

# Post-TRC Prosecutions in South Africa

Accountability for Political Crimes  
after the Truth and Reconciliation  
Commission's Amnesty Process

*By*  
Ole Bubenzer

MARTINUS  

---

NIJHOFF  

---

PUBLISHERS

LEIDEN • BOSTON  
2009

# Contents

Abbreviations .....	ix
Preface .....	xi
Introduction .....	1
Chapter One Dealing With the Legacy of the Past—	
Transitional Justice in South Africa .....	5
1. The Apartheid Conflict .....	5
2. The Negotiated Transition and the Work of the TRC .....	8
3. Accountability for Past Human Rights Violations in the South African Context: Conditional Amnesties and Prosecutions .....	11
4. Criminal Trials During the 1990s .....	18
Chapter Two Prosecution of Political Crimes After the TRC	23
1. Special Units for Post-TRC Prosecutions .....	23
1.1 The Human Rights Investigative Unit .....	24
1.2 The Priority Crimes Litigation Unit .....	28
2. The Wouter Basson Case .....	33
2.1 The trial and quashed charges .....	34
2.2 The appeal litigation .....	38
2.3 The Constitutional Court litigation .....	39
2.4 A new trial? .....	45
2.5 Conclusion .....	49
3. The Bisho-Massacre .....	51
3.1 The massacre .....	51
3.2 The indictment .....	53
3.3 The judgment .....	55
3.4 Conclusion .....	56
4. The Trial of Michael Luff .....	58

5. The Case of Tyani and Gumengu .....	61
6. Eugene Terre'Blanche .....	64
7. The PEBCO-Three Case .....	64
7.1 The indictment and further development .....	66
7.2 The review application .....	68
7.3 Conclusion .....	72
8. The Blani Case .....	73
9. The Attempted Murder of Frank Chikane .....	76
9.1 The arrest suspension .....	77
9.2 The indictment and plea bargain .....	79
9.3 Terms of the plea bargain .....	82
9.4 Conclusion .....	85
10. Conclusion .....	91
 Chapter Three The Politics of Prosecutions .....	 97
1. Overview .....	97
1.1 Interest groups .....	98
1.1.1 Human rights organisations .....	98
1.1.2 Security forces side .....	99
a. Kontak Buro .....	100
b. Foundation for Equality before the Law .....	101
1.2 Public debate .....	104
1.2.1 The conservative spectrum and the call for even-handedness .....	104
1.2.2 Human rights and victim sector .....	106
1.2.3 Debate erupting on the occasion of specific prosecutions .....	109
1.3 Government and ANC statements .....	111
2. Bargaining Over the TRC's Legacy .....	115
2.1 Consultations with the security police .....	116
2.2 Consultations with the generals .....	117
2.2.1 The process of meetings .....	118
2.2.2 Motivation of the government .....	119
2.2.3 Interest of the generals .....	124
2.2.4 Results .....	125

3. A Prosecution Policy for TRC-Related Cases .....	128
3.1 Previous history .....	130
3.2 Contents .....	132
3.3 Rationales .....	136
3.4 Practical implementation .....	136
3.5 Reactions to the guidelines .....	139
3.6 Court challenge of the guidelines .....	143
3.7 Evaluation .....	147
3.7.1 The guidelines criteria .....	147
3.7.2 A copy of the amnesty process? .....	149
3.7.3 A political instrument and product of the consultations? .....	151
3.7.4 Conclusion .....	154
4. Conclusion on Government's Political Considerations .....	157

Chapter Four Normative Standards and Practical Prospects for Further Prosecutions .....	167
1. Constitutional and International Law Requirements .....	167
1.1 Constitutional law obligations .....	168
1.1.1 The AZAPO rationale .....	169
1.1.2 The present approach and the constitutional framework .....	173
1.2 International law obligations .....	179
1.2.1 Treaty law .....	181
1.2.2 Customary international law .....	189
1.2.3 Conclusion .....	196
2. The Prosecution of Torture and Statutes of Limitation .....	196
3. Strategies and Priorities .....	202
3.1 Prioritisation .....	203
3.2 The call for even-handedness .....	205
3.3 Limited evidence .....	208
4. General Prospects for Further Trials .....	210
5. Non-Prosecutions .....	213
5.1 The cases of missing Simelane and Morudu .....	214
5.1.1 The Nokuthula Simelane case .....	215
5.1.2 The Moss Morudu case .....	217

5.1.3	The relevance of prosecution in missing persons cases .....	219
5.2	The Cradock-Four case .....	220
5.3	The St. James Church massacre .....	222
5.4	Cases involving former security police leaders .....	224
5.5	The State Security Council and the apartheid government .....	226
5.6	The Steyn-Report concerning criminal SADF activities .....	226
Chapter Five Conclusion .....		229
1.	Summary of Results .....	229
2.	The Conduct of Prosecutions in the Context of the TRC Process .....	232
3.	Closing Remarks .....	236
Bibliography .....		239
	Press Reports .....	244
	Interviews .....	246
	E-Mail Correspondence .....	247
	Statements, Papers and other Documents .....	247
Index .....		251