

External Finance and Adjustment

**Failure and Success in the Developing
World**

Edited by

Karel Jansen

*Associate Professor
Institute of Social Studies, The Hague*

and

Rob Vos

*Senior Economist
Inter-American Development Bank, Washington, DC
and
Senior Lecturer
Institute of Social Studies, The Hague*



in association with
INSTITUTE OF SOCIAL STUDIES

Contents

<i>List of Tables and Figures</i>	xiii
<i>Series Editor's Introduction</i>	xix
<i>Editors' Preface</i>	xxiv
1 International Finance, Growth and Adjustment: An Introduction	1
<i>Karel Jansen and E.V.K. FitzGerald</i>	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background	8
1.3 The Role of External Capital in Economic Development	11
1.4 Approach of the Study and Summary of Findings	15
1.4.1 Methodology	17
1.4.2 Comparison to other studies	16
1.4.3 Main findings	22
1.5 Outline of the Book	29
Notes	32
2 External Finance and Structural Change	33
<i>Rob Vos</i>	
2.1 Introduction	33
2.2 Structure, Markets and Institutions	35
2.2.1 The accounting framework	35
2.2.2 Structural change	37
2.2.3 Savings and income distribution	43
2.2.4 Financial development and investment	48

2.3	External Finance and Economic Structure: Simulation Results Using MSAF-based CGE Models	57
	Notes	61
3	External Shocks and Domestic Adjustment in the 1970s and 1980s	63
	<i>E.V.K. FitzGerald and Khwaja Sarmad</i>	
3.1	Exogenous Shocks and Structural Adjustment	63
3.2	A Methodology for Estimating External Shocks and Domestic Responses	65
3.3	The Nature of the External Shocks Experienced by LDCs	68
3.4	External Shocks and Individual Economies	74
3.5	Domestic Response to External Shock	75
3.6	Conclusions	86
	Notes	88
4	External Finance, Investment and Growth	90
	<i>Karel Jansen</i>	
4.1	Introduction	90
4.2	The Public Sector Loan Boom	95
	4.2.1 Public sector response to capital inflows: Theoretical considerations	96
	4.2.2 Public sector response: A comprehensive view	100
	4.2.3 Patterns of public sector adjustment: A mixed experience	102
4.3	Private Investment	110
	4.3.1 Private investment under structural adjustment	112
	4.3.2 Private investment in the case study countries	115
4.4	Conclusion	118
	Notes	120

5	Incomplete Adjustment: Fiscal Policy, Private Savings and Current Account Deficits in Mexico since 1982	121
	<i>Angeles Calderón-Madrid</i>	
5.1	Introduction	121
5.2	Crisis and Recovery	123
	5.2.1 Background to the 1982 crisis	123
	5.2.2 The orthodox stabilization attempts of 1982–87	125
	5.2.3 Successful heterodox stabilization in 1987–92	129
5.3	Macroeconomic Adjustment Policy During the Stabilization Programmes	131
	5.3.1 Fiscal adjustment and debt management	131
	5.3.2 The problem of speculative attacks on the balance of payments	135
	5.3.3 Exchange and interest rate management during the heterodox programme	138
5.4	Private Sector Behaviour Under the Heterodox Programme	141
	5.4.1 Current account deficits and fiscal surpluses	141
	5.4.2 Private savings and the consumption boom	143
	5.4.3 Private sector portfolio adjustment	144
5.5	The Implications for Macroeconomic Policy	146
	Postscript: Determinants of the Exchange Rate Crisis of 1994	148
	Notes	153
6	External Shocks and Domestic Adjustment in Pakistan	157
	<i>Khwaja Sarmad</i>	
6.1	Introduction	157
6.2	A Historical Perspective	158
	Period I (1970–77)	161
	Period II (1978–86)	163
	Period III (1987–90)	165
6.3	The Links with the Outside World	167
	The burden of external debt	172

