

Appraising Economic Theories

Studies in the Methodology
of Research Programs

Edited by

Neil de Marchi

Professor of Economics, Duke University

*Professor of the History and Methodology of Economics,
University of Amsterdam*

and

Mark Blaug

Professor Emeritus, University of London

Consultant Professor, University of Buckingham

Visiting Professor, University of Exeter

Edward Elgar

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	viii
<i>Acknowledgement</i>	ix
Introduction: Rethinking Lakatos Neil de Marchi	1
PART I THE CRITERION OF EMPIRICAL PROGRESS IN ECONOMICS	
A Theoretical Progress and Excess Content	
1 Popper, Lakatos and Theoretical Progress in Economics <i>Jeremy Shearmur</i>	35
Comment <i>Kurt Klappholz</i>	53
2 The Problem of Excess Content: Economics, Novelty and a Long Popperian Tale <i>D. Wade Hands</i>	58
Comment <i>Bert Hamminga</i>	76
Comment <i>Uskali Mäki</i>	85
Reply <i>D. Wade Hands</i>	91
B Testing	
3 Testing in Modern Economics: the Case of Job Search Theory <i>Jinbang Kim</i>	105
Comment <i>Neil de Marchi</i>	132
4 Do Economists Test Theories? – Demand Analysis and Consumption Analysis as Tests of Theories of Economic Methodology <i>Christopher L. Gilbert</i>	137

	Comment	169
	<i>Marjorie B. McElroy</i>	
C	Empirical Hypotheses in Game Theory and Experimental Economics	
5	Strategic Interactions in Economics: the Game Theoretic Alternative	179
	<i>Marina Bianchi and Hervé Moulin</i>	
6	Lakatos and Experimental Economics	197
	<i>Vernon L. Smith, Kevin A. McCabe and Stephen J. Rassenti</i>	
	Comment	227
	<i>H.M. Collins</i>	
PART II PROGRAM IDENTIFICATION AND PROGRAM RIVALRY		
A	On Including and Excluding Lines of Enquiry	
7	The Stamping Out of Process Analysis in Econometrics	237
	<i>Mary Morgan</i>	
	Comment	266
	<i>Roger E. Backhouse</i>	
	Reply	270
	<i>Mary Morgan</i>	
8	Stabilizing Dynamics	273
	<i>E. Roy Weintraub</i>	
	Comment	291
	<i>Philip Mirowski</i>	
9	Alternative Accounts of Equilibrium Unemployment	294
	<i>Rod Cross</i>	
	Comment	324
	<i>Mark Blaug</i>	
	Comment	327
	<i>J.A. Kregel</i>	
B	Delineating Programs	
10	The Development of New Classical Macroeconomics: Lessons for Lakatos	335
	<i>Rodney Maddock</i>	
	Comment	360
	<i>Alessandro Vercelli</i>	

11	Scientific Research Program or Tribe? A Joint Appraisal of Lakatos and the New Classical Macroeconomics	364
	<i>Kevin D. Hoover</i>	
	Comment	395
	<i>Nancy J. Wulwick</i>	
	Reply	401
	<i>Kevin D. Hoover</i>	
12	The Neo-Walrasian Research Program in Macroeconomics	403
	<i>Roger E. Backhouse</i>	
	Comment	427
	<i>Maarten C.W. Janssen</i>	
C Assessing Sraffian and Austrian Economics		
13	Negative and Positive Contributions: Appraising Sraffa and Lakatos	435
	<i>Ian Steedman</i>	
	Comment	451
	<i>Stefano Zamagni</i>	
	Comment	456
	<i>Edwin Burmeister</i>	
14	The Progress of Subjectivism	470
	<i>Don Lavoie</i>	
	Comment	487
	<i>Bruce J. Caldwell</i>	
15	History and Sociology of Science and History and Methodology of Economics	492
	<i>H.M. Collins</i>	
16	Afterword	499
	<i>Mark Blaug</i>	
	<i>Bibliography</i>	513
	<i>Name Index</i>	557
	<i>Subject Index</i>	563