

Challenging Colonial Discourse

Jewish Studies and Protestant Theology
in Wilhelmine Germany

by
Christian Wiese

Translated from the German by
Barbara Harshav and Christian Wiese



BRILL
LEIDEN • BOSTON
2005

CONTENTS

Foreword by Susannah Heschel	xiii
Preface	xvii
Introduction	1

PART ONE THE CONTEXT OF THE ENCOUNTERS AND CONTROVERSIES

Chapter One: The Political and Social Situation of the Jewish Community in Wilhelmine Germany, 1890–1914	41
1. The Collapse of the Jewish Coalition with Liberalism and the Spread of “Modern Anti-Semitism”	41
2. The Remaining Limitations of the Emancipation of the Jews and Judaism	49
3. The “Assimilation Crisis” and Tendencies toward Recollecting Jewish Identity	58
3.1. “Assimilation,” “Acculturation,” and “German-Jewish Subculture”	58
3.2. “Defense Work” between “Trotzjudentum” and “Jewish Renaissance”	66
3.3. “Self-Emancipation” – the Impulse of the Zionist Movement	72
Chapter Two: The Self-Conception and Research Conditions of Jewish Studies	77
1. The Beginnings and Development of Jewish Studies in the Nineteenth Century	77
2. Profile and Scholarly Self-Understanding of the Educational Institutions of Jewish Studies	83
2.1. “Positive-Historical” Judaism – the Jewish Theological Seminary in Breslau	83
2.2. Liberal Judaism – The “Lehranstalt für die Wissenschaft des Judentums” in Berlin	88
2.3. “Torah and Scholarship” – The Orthodox Rabbinical Seminary of Berlin	94

3. The Conditions of Jewish Studies' Encounter with Protestant Theology	99
3.1. Jewish Research between Discrimination and Claim to Relevance	99
3.2. Jewish Studies and "Defense Work" against Anti-Semitism	102

PART TWO

THE PERCEPTION OF PROTESTANT THEOLOGY

Chapter Three: Jewish Studies and the Protestant "Mission to the Jews", 1880–1914	109
1. The Jewish Perception of Protestant "Allies" in the Debate with Anti-Semitism, 1880–1890	109
1.1. The Contemporary Context: Demonization of Judaism through Anti-Talmud Propaganda and Accusations of Ritual Murder	109
1.2. The Defense of Jewish Morality as Reflected in the Debate between David Hoffmann and Gustaf Dalman, 1886/1894	112
2. "Love of Israel?" – Jewish Refutation of Franz Delitzsch's Concept of the "Mission to the Jews" and the Limits of Christian Solidarity, 1880–1890	122
2.1. Delitzsch's Controversy with Abraham Berliner over the "Instituta Judaica," 1884/85	122
2.2. The Debate of Jewish Scholars with Delitzsch's "Ernste Fragen an die Gebildeten jüdischer Religion," 1888/89	130
3. An "Honest Friend of Judaism" – The Significance of Hermann L. Strack from the Perspective of Jewish Studies	136
3.1. "Herculean labor" – Strack's Refutation of the Anti-Semitic Disparagement of the Jewish Religion	136
3.2. Appreciation of Strack's Scholarly Activity in the Area of Jewish Studies	144
4. "We May Not Bite the Hand that Feeds Us" – Interpretation of the Relationship between Jewish Studies and the "Mission to the Jews"	150

Chapter Four: The Controversy over the Representation of Pharisaic-Rabbinic Judaism by Protestant Historiography on the New Testament Era, 1900–1914	159
1. Adolf von Harnack and the Debate about the “Essence of Judaism”	159
2. Jewish Studies and History of Religions School: The Controversy over Wilhelm Bousset’s Representation of New Testament History	170
2.1. The Religious History of “Late Judaism” – a New Orientation?	170
2.2. The Methodological Controversy over Bousset’s Representation of the History of the New Testament Era	177
2.3. The Controversial Features of Bousset’s Image of “Late Judaism”	190
2.3.1. Religion of Particularism? Israel’s Chosenness and the Universalism of Judaism	190
2.3.2. “Legal” Ethics? – The Torah as a Sign of God’s Love	192
2.3.3. “Simhat Torah” – Liberal and Orthodox Defense of Torah Piety	195
2.3.4. Religion of Fear? – Understanding of God and Piety of Judaism	202
2.4. New Accents in Bousset’s Image of Rabbinic Judaism, 1915	205
3. Refusal of Discourse – The Structure of the Debate about “Late Judaism”	207
 Chapter Five: The Jewish Perception of Protestant Research and Evaluation of the Hebrew Bible, 1900–1914	 217
1. The Position of Biblical Research within Jewish Studies	217
2. God’s Torah for Israel – Benno Jacob’s Concept of a Jewish Biblical Scholarship	220
3. The Value and Originality of the Hebrew Bible: The “Babel-Bible-Controversy”, 1902–1905	230

