

The Arab-Israeli Conflict

A Politico-Legal Analysis

J. R. GAINSBOROUGH LL.M, M.PHIL (CANTAB)
*Senior Lecturer in Law,
City of Birmingham Polytechnic*

Gower

Contents

Documents and Maps	xv
Preface	xvii
Acknowledgements	xxi
Table of Treaties	xxiii
Table of Instruments	xxvi
Table of Cases	xxix
Abbreviations	xxxii

1	DEVELOPMENTS IN PALESTINE UNTIL APRIL 1947: THE HISTORICAL AND LEGAL CLAIMS OF THE CONTESTING PARTIES	1
	Introduction	1
	Brief history of the inhabitants of Palestine: the rise of Zionism until World War I	3
	Pledges made by the United Kingdom to both Arabs and Jews during World War I	4
	McMahon-Hussein Correspondence 1915-16	5
	The Balfour Declaration 1917	5
	Postwar settlements and the establishment of the Palestine Mandate	6
	Establishment of the League of Nations	7
	Treaty of Lausanne	9
	Terms of the Palestine Mandate	10
	The Legality of the Palestine Mandate	10
	The beneficiaries under the Mandate and the extent thereof	12
	The location of sovereignty in the Palestine Mandate	13
	Major events in Palestine during the period of the Mandate until the outbreak of World War II	14
	Report of the Peel Commission 1937	16
	The White Paper of 1939	17
	Events in Palestine during and after World War II until 1947	18
2	THE UNITED NATIONS SEEKS A SOLUTION	27
	Introduction	27

United Kingdom hands Palestine problem over to United Nations	29
Problem of the agenda	29
Formation of UNSCOP	30
The positions adopted by the interested parties in the hearing before UNSCOP	31
The UNSCOP report	31
The approach taken by the General Assembly to UNSCOP's recommendations	33
The Partition Resolution	34
The passing of the Partition Resolution	34
Legality of Partition Resolution	35
The Arab incursions before expiry of Mandate: inaction of the Security Council	37
3 THE PALESTINE WAR: ISRAEL'S WAR OF INDEPENDENCE 1948-49	43
Introduction	43
Termination of Mandate and the Arab armed attack	44
The first two cease-fire resolutions: the Bernadotte proposals	45
The Bunche mediation	47
The Armistice Agreements and the Lausanne Protocol	50
The fate of the remainder of Palestine not under Israeli occupation	52
Legal considerations relating to the use of force in the Palestine War and the subsequent annexation of territory by Israel	53

	The legality of the Arab states' attack on Israel in 1948	53
	Israel's right to the territories acquired in excess of those allocated to it in the Partition Resolution	55
4	THE SINAI CAMPAIGN	62
	Introduction	62
	Causes of the Sinai Campaign	65
	Border incidents between Egypt and Israel and restrictions on Israel's use of the Suez Canal	66
	Ineffective role of the United Nations 1950-56	69
	Nasser's reasons for nationalisation	70
	Anglo-French-Israeli collusion	71
	Events from 29 October to 5 November 1956	73
	The establishment of UNEF	76
	From cease-fire to Israel's withdrawal	78
	The legality of the use of force in the Sinai Campaign under the UN Charter and according to customary international law	81
	Validity of Israel's claim to a right of self-defence against previous fedayeen attacks	82
	The relationship of reprisals to self-defence	87
	Determination of the aggressor	91
	Egyptian border incursions and the Sinai Campaign contrary to the Israel-Egypt Armistice Agreement of 1949	94

Closure of the Suez Canal to Israeli shipping	98
Legal status of the Canal	99
The legality of the restrictions imposed on Israeli shipping	100
Restrictions on freedom of navigation in the Straits of Tiran and the Gulf of Agaba	103
Israel's case for freedom of navigation	104
Egypt's case for restriction of navigation	105
Relevance of the 1949 Armistice Agreement and the Security Council resolution of 1951	105
The relevance of customary international law to Israel's freedom of navigation	107
Was the Gulf of Aqaba an historic bay?	108
Conclusion	109
5 THE JUNE (SIX DAY) WAR OF 1967	126
Introduction	126
Causes of the Six Day War	129
Events preceding the war	130
Events from the outbreak of the 1967 War until adoption by the United Nations of Resolution 242	134
Details of operations	134
United Nations activity from the outbreak of the war	136
The road to Resolution 242: the importance of this resolution	139