6.4	Capital Accounts of Institutional Agents and the Flow of Funds	173
6.4.1	Savings and investment	173
	Period I (1970–77)	173
	Period IIa (1978–81)	175
	Period IIb (1982–86)	175
	Period III (1987–90)	175
6.4.2	Capital flight or net acquisition of external private assets	176
6.4.3	Flow of funds	179
6.5	Conclusion	186
	Notes	188
7	The Philippines: Finance Without Development	190
	<i>Josef Yap and Rob Vos</i>	
7.1	Introduction	190
7.2	External Finance and Growth	192
7.3	Political Economy and Adjustment Policies	198
	The 1970–74 Regime	198
	The 1975–79 Regime	202
	The 1980–82 Regime	205
	The 1983–85 Regime	208
	The New Regime: 1986–93	210
	The political economy of external debt management	214
7.4	Private Sector Adjustment and Emerging Policy Dilemmas	216
	Private and public accumulation behaviour	216
	Emerging policy dilemmas	222
	The fiscal bind and a reassessment of the debt management strategy	224
7.5	Conclusions	226
	On policy effectiveness	226
	On the role of external finance	227
	Policy implications	229
	Notes	232

8	Imports, Investment and Aid in Tanzania	234
	<i>Joshua Doriye, Howard White and Marc Wuyts</i>	
8.1	Introduction	234
8.2	Capital Inflows to Tanzania	234
8.3	Accounting for Aid in the Tanzanian Economy	237
8.4	Impact of Aid on Economic Development	244
8.5	Policy Changes Under Two Aid Booms	251
8.5	Conclusions	257
	Notes	258
9	External Finance and Adjustment in Thailand	260
	<i>Karel Jansen</i>	
9.1	Introduction	260
9.2	External Shocks	261
9.3	Policy Regimes	271
	9.3.1 Development strategy	271
	9.3.2 Adjustment policies	273
	9.3.3 Policy regimes	285
9.4	Conclusion	293
	Notes	298
10	External Dependence, Structural Adjustment and Development Aid in Sub-Saharan Africa	300
	<i>Rolph van der Hoeven</i>	
10.1	Introduction	300
10.2	The Continuous Need for External Resources	301
10.3	Trade in the Context of Structural Change	305
	10.3.1 African trade during the crisis years	305
	10.3.2 Trade policies for structural change	310
10.4	Debt in the Context of Structural Change	313
	10.4.1 The growing mountain of debt	313

10.4.2	How much debt reduction is needed in Africa?	315
10.5	Structural Adjustment and Aid Flows	319
10.5.1	The magnitude of aid	319
10.5.2	Effects of aid on development	321
10.5.3	Development aid and structural change	325
11	External Finance and Adjustment Policies: A Comparative General Equilibrium Analysis	327
	<i>Rob Vos</i>	
11.1	Introduction	327
11.2	Main Characteristics of the Country Models	331
	Investment, savings and portfolio behaviour	331
	Output and price adjustment and income distribution	335
	Policy variables	338
11.3	Model Calibration	339
11.4	Simulation Results	342
	Mexico	342
	Pakistan	347
	The Philippines	351
	Thailand	355
11.5	Conclusions	359
	Notes	362
12	Structural Adjustment and Economic Recovery: A Comparative Analysis of Economic Policy	365
	<i>Karel Jansen</i>	
12.1	Introduction	365
12.2	Towards a Framework for Policy Analysis	367
	12.2.1 External shocks and adjustment policy	368
	12.2.2 External finance and adjustment policy	370
	12.2.3 Instruments of adjustment policy	371
12.3	Policy Regimes	380
12.4	Policy Effectiveness	383
	The contribution of public sector reform	383

Financial policy and the financing of the public sector deficit	385
Exchange rate policy and export performance	388
The role of the private sector	390
12.5 Conclusion	392
Notes	396
Appendices	397
A1 Appendix to Chapter 1 The Country Sample and Country Group Classification	398
A2 Appendix to Chapter 2 A Macroeconomic Social Accounting Framework (MSAF)	400
A3 Appendix to Chapter 3 A Methodology for Estimating Shock and Response	417
The UNCTAD Methodology	417
The 'Residual'	420
Domestic Absorption	422
Notes	423
A11 Appendix to Chapter 11 A CGE Model for the Philippines	
Basic Notation	425
Model Equations	426
Supply Demand Balances	427
Price Equation for all Sectors	427
Corporate and Unincorporated Capital	427
Output and Price Adjustment	427
Income Distribution	429
Rates of Return per Type of Asset	430
Accumulation Balances for all Sectors	432
Household Behaviour	434
Private Firm Behaviour	435
Public Enterprise Behaviour	436
Government Accounts	437
Public Financial Institutions	438
Private Financial Institutions	438
Central Bank	439
External Balance	439

Budget-Constrained Investment Demand	440
Changes in Commodity Stocks	442
Labour Market	443
List of Variables	444
References	450
Index	469

