

THE SAMOA READER

Anthropologists Take Stock

**Edited by
Hiram Caton**

**UNIVERSITY
PRESS OF
AMERICA**



Lanham • New York • London

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
Introduction	1
Chapter I	
Theory: For and Against Cultural Determinism	15
The Problem Stated	
Peggy Reeves Sanday	
•Mead's Views about Natural and Cultural Influences on Sex Roles	16
Daniel E. Koshland, Jr.	
•Nature, Nurture and Behavior	24
George Peter Murdock	
•Anthropology's Mythology	26
Robert I. Levy	
•Vindication of Anthropology	32
Colleen D. Clements	
•Criticism of Levy	33
For the Autonomy of Culture	
Alfred Kroeber	
•Eighteen Professions	36
Ivan Brady	
•Speaking in the Name of the Real	42
Clifford Geertz	
•The Impact of the Concept of Culture on the Concept of Man	45
Roy A. Rappaport	
•Cultural Anthropology and Biology	56

Contents viii

Against Cultural Determinism

- Robin Fox
•The Disunity of Anthropology
and the Unity of Mankind 62
- J. Timothy O'Meara
•Anthropology as Anti-Science 68
- George N. Appell
•The Significance of Freeman's Refutation 79
- Derek Freeman
•Inductivism and the Test of Truth 80

Evaluations

- Jeannette Mageo
•Mālosi: A Psychological
Exploration of Mead's and Freeman's
Work and of Samoan Aggression 84
- Hiram Caton
•Freeman's Quest
for an Interactionist Anthropology 98

Chapter II Method and Ethnography

- Margaret Mead
•*Coming of Age* Defended 113
- Margaret Mead
•Queries to Boas on Method 119
- Marvin Harris
•Mead's Configurationalism 122
- Nancy McDowell
•The Reliability of Mead's Oceanic Ethnography 125
- Lola Romanucci-Ross
Mead as Ethnographer and Mythmaker 128

Lowell D. Holmes	
•A Tale of Two Studies	133
Richard Goodman	
•Laughter and Anger: On Samoan Aggression	135
Roy A. Rappaport	
•A Criticism of Falsification	142
Allan Patience and Joseph Wayne Smith	
•The Limits of Popperian Metascience	145
Derek Freeman	
•Rejoinder to Patience and Smith	150
Derek Freeman	
•Inductivism and Refutation	153
Coda	
Hiram Caton	
•Did Margaret Mead Speak Samoan?	158
<i>The Samoa Times</i>	
•Mead Was Teased; Was She Duped?	162
Chapter III	
History of Anthropology	
Introduction	165
Eric A. Wolf	
•The Anthropology of Liberal Reform	168
Margaret Mead	
•South Seas Hints on Bringing Up Children	169
Alexander Lesser	
•Franz Boas:	
The Founder of American Anthropology	177
Leslie A. White	
•Franz Boas and the Boasian School	182

Contents x

Derek Freeman •Historical Glosses	191
Derek Freeman •My Relations with Margaret Mead	201
Chapter IV The Controversy	
Hiram Caton •What the Fighting Was About	205
Edwin McDowell •New Samoa Book Challenges Margaret Mead's Conclusions	211
Sir Edmund Leach, Annette B. Weiner •Media Sensationalism	217
Richard Basham •Anthropology's Adolescent Dilemma	218
Roy A. Rappaport •The Oracle Profaned	221
Lowell D. Holmes •A Sad Day for Anthropology	225
Bob von Sternberg •The Dangers of Freeman's Book	226
•Two Resolutions	228
Robert A. Paul •Comment on the American Anthropological Association Resolution	229
Cheryl M. Fields •The Barnard College Symposium	230

Marvin Harris •Margaret and the Giant-Killer	233
Mary Lefkowitz •Saint Margaret	241
Sir Edmund Leach •Middle American	245
Roy A. Rappaport •The Samoa Myth as an American Legend	247
S. D. Cornell •Why Didn't You Warn Us?	253
Thomas Bargatzky •Examination of Holmes' <i>Quest</i>	255
Derek Freeman •Letter to G. E. Marcus	265
Chapter V Professional Ethics	
Introduction	267
Richard Basham •Denunciation at Berkeley	272
Phyllis Grosskurth •Astonishing Behavior	273
Richard A. Goodman •Something's Rotten in Anthropology	274
George N. Appell •The Discouragement of Criticism	275
Ivan Brady •The Fairness of <i>American Anthropologist</i> Editing	276
Derek Freeman •My Dealings with Holmes	279

Contents xii

Bradd Shore	
•Evaluations of <i>Margaret Mead and Samoa</i>	282
Derek Freeman and Alexander Kohn	
•From the Freeman—Kohn Correspondence	286
Jeannette Mageo	
•Response to Derek Freeman	295
Hiram Caton	
•Truth Management in the Sciences	300
Chapter VI	
Documents	309
W. E. H. Stanner and Derek Freeman	
•Freeman's Conception of his Samoa Research, 1966-1967	310
Lowell D. Holmes and Derek Freeman	
•From the Holmes—Freeman Correspondence	315
Lola Romanucci-Ross	
Mead Recognizes Her Error	323
Anonymous	
•Referee's Report on <i>Margaret Mead and Samoa</i>	324
Derek Freeman	
•Clarification on Sociobiology	326
Bibliography	333
Index	347