

The Nuclear Arms Race Debated

Herbert M. Levine

David Carlton

McGraw-Hill Book Company

New York St. Louis San Francisco Auckland Bogotá Hamburg
Johannesburg London Madrid Mexico Montreal New Delhi
Panama Paris São Paulo Singapore Sydney Tokyo Toronto

Contents

Editors	x
List of Contributors	xi
Preface	xvii
Suggested Readings	xxi
Acronyms	xxiii
CHAPTER 1 The Nuclear Arms Race and World Politics	1
1 Is it improbable that we shall be able to live indefinitely with nuclear weapons?	11
YES Hans J. Morgenthau, "The Fallacy of Thinking Conventionally about Nuclear Weapons"	12
NO Harvard Nuclear Study Group (Albert Carnesale, Paul Doty, Stanley Hoffmann, Samuel P. Huntington, Joseph S. Nye, Jr., and Scott D. Sagan, "Living with Nuclear Weapons: Is There a Choice?")	18
Questions for Discussion	20
Suggested Readings	20

2	Is nuclear deterrence a bankrupt ideology?	21
YES	James A. Stegenga, "Nuclear Deterrence: Bankrupt Ideology"	22
NO	Caspar W. Weinberger, ["On Deterrence"]	35
	Questions for Discussion	38
	Suggested Readings	38
3	Is nuclear war likely to occur by accident?	39
YES	James E. Muller, "On Accidental Nuclear War"	40
NO	General James Hartinger, "Nuclear War by Accident—Is It Impossible?"	41
	Questions for Discussion	43
	Suggested Readings	43
4	Is it virtually certain that a major nuclear war would be followed by such devastating climatic changes as to constitute a global catastrophe?	45
YES	Anne Ehrlich, "Nuclear Winter"	46
NO	Caspar W. Weinberger, "The Potential Effects of Nuclear War on the Climate: A Report to the U.S. Congress"	54
	Questions for Discussion	61
	Suggested Readings	61
	CHAPTER 2 Nuclear Arms Limitation: General Principles	63
5	Is complete nuclear disarmament an unattainable dream?	71
YES	Hedley Bull, "Nuclear Disarmament"	72
NO	Jonathan Schell, "A Deliberate Policy"	75
	Questions for Discussion	78
	Suggested Readings	78
6	Is nuclear arms control harmful?	81
YES	George F. Will, "Why Arms Control Is Harmful"	82
NO	William Proxmire, "Why We Need Nuclear Arms Control"	83
	Questions for Discussion	85
	Suggested Readings	85
7	Are unilateral measures likely to promote a slowing down of the nuclear arms race?	87
YES	Herbert Scoville, Jr. "A Different Approach to Arms Control—Reciprocal Unilateral Restraint"	88

NO Philip Towle, "Unilateralism or Disarmament by Example"	91
Questions for Discussion	99
Suggested Readings	99
CHAPTER 3 Superpower Nuclear Arms Control: Some Prescriptions	101
8 Should SALT II have been ratified?	109
YES Paul C. Warnke, ["The Case for SALT II"]	110
NO Edward Rowny, ["The Case against SALT II"]	113
Questions for Discussion	122
Suggested Readings	122
9 Is a Comprehensive Test Ban Treaty desirable?	123
YES Hugh E. DeWitt, "Debate on a Comprehensive Nuclear Weapons Test Ban: Pro"	124
NO Robert B. Barker, "Debate on a Comprehensive Nuclear Weapons Test Ban: Con"	132
Questions for Discussion	136
Suggested Readings	136
10 Is a bilateral nuclear freeze desirable?	139
YES Edward Kennedy, ["Freeze Now!"]	140
NO David H. Petraeus, "What Is Wrong with a Nuclear Freeze?"	146
Questions for Discussion	158
Suggested Readings	158
CHAPTER 4 United States Nuclear Policy Options	159
11 Should the United States act on the principles of the U.S. Catholic Bishops' Pastoral Letter on War and Peace?	171
YES National Conference of Catholic Bishops on War and Peace, "The Challenge of Peace: God's Promise and Our Response." ("The Pastoral Letter on War and Peace")	172
NO Keith B. Payne, "The Bishops and Nuclear Weapons"	179
Questions for Discussion	184
Suggested Readings	184
12 Should the United States deploy the MX Missile?	185

YES Brent Scowcroft, "Report of the President's Commission on Strategic Forces"	186
NO Wyche Fowler, ["The Case against the MX"]	189
Questions for Discussion	195
Suggested Readings	195
13 Should the United States make civil defense a high priority?	197
YES Leon Gouré, "The Soviet Civil Defense Program and the Present U.S. Civil Defense Debate"	198
NO Jennifer Leaning, "Civil Defense in the Nuclear Age: Strategic, Medical, and Demographic Aspects"	203
Questions for Discussion	224
Suggested Readings	224
14 Should the United States avoid space weapons?	225
YES Sidney D. Drell and Wolfgang K. H. Panofsky, "The Case against Strategic Defense: Technical and Strategic Realities"	226
NO Robert Jastrow, "Reagan vs. the Scientists: Why the President Is Right about Missile Defense"	242
Questions for Discussion	255
Suggested Readings	255
15 Should the United States abandon plans for engaging in limited nuclear warfare as embodied in Presidential Directive 59?	257
YES Louis René Beres, "Presidential Directive 59: A Critical Assessment"	258
NO Colin S. Gray, "Presidential Directive 59: Flawed but Useful"	267
Questions for Discussion	275
Suggested Readings	275
16 Should the United States make a nuclear no-first-use declaration?	277
YES McGeorge Bundy, George F. Kennan, Robert S. McNamara, and Gerard Smith, "Nuclear Weapons and the Atlantic Alliance"	278
NO Colin S. Gray, "NATO's Nuclear Dilemma"	287
Questions for Discussion	299
Suggested Readings	299
17 Should the United States aim for nuclear superiority?	301
YES Robert Jastrow, "Why Strategic Superiority Matters"	302

NO Robert Jervis, "Why Nuclear Superiority Doesn't Matter"	309
Questions for Discussion	321
Suggested Readings	321
CHAPTER 5 The Wider Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons	323
18 Would the spread of nuclear weapons to developing countries greatly increase the risk of their use?	329
YES Lewis A. Dunn, "What Difference Will It Make?"	330
NO K. Subrahmanyam, "Regional Conflicts and Nuclear Fears"	344
Questions for Discussion	348
Suggested Readings	349
19 Is the quest for nuclear energy a principal dynamic in the spread of nuclear weapons?	351
YES Victor Gilinsky, "Nuclear Reactors and Nuclear Bombs"	352
NO Sir John Hill, "The Driving Forces of Proliferation"	358
Questions for Discussion	364
Suggested Readings	364
20 Is superpower restraint in nuclear-weapons acquisition likely to help discourage proliferation?	367
YES Hedley Bull, "The Role of the Nuclear Powers in the Management of Nuclear Proliferation"	368
NO James R. Schlesinger, "The Strategic Consequences of Nuclear Proliferation"	374
Questions for Discussion	382
Suggested Readings	382
21 Are terrorists likely to get nuclear weapons?	383
YES Louis René Beres, " <i>Hic Sunt Dracones</i> : The Nuclear Threat of International Terrorism"	384
NO Ted Greenwood, "Non-State Entities"	392
Questions for Discussion	397
Suggested Readings	397