List of Tables and Figures

Tables

2.1	Income growth and structural change	38
2.2	Savings, investment and growth	39
2.3	Income structure and savings rates	44
2.4	Income inequality	46
2.5	Financial development and investment finance (per cent)	52
2.6	Financial development and investment finance (per cent)	54
3.1	External shock by country group	70
3.2	Classification of countries by major shocks (>1.5 per cent of GDP)	72
3.3a	Decomposition of changes in current account deficit: Mexico (period averages as percentage of the average GDP of the end period)	76
3.3b	Decomposition of changes in current account deficit: Pakistan (period averages as percentage of the average GDP of the end period)	78
3.3c	Decomposition of changes in current account deficit: Philippines (period averages as percentage of the average GDP of the end period)	79
3.3d	Decomposition of changes in current account deficit: Tanzania (period averages as percentage of the average GDP of the end period)	80
3.3e	Decomposition of changes in current account deficit: Thailand (period averages as percentage of the average GDP of the end period)	81
3.4	Domestic response to external shock	82
4.1	External finance and domestic accumulation (as percentage of GDP)	92
4.2	External finance and growth, regression results	94

4.3	Accumulation balances (as percentage of GDP)	105
4.4	External debt outstanding, by borrowing economic sector, 1982 (percentage distribution)	108
4.5	Private investment, regression results	116
5.1	The flow of funds, 1964–88 (as percentage of GDP)	126
5.2	Trade liberalization 1985–90	128
5.3	Components of GDP (per cent)	142
6.1	Selected economic indicators for Pakistan (averages)	160
6.2	The balance of payments of Pakistan (period averages) (US\$ millions)	168
6.3	Long-term debt by source (US\$ billions)	171
6.4	Capital accounts of the public and private sectors (period averages, percentage of GDP)	174
6.5	Estimates of the private foreign asset accumulation (US\$ millions)	178
6.6	Gross savings, real investment and net financial investment of institutional sectors (Rs millions)	181
6.7	Use of financial resources by households and unincorporated enterprises (percentage distribution)	182
6.8	Consolidated fiscal balances of the federal and provincial governments (percentage of GDP)	184
7.1	Financial flows to the Philippines: 1970–90 (period averages in US\$ millions)	194
7.2	Philippine external debt, 1970–92 (US\$ millions)	194
7.3	Major economic shocks and policy responses in the Philippines	196
7.4	Selected economic indicators of the Philippines, 1970–92	200
7.5	Philippines: External debt outstanding by borrowing economic sector (percentage shares)	203
7.6	Central Bank of the Philippines: Income and Outlay Statement (percentage of GNP)	212
7.7	Philippines: Net savings by institutional agent, 1970–92 (percentage of GNP)	217
7.8	Main determinants of private and public accumulation behaviour	218
7.9	Philippines: Structure of government expenditure (percentage share)	225
8.1	Structure of external debt in 1991	236
8.2	Financing of imports of goods and services (percentage of total imports)	240

8.3	Composition of gross investment (GFCF)	245
8.4	Composition and pattern of output growth, 1967-91 (sector weighted annual growth rates)	246
8.5	Composition of imports, 1967-90 (percentage of total imports)	250
9.1	Main economic indicators	261
9.2	Sectoral accumulation balances (period averages as percentage of GDP)	266
9.3	Policy variables, 1970-92	274
10.1	Exports, imports (indexes) and debt service ratios, sub-Saharan Africa	302
10.2	Major resource flows in sub-Saharan Africa (as percentage of GDP unless otherwise indicated)	
10.3	The changing pattern of African imports	307
10.4	Percentage share of major export items from sub-Saharan Africa	308
10.5	Real wage trends in manufacturing in sub-Saharan Africa, 1978 - end 1980s (1978 = 100)	309
10.6	Debt and debt service obligations for some African countries (US\$ millions)	314
10.7	Sub-Saharan African debt (US\$ billions)	316
10.8	Aid flows to and exports from sub-Saharan Africa (in current US\$ millions)	320
11.1	Binding constraints on investment by agent in the base runs for the CGE models for Mexico, Pakistan, the Philippines and Thailand	341
A1	Country sample	399
A2.1	MSAF (Macroeconomic Social Accounting Framework): The Concepts	402
A2.2	MSAF - Tanzania 1976 (millions of shillings)	403
A2.3	Macroeconomic Social Accounting Framework for Pakistan, 1984 (billions of rupees)	404
A2.4	MSAF for the Philippines, 1987	406
A2.5	MSAF for Thailand 1989 (billions of baht)	410
A2.6	MSAF for Mexico, 1990 (billions of new pesos)	414

