Model

by

GÜNTHER BAECHLER

*Swiss Peace Foundation,  
Institute for Conflict Resolution,  
Berne, Switzerland*



**KLUWER ACADEMIC PUBLISHERS**

DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LONDON

# CONTENTS

PREFACE	xi
SUMMARY	xv
1 INTRODUCTION	
The Transformation of Society-Nature Relationship	1
1.1. Environmental Conflicts: Historical and Contemporary Phenomena	3
1.1.1. Society-Nature Relationships	3
1.1.2. Historical Evidence	7
1.1.3. Development of Maldevelopment	9
1.1.4. Socioecological Heterogeneity	11
1.2. Landscape as Threatened Life-Support System	14
1.2.1. Water as Part of the Life-Support System	15
1.2.2. Soil as Part of the Life-Support System	16
1.3. Summary and Overview	17
2 DISCUSSION	
State of the Art	21
2.1. Founex Report on Environmental Change and Underdevelopment	22
2.2. Linkage between Environmental Change, Security, and Conflict	24
2.2.1. Linkages between Environment and Security	25
2.2.2. Discussion of the Causal Linkage	26
2.3. Methodological Dilemmas in the Study of Causal Linkage	30
2.3.1. Evaluation of Taxonomies and Typologies	30
2.3.2. A Conflict Story Can Be Told from Different Angles	35
2.3.3. »Someone's Cow Ate Someone Else's Crop«	37
2.3.4. »The Effects of Persistent Drought...«	40
2.3.5. Causation in Complex Politico-Ecological Systems	41
2.3.6. Causal Relationship between Independent and Dependent Variable	44
2.3.7. Action as a Result of Two Filters	47
2.3.8. To Sort out Causes by Attributing Specific Roles to Them	50
2.4. Research Strategy	52

3	<b>CORRELATIONS</b>	
	Environment, Maldevelopment, and Violent Conflict	55
3.1.	Human Development Correlated with Violent Conflicts and Wars	56
3.1.1.	War Register and HDI-Country Rank	57
3.1.2.	Interpretation of the Tables and Findings	58
3.2.	Violent Conflicts and Wars in Arid Lowlands	64
3.2.1.	Arid Zones, Poverty, and Conflict	64
3.3.	Violent Conflicts and Wars in Mountains	72
3.3.1.	Cultural Aspects of Violence in Mountains and Highlands	73
3.3.2.	Patterns of Conflicts in Mountains	80
3.4.	Conclusions	82
4	<b>TYPOLGY</b>	
	Types of Conflicts and the Role of the Environment	85
4.1.	Environmentally Caused Violence: A Phenomenon of Developing and Transitional Societies (Hypothesis One)	86
4.1.1.	Ethnopolitical Conflicts (Type AI)	89
4.1.2.	Center-Periphery Conflicts (Type AII)	91
4.1.3.	Internal Migration Conflicts (Type AIII)	92
4.1.4.	Cross-Border Migration Conflicts (Type BIV)	94
4.1.5.	Demographically Caused Migration Conflicts (Type BV)	95
4.1.6.	International Water Conflicts (Type CVI)	96
4.1.7.	Global Environmental Conflicts (Type CVII)	98
4.1.8.	Conflict Types: Conclusions	99
4.2.	Inevitable Situations and the Lack of Regulatory Mechanisms (Hypothesis Two)	101
4.2.1.	Inevitable Situations	102
4.2.2.	Lack of Regulatory Mechanisms	103
4.2.3.	Instrumentalizing the Environmental Problem	105
4.2.4.	Opportunities to Build up Organizations and Find Allies	106
4.2.5.	Context of an Ongoing Armed Conflict	107
4.3.	The Role of the Environment as a Cause of Conflict	107
4.3.1.	Reason	108
4.3.2.	Trigger	109
4.3.3.	Target	109
4.3.4.	Channel	110
4.3.5.	Catalyst	111

4.4.	The Intensity of Environmental Conflicts	111
5	<b>CASE STUDY</b>	
	Why Environmental Discrimination Caused Violence on the 'Mille Collines'	113
5.1.	Propositions	115
5.2.	Causes and Their Roles	117
5.2.1.	Reason I: Ethnogenesis as Hierarchy	117
5.2.2.	Reason II: Social and Environmental Discrimination	129
5.2.3.	Channeling: Increasing Conflict Potential before the Revolution of 1959/60	143
5.2.4.	Targeting: Freedom from Oppression versus Elimination	152
5.2.5.	Development without Democratization	157
5.2.6.	Catalysts: The Invasion of the FPR and the Arusha Peace Agreement	158
5.2.7.	Trigger: Plane Crash and First Massacres	162
5.3.	Preservation of Power at All Costs: Conclusions	162
6	<b>MODEL</b>	
	Causal Relationship between Environmental Transformation and Violent Conflict	167
6.1.	Model Building and Constraints	168
6.1.1.	Explain a Lot with Very Little	168
6.1.2.	Prerequisites of a Model	170
6.2.	Propositions and Hypotheses	175
6.3.	Environmental Conflict Model	179
6.4.	Indicators	181
7	<b>EMPIRICAL EVIDENCE</b>	
	Six Area Studies and Six Control Cases to Check the Model	187
7.1.	Environmental Discrimination	189
7.1.1.	Ethnopolitical Conflicts	189
7.1.2.	Center-Periphery Conflicts	192
7.1.3.	Internal Migration Conflicts	193
7.1.4.	Cross-Border Migration Conflicts	196
7.1.5.	Demographically Caused Conflicts	199
7.1.6.	International Water Conflicts	201
7.2.	Dependence on Natural Capital: The Cases of Mexico, Botswana, and South Africa	204

7.3.	Marginalization and Group Cohesion: The Cases of Mexico, Botswana, and South Africa	206
7.4.	Lack of Regulatory Mechanisms	209
7.5.	Population Dynamics	211
7.6.	State Instability and Poor Performance	212
7.7.	Complex External Influences	217
7.8.	What Makes a Difference?	219
8	<b>OUTLOOK</b>	
	Conflict Potential, Sustainable Development, and Environmental Security	221
8.1.	Multiple Causal Roles Concept	222
8.2.	Crisis Triangle: Maldevelopment, Transformation, Conflict	226
	8.2.1. Rural Transformation	226
	8.2.2. Ethnopoliticized Environmental Conflict in the Rwanda Arena	229
	8.2.3. Population Dynamics and Migration	231
	8.2.4. Force or Cooperation?	232
8.3.	Sustainable Development and Environmental Security	233
	8.3.1. The Development/Security Prism	234
	8.3.2. What Can Be Learned from the Borana Solution?	239
9	<b>APPENDIX</b>	
	Tables	243
	Abbreviations	272
	List of Tables	274
	List of Figures	275
10	<b>GLOSSARY</b>	277
11	<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	287