

Vito Breda

The Objectivity of Judicial Decisions

A Comparative Analysis of Nine Jurisdictions



PETER LANG
EDITION

Contents

Acknowledgments.....	9
Introduction and methodology.....	11
1. Modest Objectivity in Judicial Reasoning.....	11
2. Objectivity: a second order of justification	18
3. Research methods and assumptions	22
Bibliography.....	27
Chapter 1	
The Grammar of Bias: Judicial Impartiality in European Legal Systems	31
1. Introduction.....	31
2. Judicial Impartiality	32
3. Judicial bias: A theoretical overview.....	39
4. Allegations of objective judicial bias: A common legal language across Europe.....	44
5. Subjective judicial bias: The national grammar of judicial bias.....	47
6. Conclusion: The grammar of subjective and objective bias.....	52
Bibliography.....	53
Chapter 2	
Truth and justice as qualifiers of the concept of judicial objectivity.....	59
1. Introduction.....	59
2. The judicial objective truth, and nothing but the procedural truth.....	61
3. Procedural and substantial truths.....	65

4. Interpreting the data: truth as a qualifier of judicial objectivity and verophobia	67
5. Judicial objectivity as a qualifier of fairness and justice	71
6. Interpreting the data: justice, fairness and judicial objectivity	74
7. Conclusion: truth, objectivity and justice	77
Bibliography.....	78

Chapter 3

Objective judicial discretion cases.....	81
1. Introduction	81
2. A theoretical overview.....	83
3. The analysis of the results	89
a) Pre-judices: explicit segmented epistemology.....	90
b) External segmented epistemology.....	92
c) Internal segmented epistemology.....	93
4. Conclusion.....	96
Bibliography.....	97

Chapter 4

A qualitative reflection: objectivity in judicial narratives	101
1. Introduction	101
2. Preliminary notes	102
3. Reading the results of Table 1	105
4. Uniqueness and odd communalities: commentary on the results.....	109
a) Objective textual interpretation (Group A)	110
b) Objectified judicial discretion (Group B).....	112
c) Objective impartiality (Group C)	114
d) Objectivity as truth (Group D).....	118
e) Objectivity as fairness (Group E)	120

5. Some Final Comments.....	121
Table 1.....	126
Bibliography.....	127
Index	131