

EVIDENCE AND EVOLUTION

The logic behind the science

ELLIOTT SOBER



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>List of figures</i>	page	ix
<i>Preface</i>		xv
<i>Acknowledgements</i>		xix
1 Evidence		1
1.1 Royall's three questions		3
1.2 The ABCs of Bayesianism		8
1.3 Likelihoodism		32
1.4 Frequentism I: Significance tests and probabilistic <i>modus tollens</i>		48
1.5 Frequentism II: Neyman–Pearson hypothesis testing		58
1.6 A test case: Stopping rules		72
1.7 Frequentism III: Model-selection theory		78
1.8 A second test case: Reasoning about coincidences		104
1.9 Concluding comments		107
2 Intelligent design		109
2.1 Darwin and intelligent design		109
2.2 Design arguments and the birth of probability theory		113
2.3 William Paley: The stone, the watch, and the eye		118
2.4 From probabilities to likelihoods		120
2.5 Epicureanism and Darwin's theory		122
2.6 Three reactions to Paley's design argument		125
2.7 The no-designer-worth-his-salt objection to the hypothesis of intelligent design		126
2.8 Popper's criterion of falsifiability		129
2.9 Sharpening the likelihood argument		131
2.10 The principle of total evidence		136
2.11 Some strengths of the likelihood formulation of the design argument		139

2.12	The Achilles heel of the likelihood argument	141
2.13	Paley's stone	147
2.14	Testability	148
2.15	The relationship of the organismic design argument to Darwinism	154
2.16	The relationship of Paley's design argument to contemporary intelligent-design theory	154
2.17	The relationship of the design argument to the argument from evil	164
2.18	The design argument as an inductive sampling argument	167
2.19	Model selection and intelligent design	177
2.20	The politics and legal status of the intelligent-design hypothesis	184
2.21	Darwinism, theism, and religion	186
2.22	A prediction	188
3	Natural selection	189
3.1	Selection plus drift (SPD) versus pure drift (PD)	192
3.2	Comparing the likelihoods of the SPD and PD hypotheses	199
3.3	Filling in the blanks	201
3.4	What if the fitness function of the SPD hypothesis contains a valley?	212
3.5	Selection versus drift for a dichotomous character	215
3.6	A breath of fresh air: Change the <i>explanandum</i>	219
3.7	Model selection and unification	226
3.8	Reichenbach's principle of the common cause	230
3.9	Testing selection against drift with molecular data	235
3.10	Selection versus phylogenetic inertia	243
3.11	The chronological test	253
3.12	Concluding comments	261
4	Common ancestry	264
4.1	<i>Modus Darwin</i>	265
4.2	What the common ancestry hypothesis asserts	268
4.3	A Bayesian decomposition	275
4.4	A single character: Species matching and species mismatching	277
4.5	More than one character	294
4.6	Concluding comments on the evidential significance of similarity	310
4.7	Evidence other than similarity	314
4.8	Phylogenetic inference: The contest between likelihood and cladistic parsimony	332
	<i>Conclusion</i>	353
	<i>Bibliography</i>	368
	<i>Index</i>	385