EXPERTS IN UNCERTAINTY

Opinion and Subjective Probability in Science

ROGER M. COOKE

New York Oxford
OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
1991

Contents

Introduction, xi

PART I EXPERTS AND OPINIONS

1. Think Tanks and Oracles, 3
   - Background, 4
   - The RAND Corporation, 5
   - Herman Kahn, 6
   - Scenario analysis, 10
   - The Delphi method, 12
   - Conclusions: Toward a methodology for expert opinion, 17
2. Expert Opinion in Practice, 19
   - The Aerospace sector, 19
   - Military intelligence, 23
   - Probabilistic risk analysis, 27
   - Policy analysis, 41
3. Probabilistic Thinking, 47
   - Thinking, 47
   - Representing uncertainty in artificial intelligence, 50
   - Fuzziness, 59
   - Conclusion, 61
4. Heuristics and Biases, 63
   - Availability, 64
   - Anchoring, 65
   - Representativeness, 66
   - Control, 68
   - The base rate fallacy, 69
   - Overconfidence and calibration, 72
   - Conclusion, 78
5. Building rational consensus, 80
   - Rational consensus, 80
   - Principles, 81
   - Conclusion, 84

PART II SUBJECTIVE PROBABILITY

6. Savage's Normative Decision Theory, 87
The decision model, 88
The representation theorem, 91
Observation, 95
Supplement, 98

7. Relative Frequencies and Exchangeability, 108
The frequentist account of learning by experience, 109
Expected frequency, 110
Exchangeability, 110
De Finetti's finite representation theorem, 113
Supplement, 115

8. Elicitation and Scoring, 121
Elicitation, 122
Scoring, 125
Methodological problems, 133
Practical guidelines, 134

9. Scoring Rules for Evaluating and Weighing Assessments, 136
Improper scoring rules, 137
Scoring rules for individual variables, 138
Proper scoring rules for average probabilities, 141
Asymptotic properties, 145
A menu of weights, 147
Heuristics of weighing, 151
Supplement, 152

10. Two Experiments with Calibration and Entropy, 158
Calibration and knowledge; brief review of the literature, 158
The mechanical engineer experiment, 159
The managers experiment, 164
Conclusion, 168

PART III COMBINING EXPERT OPINIONS

11. Combining Expert Opinions; Review of the Literature, 171
Weighted combinations of probabilities, 171
Bayesian combinations, 176
Psychological scaling, 184
Conclusion, 186

12. The Classical Model, 187
Notation and definitions, 188
Basic model; uncertain events, 188
Basic model; continuous variables, 190
Variations and enhancements, 192
Issues, 194

Measuring and optimizing performance; virtual weights, 195
Correlation, 196
Conclusions, 197

13. The Bayesian Model, 199

Basic theory, 200
Notations and definitions, 201
The Mendel-Sheridan model; assumptions, 202
Evaluation of model performance via bilinear loss functions, 206
A partially exchangeable Bayesian model, 207
Conclusions, 210

14. Psychological Scaling Models: Paired Comparisons, 211

Generic issues, 211
Significant preference for one expert, 212
Significant preference for the set of experts, 213
The Thurstone model, 214
The Bradley-Terry model, 217
The negative exponential lifetime model, 219
Relation to principles for expert opinion in science, 220

15. Applications, 221

Applications of the classical model, 221
The Royal Dutch Meteorological study, 227
Bayesian analysis, 230
Flange connections at a process plant–paired comparisons, 237
Flange connections at a process plant–the classical model, 241
Supplement, 246

16. Conclusions, 268

Part I, 268
Part II, 269
Part III, 270

Appendix A. Mathematical Framework and Interpretation, 273

Mathematical framework, 273
Interpretation, 276
Conditional probability, independence, Bayes' theorem, 278
Expectation, moments, moment convergence, 279
Distributions, 280
Entropy, information, relative information, 282

Appendix B. Standard normal, inverse normal, Chi square, coefficient of agreement, coefficient of concordance, 285

References, 299

Author Index, 315
Subject Index, 319