

SCOPE 60

Resilience and
the Behavior of
Large-Scale Systems

Edited by
Lance H. Gunderson and Lowell Pritchard Jr.

A project of SCOPE, the Scientific Committee on
Problems of the Environment, of the
International Council for Science

ISLAND PRESS
Washington • Covelo • London

Contents

| | |
|---|-------|
| <i>List of Figures and Tables</i> | xv |
| <i>Foreword</i> | xix |
| <i>Preface</i> | xxi |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | xxiii |

Part I. Understanding Resilience: Theory, Metaphors, and Frameworks

| | |
|--|----|
| 1. Resilience of Large-Scale Resource Systems | 3 |
| Lance H. Gunderson, C.S. Holling, Lowell Pritchard Jr., and Garry D. Peterson | |
| What Is Resilience? | 4 |
| Why Study Resilience? | 6 |
| Properties of Complex Adaptive Systems | 8 |
| <i>Diversity and Stability</i> | 8 |
| <i>Cross-Scale Dynamics</i> | 12 |
| <i>Panarchy</i> | 14 |
| Propositions | 16 |
| Evaluation of Propositions in Large-Scale Ecosystems | 17 |
| Literature Cited | 18 |
| 2. Models and Metaphors of Sustainability, Stability, and Resilience | 21 |
| Donald Ludwig, Brian H. Walker, and C.S. Holling | |
| Equilibrium | 21 |
| Resilience and Stability | 22 |
| A Simple Prototype for Stability and Resilience | 24 |
| <i>Global Stability</i> | 24 |
| <i>Bifurcation</i> | 25 |

| | |
|--|----|
| Local Stability and Domain of Attraction | 26 |
| <i>Disturbances and Slow Parameter Changes</i> | 27 |
| Two Domains of Attraction | 27 |
| <i>Disturbances and Slow Parameter Changes</i> | 29 |
| Hard Loss of Stability and Hysteresis | 30 |
| <i>Hard Loss of Stability</i> | 31 |
| <i>Hysteresis and Cycles</i> | 32 |
| <i>Disturbances and Resilience</i> | 33 |
| <i>Lake Dynamics</i> | 33 |
| <i>The Baltic Sea</i> | 34 |
| <i>The Boreal Forest</i> | 35 |
| A Competitive Grazing System | 35 |
| Fire in a Savanna System | 39 |
| Concluding Remarks | 43 |
| Acknowledgments | 44 |
| Appendix. Return Times and Resilience | 44 |
| Literature Cited | 47 |