Figures

1.1	Net transfers to LDCs, 1970–91 (US\$ billions)	2
1.2	Net transfers on main types of financial flows to LDCs, 1970–91 (US\$ billions)	4
2.1a	Financial intermediation ratio (M3/M1)	49
2.1b	Financial intermediation ratio (M3/GDP)	50
2.2	Model simulation: Effect of increase in capital inflows (1 per cent of GDP) on total GDP (index; deviation from baseline)	58
2.3	Model simulation: Effect of increase in capital inflows (1 per cent of GDP) on total exports (index; deviation from baseline)	59
2.4	Model simulation: Effect of increase capital inflow (1 per cent of GDP) on private investment volume (index; deviation from baseline)	60
3.1	External shocks and domestic spending adjustment, 1983–89 (percentage of GNP)	83
3.2	External shocks and trade ratio adjustment, 1983–89 (percentage of GNP)	83
3.3	External shocks and export penetration, 1983–89 (percentage of GNP)	84
3.4	External shocks and import replacement, 1983–89 (percentage of GNP)	84
4.1	Public sector response model	101
5.1	Fiscal and current account deficits (percentage of GDP)	124
5.2	Public finance indicators (excludes revenue from privatization) (percentage of GDP)	132
5.3	Interest payments on public debt and the inflation tax (percentage of GDP)	133
5.4	Consolidated total public debt (includes Central Bank) (percentage of GDP)	134
5.5	GDP per capita (thousands of new Mexican pesos at constant prices of 1980) and inflation (percentage)	139
5.6	Exchange rate risk premium (percentage)	140
5.7	Net foreign financial debt and household assets abroad (US\$ billions)	144
5.8	Household sector real interest payments to commercial banks (percentage share of household disposable income)	150

7.1	Philippines: Public and private investment (billions of pesos at constant prices of 1985)	221
8.1	Real total inflows, 1970–91 (1987 US\$ millions)	235
8.2	Aids and imports, 1970–91 (constant 1987 TSh millions)	238
8.3	Capacity to import (indices, 1970 = 100)	241
8.4	Aid and investment, 1970–91 (1987 TShs millions)	242
8.5	Savings and investment rates (ratio to GDP, current prices)	243
8.6	Import volume (constant 1987 TShs thousands)	248
9.1a	External finance and the internal gap (percentage of GDP)	263
9.1b	External finance and the external gap (percentage of GDP)	264
9.2	Public sector debt (percentage of GDP)	287
9.3	Crowding in or out? (investment ratios as percentage of GDP)	289
11.1a	Mexico: Fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, total GDP (index; deviation from baseline)	344
11.1b	Mexico: Fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, traded-goods GDP (index; deviation from baseline)	344
11.1c	Mexico: Fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, private fixed investment (volume) (index; deviation from baseline)	345
11.1d	Mexico: Fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, fiscal balance (percentage of GDP)	345
11.2a	Pakistan: Debt relief, fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, total GDP (index; deviation from baseline)	348
11.2b	Pakistan: Debt relief, fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, GDP of traded-goods sector (index; deviation from baseline)	348
11.2c	Pakistan: Debt relief, fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, private fixed investment (volume) (index; deviation from baseline)	349
11.2d	Pakistan: Debt relief, fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, fiscal balance (percentage of GDP)	349
11.3a	Philippines: Debt relief, fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, total GDP (index; deviation from baseline)	352
11.3b	Philippines: Debt relief, fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, traded-goods GDP (index; deviation from baseline)	352
11.3c	Philippines: Debt relief, fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, private fixed investment (index; deviation from baseline)	353
11.3d	Philippines: Debt relief, fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, fiscal balance (percentage of GDP)	353

11.4a	Thailand: Debt relief, fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, total GDP (index; deviation from baseline)	357
11.4b	Thailand: Debt relief, fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, traded-goods GDP (index; deviation from baseline)	357
11.4c	Thailand: Debt relief, fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, private fixed investment (index; deviation from baseline)	358
11.4d	Thailand: Debt relief, fiscal adjustment and the exchange rate, fiscal balance (percentage of GDP)	358
12.1	Real exchange rate (index, 1970 = 100)	374
12.2	Export volume (index, 1970 = 1)	376
12.3	Inflation rates (CPI, percentage per year)	377