4. “Ethical Monotheism” – Max Wiener’s Reception of the Protestant Interpretation of Prophecy, 1909/12	239
5. YHVH – a “Jewish God?” The Dispute over the Understanding of the God of the Hebrew Bible, 1912–1917	248
5.1. The “Blasphemy” trial against Theodor Fritsch, 1912/13	248
5.2. Rudolf Kittel’s “Supreme Expert Opinion”	258
5.3. Jewish Refutations of Kittel’s Arguments, 1914–1917	268
6. Ambivalent Experiences with Protestant “Biblical Criticism” – A Conclusion	278

PART THREE
THE FUNCTION AND EFFECT OF
THE CHALLENGE

Chapter Six: The Legitimacy of Judaism’s Continuation – The Political Dimension of Liberal Judaism’s Debate with Liberal Protestantism in the Context of the Internal Jewish Identity Debate, 1900–1914	289
1. On the Dialectic of the Relationship between Liberal Judaism and Liberal Protestantism	289
2. Debates over the Understanding of “Assimilation”	292
2.1. “Assimilation” through Dissolution? The “Case” of Jakob Fromer (1904–1907)	292
2.2. Leo Baeck’s Plea for Integration into a Pluralistic Society (1911)	299
2.3. “Conversion from Judaism to Germanness” – Friedrich Niebergall’s Plea for a Renunciation of Jewish Identity (1912)	302
3. “Religion of the Future” – The Claim of Modernity by Liberal Judaism and the Delineation from Liberal Protestantism	307
3.1. “Return to Judaism?” – The Controversy between Leo Baeck and Ferdinand Kattenbusch about the Nature of Liberal Protestantism (1909)	307

3.2. "The Meaning of Judaism for Religious Progress" – Hermann Cohen at the "World Congress for Free Christianity and Religious Progress," Berlin 1910	314
3.3. "Will to Judaism" – The "Guidelines for a Program for Liberal Judaism," 1912	321
4. The Internal Jewish Discussion about the Affinity of Liberal Judaism to Protestantism	326
4.1. The Confrontation between Zionist and Liberal Jewish Identity	326
4.2. The "Guidelines" as a Rapprochement to Protestantism – The Controversy with Orthodoxy, 1912/13	331
4.3. Max Dienemann's Definition of the Relationship between Judaism and Christianity, 1914	337
5. On the Process of "Dis-encounter" in the Controversy between Liberal Judaism and Liberal Protestantism – Analysis	341
 Chapter Seven: The Reception of Jewish Studies by Protestant Academic Theology, 1900–1914	 351
1. Introduction – The Conditions of a Dialogic Rapprochement	351
2. Jewish Demands for the Academic Equality of Jewish Studies	353
2.1. "The Ghetto of Judaism will not completely fall until the Ghetto of its Science falls" – the Emancipatory Impulse	353
2.2. Felix Perles's Appeal to the Scientific Ethos of German Universities	360
3. "Christian Talmud Scholarship" – The Jewish Assessment of the New Protestant Research of Rabbinic Literature and the Question of the Participation of Jewish Scholars	364
3.1. Paul Fiebig's Concept for the Reform of New Testament Research and His Assessment of Jewish Studies	364
3.2. Between Ignorance and Anti-Semitic Views – The Beginnings of the <i>Gießener Mischna</i> , 1912	377

3.3. Attempts to Include Jewish Scholars in Research and Teaching, 1912–1914	389
4. The Discussion about a Jewish Theology Department in Frankfurt am Main and the Establishment of Academic Chairs for Jewish Studies in Prussia	398
4.1. “First Know, then Judge and Act” – Martin Rade’s Vote for the Establishment of a Jewish Theology Department, 1912/13	398
4.2. A “Vital Upward-Striving Branch on the Great Tree of German Humanities” – the Vote of Willy Staerk, 1914	404
4.3. The Failure of the Project of a “Jewish Theology Department”	407
4.4. A “Righteous Gentile” – Max Löhr’s Plea for a Chair for Jewish Studies in Prussia, 1915	410
5. Reorientation of Jewish Studies in Light of the Disappointed Hope for Participation – Analysis and Prospects	420
Epilogue	427
Abbreviations	445
Bibliography	449
Appendix: List of Scholars	541
Index	555