

THE POLITICS OF TRUTH AND RECONCILIATION IN SOUTH AFRICA

Legitimizing the Post-Apartheid
State

Richard A. Wilson
University of Sussex



CONTENTS

<i>List of Acronyms and Glossary</i>	x
<i>Maps</i>	
Map 1 Pre-1994 South Africa: The homelands	xii
Map 2 Post-1994 South Africa: Provinces of the Republic	xiii
Map 3 Johannesburg and the Vaal Region	xiv
<i>Preface and Acknowledgements</i>	xv
1 Human Rights and Nation-Building	1
The Civic State versus Ethno-Nationalism	1
Legal Ideology and Nation-States	3
Human Rights in the Negotiations	5
• Human Rights, <i>Ubuntu</i> and the African Community	9
• Truth, Reconciliation and Nation-Building	13
• Manufacturing Legitimacy	17
Truth Commissions as Liminal Institutions	19
The Structure of the TRC	21
• Truth Commissions and Impunity	27
PART I Human Rights and Truth	
2 Technologies of Truth: The TRC's Truth-Making Machine	33
The Limitations of the Mandate	34
Rainbow Truths	36
The Rise and Rise of Infocomm	38
Truth in Crisis	41
Taking on the Statement-Takers	42
The New Protocol	44
The Database Driving the Model	46
Experiences of Truth-Telling	48
• The Banality of 'Evil'	51
A Moral Response to Apartheid Violence	55
The Human Right to a Human Story	57

3	The Politics of Truth and Human Rights	62
	Was there a Third Force?	63
	Was there a Third Force? 'Well, No, Yes, Sort of, Maybe'	66
	Theorizing the Third Force	73
	Human Rights Violations and Common Crimes	79
	Race Crimes and Political Motives	84
PART II Reconciliation, Retribution and Revenge		
4	Reconciliation Through Truth?	97
	Defining Reconciliation	98
	The Legal-Procedural Narrative	104
	The Mandarin-Intellectual Narrative	106
	The Religious-Redemptive Narrative	109
	Thick and Thin Reconciliation	121
5	Reconciliation in Society: Religious Values and Procedural Pragmatism	123
	Legal Pluralism and Human Rights in South Africa	123
	Adductive Affinities	130
	'Reconciliation through Amnesty?'	140
	Procedural Pragmatism	142
	Behind the Scenes in Kagiso	147
	Reconciliation for Whom?	153
6	Vengeance, Revenge and Retribution	156
	Revenge in Modern Legal Thought	158
	National Debates on Vengeance	164
	Intimations of Vengeance during TRC Hearings	173
	Relational Discontinuities	174
	A History of Violence in Sharpeville since 1990	176
	Reconciliation in Ruins: The Death of Dennis Moerane	181
	Gunshots at Night	185
7	Reconciliation with a Vengeance	188
	A Short History of Legal Pluralism in South Africa	188
	Local Courts and the State: Ambivalent Relations	201
	Patriarchy and Procedure of the Boipatong Court	202
	Township Court Procedure	204
	Tribal Law?	206
	Reconciliation versus the Right to Punish	208

Punishment and Suffering: Comparing Informal and Official State Courts	210
Unintended Consequences of Popular Justice	211
Justice and the TRC	213
A Coda to Boipatong: Human Rights, Local Justice and Gender	215
Legal Pluralism Revisited	218
8 Conclusions: Human Rights, Reconciliation and Retribution	223
<i>Notes</i>	231
<i>Bibliography</i>	246
<i>Index</i>	263

ACRONYMS AND GLOSSARY

AC	Amnesty Committee of the TRC
ANC	African National Congress
ANCYL	ANC Youth League
AWB	Afrikaner Weerstandsbeweging (Afrikaner Resistance Movement)
AZAPO	Azanian People's Organization
BRAC	Boipatong Residents Against Crime
CODESA	Convention for a Democratic South Africa
COSATU	Congress of South African Trade Unions
CPF	Community Policing Forum
DP	Democratic Party
GNU	Government of National Unity
HRVC	Human Rights Violations Committee of the TRC
HRV Hearings	Human Rights Violations hearings of the TRC
ICC	International Criminal Court
IFP	Inkatha Freedom Party
<i>Imbizo</i>	Meeting or court (Zulu)
Infocomm	Information Management System of the TRC
ISCOR	Iron and Steel Corporation (Vaal)
IU	Investigative Unit of the TRC
<i>Kgotla</i>	Meeting or court (Sesotho); plural <i>lekgotla</i>
<i>Khulumani</i>	'Speak out' Survivor's support group
MDM	Mass Democratic Movement
MK	Umkhonto we Sizwe (ANC armed wing)
MP	Member of Parliament
NCPS	National Crime Prevention Strategy
NGO	Non-governmental organization
NP	National Party
NSMS	National Security Management System
NPA	National Peace Accord
NUMSA	National Union of Mineworkers of South Africa
NURA	National Unity and Reconciliation Act (1995)
PAC	Pan Africanist Congress
PAGAD	People Against Gangsterism and Drugs

RRC	Reparation and Rehabilitation Committee of the TRC
SAIRR	South African Institute of Race Relations
SABC	South African Broadcasting Company
SACC	South African Council of Churches
SACP	South African Communist Party
SADF	South African Defense Force (apartheid)
SANCO	South African National Civics Organization
SANDF	South African National Defense Force (post-apartheid)
SAP	South African Police (apartheid)
SAPS	South African Police Service (post-apartheid)
SDU	Special Defence Unit (ANC)
SPU	Special Protection Unit (IFP)
SSC	State Security Council
STRATCOM	Strategic Communications
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commission
<i>Ubuntu</i>	Humanity, personhood, mutuality
UDF	United Democratic Front
ZCC	Zionist Christian Church