Part II. Resilience in Large-Scale Systems

| | |
|---|----|
| 3. Resilience and the Restoration of Lakes | 51 |
| Stephen R. Carpenter and Kathryn L. Cottingham | |
| Resilience Mechanisms | 52 |
| Pathological Dynamics | 55 |
| Alternative States | 58 |
| Resilience and Return Time | 59 |
| Assessment of Resilience | 61 |
| Significance of Biodiversity for Resilience | 62 |
| Policies for Restoration | 63 |
| Concluding Remarks | 65 |
| Acknowledgments | 65 |
| Literature Cited | 66 |
| 4. The Baltic Sea: Reversibly Unstable or Irreversibly Stable? | 71 |
| Bengt-Owe Jansson and AnnMari Jansson | |
| History | 71 |
| Recent Conditions of the Baltic Sea Ecosystem | 73 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| The Future Baltic? | 74 |
| The Baltic Ecosystem | 74 |
| <i>Characteristics of the Sea</i> | 75 |
| <i>Subsystems</i> | 76 |
| Scales of Change in the Baltic: Cycles, Trends, and Flips | 79 |
| <i>Cyclic Patterns</i> | 79 |
| <i>Trends</i> | 82 |
| <i>Anthropogenic Indicators</i> | 85 |
| <i>Main Switches and Flips in the System</i> | 87 |
| Resilience in the Baltic | 90 |
| <i>Key Variables</i> | 90 |
| <i>Reversible Changes: Fluctuations between Stability Domains</i> | 93 |
| <i>Irreversible Changes</i> | 95 |
| People and Issues of the Baltic | 95 |
| <i>Large-Scale Drivers</i> | 96 |
| <i>Land-Use Patterns and Impact Issues</i> | 97 |
| <i>Ecological and Economic Services</i> | 98 |
| <i>Governance and Resilience</i> | 103 |
| Concluding Remarks | 104 |
| Acknowledgments | 106 |
| Literature Cited | 106 |
| 5. Resilience of Coral Reefs | 111 |
| Tim R. McClanahan, Nicholas V. C. Polunin, and Terry J. Done | |
| Reef Functions | 112 |
| Ecological Services | 115 |
| Alternate Structures and Interacting Processes | 115 |
| Disturbances, Time Scales, and Reef Ecology | 118 |
| <i>Natural Disturbances: Cyclones</i> | 118 |
| <i>Crown-of-Thorns Starfish</i> | 118 |
| <i>Human-Induced Disturbances</i> | 119 |
| <i>Nutrients and Sediments</i> | 119 |
| <i>Resource Extraction</i> | 120 |
| <i>Interactions between Disturbances</i> | 123 |
| Recovery Rates of Reefs | 123 |
| <i>Corals</i> | 124 |
| <i>Fishes</i> | 125 |
| <i>Other Organisms and Reef Structure</i> | 125 |
| Factors That Contribute to Resilience | 127 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| <i>Species Diversity</i> | 127 |
| <i>Keystone Species and Redundancy</i> | 128 |
| <i>Loss and Replacement of Keystone Species</i> | 129 |
| <i>Spatial Heterogeneity and Refugia</i> | 134 |
| Synergistic Stressors | 139 |
| Human Institutions and Coral Reef Resilience | 141 |
| <i>The Economic Evolution of Watersheds</i> | 142 |
| <i>Low-Lying Atolls and Islands</i> | 143 |
| <i>Fisheries Management and Its Contribution to Ecological Resilience</i> | 143 |
| <i>National Governments</i> | 146 |
| Concluding Remarks | 149 |
| Literature Cited | 150 |
| 6. Resilience in Wet Landscapes of Southern Florida | 165 |
| Lance H. Gunderson and Carl J. Walters | |
| Another Heuristic of Resilience | 165 |
| Freshwater Everglades | 168 |
| Florida Bay | 169 |
| <i>Circulation, Freshwater, and Salinity</i> | 171 |
| <i>Seagrass Community Dynamics</i> | 172 |
| <i>Modeling Seagrass Dynamics</i> | 173 |
| Management Implications | 178 |
| Concluding Remarks | 179 |
| Literature Cited | 180 |
| 7. Ecological Resilience in Grazed Rangelands: A Generic Case Study | 183 |
| Brian H. Walker | |
| The Rangeland System, Structure, and Composition | 183 |
| Rangeland Dynamics | 184 |
| <i>The Drivers</i> | 184 |
| <i>The Dynamics</i> | 185 |
| <i>The States</i> | 186 |
| Rangeland Resilience: Mechanisms and Issues | 187 |
| <i>The Distinction between Sandy and Heavy Textured Soils</i> | 188 |
| <i>Species Diversity and Resilience</i> | 188 |
| <i>Maintaining Resilience through Disturbance</i> | 188 |
| <i>Rangeland Dynamics near the Boundary of Resilience: The Issue of Time Scales</i> | 189 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| <i>The Effect of Patchiness</i> | 190 |
| Indicators and Measures of Resilience | 191 |
| Concluding Remarks | 191 |
| Literature Cited | 192 |
| 8. Resilience of Tropical Wet and Dry Forests in Puerto Rico | 195 |
| Ariel Lugo, Frederick N. Scatena, Whendee Silver, Sandra Molina Colón, and Peter G. Murphy | |
| Caribbean Forest Hierarchy | 196 |
| Overview of Forest Structure and Dynamics | 197 |
| <i>Subtropical Wet (Tabonuco) Forest</i> | 197 |
| <i>Subtropical Dry (Deciduous to Semi-evergreen) Forest</i> | 198 |
| <i>Comparison of Wet and Dry Forests</i> | 199 |
| The Interface between Disturbances and Ecosystems | 204 |
| Wind Storms | 206 |
| Water Availability | 208 |
| <i>Excessive Water</i> | 209 |
| <i>Drought</i> | 210 |
| <i>Land Use Conversion</i> | 210 |
| Species Invasions | 213 |
| Synergy between Anthropogenic and Natural Disturbances | 214 |
| Ecosystem-Level Characteristics That Result in Resilience | 215 |
| <i>Belowground Nutrients</i> | 215 |
| <i>Rapid Fluxes</i> | 216 |
| <i>Biotic Controls</i> | 217 |
| <i>Species Richness and Redundancy</i> | 218 |
| <i>Negative Feedbacks</i> | 218 |
| <i>High Species Turnover and Self-Design</i> | 218 |
| Concluding Remarks | 220 |
| Acknowledgments | 221 |
| Literature Cited | 221 |
| 9. Forest Dynamics in the Southeastern United States: Managing Multiple Stable States | 227 |
| Garry D. Peterson | |
| Pine-Oak Forest Dynamics in Northwest Florida | 228 |
| <i>Longleaf Pine</i> | 228 |
| <i>Oaks, Pines, and Fires</i> | 229 |
| <i>Sand Pine</i> | 230 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Study Site—Eglin Air Force Base | 231 |
| Modeling Landscape Dynamics | 234 |
| Management Alternatives | 235 |
| <i>Prescribed Fire</i> | 235 |
| <i>Fire Management Strategies</i> | 236 |
| Discussion of Burning Strategies | 237 |
| <i>Wildfire Management Strategy</i> | 239 |
| <i>Rotation Fire Management Strategy</i> | 240 |
| <i>Responsive Fire Management Strategy</i> | 240 |
| <i>Spatial and Temporal Scales</i> | 241 |
| Managing Landscapes Containing Alternative Stable States | 243 |
| <i>Limits to Restoration</i> | 243 |
| <i>Recognizing Alternate Stable States</i> | 244 |
| <i>Importance of Burn Size</i> | 244 |
| <i>Key Areas for Intervention</i> | 245 |
| Concluding Remarks | 245 |
| Literature Cited | 246 |