The legality of the use of force in the 1967 conflict	140
Israel's claim to exercise self-defence	140
The Arab claim that Israel did not act in self-defence	146
Whether Israel's measures were justified in the circumstances	148
Gulf of Agaba and Straits of Tiran: relevant legal issues arising therefrom	149
Alleged state of belligerency	149
Effect of the Geneva Convention of 1958 on the status of the Straits of Tiran and the Gulf of Aqaba	151
Possible legal justification for use of force against the blockade	153
Legal consequences arising out of the 1967 conflict	154
Effect and relevance of Resolution 242	155
The nature of Israel's occupation of the territories acquired in 1967	158
The problem of withdrawal	162
The apparent failure of the United Nations to perform its functions	164
6 THE OCTOBER WAR OF 1973	180
Introduction	180
Causes of the October War	183
Fighting along the Canal	184
Failure of Gunnar Jarring's Peace Mission	184

Failure by Egypt to secure Israel's withdrawal without the aid of the superpowers	185
Events from outbreak of the war until the end of October	187
Details of the war	187
Attempts to secure a cease-fire	188
Moves towards peace	189
An examination of the legality of the use of force by Egypt and Syria to recover the occupied territories	191
Use of force exercised by third states to recover territory on behalf of a people's right to exercise their right to self-determination	191
Egypt's and Syria's right, if any, to resort to force to recover their respective lost territories	193
Claim by Egypt and Syria that their attack was justified because of Israel's continuing aggression	198
The possible justification of the resort to force by Egypt and Syria on the basis of Paragraph 10 of the Declaration on Friendly Relations of 1970	200
Conclusion	200
7 THE CAMP DAVID AGREEMENTS	208
Introduction	208
Events leading to Camp David and the Egyptian-Israeli Peace Treaty	209
The terms of the Camp David Agreements and the Egyptian-Israeli Peace Treaty and their importance	211

	Implementation of the Treaty Framework and the Treaty of Washington	211
	Egypt's binding obligations under the Treaty and the problem of conflict with its other treaty obligations	212
	Terms and effects of 'a Framework for Peace in the Middle East': Gaza and the West Bank	212
	Problem of the autonomy plan for the Palestinians	214
	Obstacles to progress of future autonomy talks under the Camp David Framework for Peace by Israel's resort to the use of force in the occupied territories	216
8	THE WAR IN LEBANON 1982	223
	Introduction	223
	Causes of the Lebanon War and events preceding it	226
	Events of the war and its aftermath	228
	Phase one	228
	Phase two	229
	Major legal issues involved in the war of 1982	234
	State responsibility for acts of the PLO	234
	Use of force exercised by Israel	235
	The Israeli operations and the interna- tional law of armed conflict	236
	Legal responsibility for the Sabra and Shatila massacres	237
	Israel's occupation of Lebanon	238

9	A SUMMARY OF THE MAIN LEGAL ISSUES RELATING TO THE USE OF FORCE ARISING OUT OF THE ARAB-ISRAELI CONFLICT	243
	Introduction	243
	The effect of Articles 2(4) and 51	243
	Regional arrangements	247
	Humanitarian intervention	247
	National liberation struggles	248
	Reprisals	248
	State of war	248
	Relevance of the Armistice Agreements of 1949	249
10	PROBLEMS AFFECTING A SOLUTION OF THE ARAB-ISRAELI CONFLICT	252
	Introduction	252
	Palestinian self-determination	255
	Territorial problems and Palestinian statehood	256
	Israeli and Arab reactions to the establishment of a Palestinian state	257
11	PROPOSED GUIDELINES FOR A FINAL SETTLEMENT OF THE ARAB-ISRAELI CONFLICT	259
	Introduction	259
	Annexation of the West Bank and Gaza	260
	Disadvantages of plan	261
	Advantages of plan	261

The Jordanian Option	262
Disadvantages of plan	263
Advantages of plan	264
Independent Palestinian state of the West Bank and Gaza	264
Disadvantages of plan	265
Advantages of plan	266
United Nations Strategic Trusteeship	266
Long lasting peace: a dream or reality?	267
Appendices	271
I Documents	273
II Maps	303
Bibliography	319
Index	335