Part III. Summary

10. A Summary and Synthesis of Resilience in Large-Scale Systems

Lance H. Gunderson, Lowell Pritchard Jr., C.S. Holling, Carl Folke, and Garry D. Peterson

| | |
|---|-----|
| The Holling Frustration: The Pathology of Constancy Versus the Viability of Variability | 250 |
| The Bite-Back Paradox: Well-Behaved Functions Versus Shifting Controls | 250 |
| The MacArthur Paradox: Diversity Increases Stability Versus Diversity Increases Resilience | 250 |
| The Sustainability Paradox: Short-Term Efficiency Versus Long-Term Sustainability | 251 |
| Evaluation of Propositions | 251 |
| <i>The Organization of Regional Resource Systems Emerges from the Interaction of a Few Variables</i> | 251 |
| <i>Complex Systems Have Multiple Stable States</i> | 252 |
| <i>Resilience Derives from Functional Reinforcement across Scales and from Functional Overlap within Scales</i> | 253 |
| <i>Vulnerability Increases As Sources of Novelty Are Eliminated and Functional Diversity and Cross-Scale Functional Replication Are Reduced</i> | 254 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Understanding Ecological Resilience | 254 |
| <i>Multiple Meanings</i> | 254 |
| <i>Loss of Ecological Resilience</i> | 257 |
| Management and Resilience | 259 |
| <i>Uncertainty, Understanding, and Resilience</i> | 259 |
| <i>Restoration and Maintenance of Resilience</i> | 261 |
| Concluding Remarks | 264 |
| Literature Cited | 264 |
| | |
| <i>List of Contributors</i> | 267 |
| <i>SCOPE Series List</i> | 271 |
| <i>SCOPE Executive Committee 2001–2004</i> | 275 |
| <i>Index</i> | 277 |