

THE AVRAHAM HARMAN INSTITUTE  
OF CONTEMPORARY JEWRY  
THE HEBREW UNIVERSITY  
OF JERUSALEM

---

THE FATE OF THE EUROPEAN  
JEWS, 1939–1945

Continuity or Contingency?

STUDIES IN  
CONTEMPORARY  
JEWRY  
AN ANNUAL  
XIII

---

1997

---

Edited by Jonathan Frankel

*Published for the Institute by*  
OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS  
New York • Oxford

# Contents

## Symposium

### The Fate of the European Jews, 1939–1945: Continuity or Contingency?

- Yehuda Bauer, *Some Introductory Comments*, 3
- Gavin I. Langmuir, *Continuities, Discontinuities and Contingencies of the Holocaust*, 9
- Zygmunt Bauman, *The Camps: Eastern, Western, Modern*, 30
- Steven T. Katz, *Radical Historical Discontinuity: Explaining the Holocaust*, 41
- Götz Aly and Susanne Heim, *Forced Emigration, War, Deportation and Holocaust*, 56
- Michael R. Marrus, *Auschwitz: New Perspectives on the Final Solution*, 74
- Dan Diner, *Memory and Method: Variance in Holocaust Narrations*, 84
- Geoff Eley, *What Are the Contexts for German Antisemitism? Some Thoughts on the Origins of Nazism, 1800–1945*, 100
- Susan Zuccotti, *The Italian Racial Laws, 1938–1943: A Reevaluation*, 133
- Henry Rousso, *The Dreyfus Affair in Vichy France: Past and Present in French Political Culture*, 153
- John-Paul Himka, *Ukrainian Collaboration in the Extermination of the Jews During the Second World War: Sorting Out the Long-Term and Conjunctural Factors*, 170

Antony Polonsky, *Beyond Condemnation, Apologetics and Apologies: On the Complexity of Polish Behavior Toward the Jews During the Second World War*, 190

Dan Michman, *Understanding the Jewish Dimension of the Holocaust*, 225

## Essay

Anita Shapira, *The Origins of the Myth of the "New Jew": The Zionist Variety*, 253

## Review Essays

Richard H. King, *Hannah Arendt: The Public and the Private*, 271

J.C. Hurewitz, *Israeli Foreign Policy: Documenting the Past 1947–1953*, 280

## Book Reviews

(arranged by subject)

### Antisemitism, Holocaust and Genocide

Michel Abitbol, *MiCrémieux lePétain: Antishemiyut bealgeriyah hakoloniyalit (1870–1940) (From Crémieux to Pétain: Antisemitism in Colonial Algeria [1870–1940])*, NORMAN A. STILLMAN, 289

Paul R. Bartrop (ed.), *False Havens: The British Empire and the Holocaust*, RICHARD BOLCHOVER, 292

Lucjan Dobroszycki, *Reptile Journalism: The Official Polish-Language Press Under the Nazis, 1938–1945*, DAVID ENGEL, 295

Eugenia Gurin-Loov, *Shoah—Suur Häving: Eesti Juutide Katastroof 1941 (The Holocaust of Estonian Jews, 1941)*, DOV LEVIN, 297

Israel Gutman, *Resistance: The Warsaw Ghetto Uprising*, ABRAHAM BRUMBERG, 300

David A. Hackett (ed. and trans.), *The Buchenwald Report*, MICHAEL BERENBAUM, 303

- Esriel Hildesheimer, *Jüdische Selbstverwaltung unter dem NS-Regime*  
WALTER ZWI BACHARACH, 304
- Harold Kaplan, *Conscience and Memory: Meditations in a Museum of the Holocaust*, LUCIA RUEDENBERG-WRIGHT, 306
- Lawrence Langer, *Admitting the Holocaust: Collected Essays*  
JAMES E. YOUNG, 308
- Lawrence Langer, *Art from the Ashes: A Holocaust Anthology*  
JAMES E. YOUNG, 308
- Mortimer Ostow, *Myth and Madness: The Psychodynamics of Antisemitism*, MARTIN WANGH, 311
- Alison Owings, *Frauen: German Women Recall the Third Reich*  
EVE ROSENHAFT, 313
- Efraim Zuroff, *Occupation: Nazi Hunter—The Continuing Search for Perpetrators of the Holocaust*, DEBORAH E. LIPSTADT, 315

### History and the Social Sciences

- Steven E. Aschheim, *Culture and Catastrophe: German and Jewish Confrontations with National Socialism and Other Crises*  
RICHARD WOLIN, 318
- Pierre Birnbaum and Ira Katznelson (eds.), *Paths of Emancipation: Jews, States and Citizenship*, LLOYD P. GARTNER, 319
- Rose Cohen, *Out of the Shadow: A Russian Jewish Girlhood on the Lower East Side*, GERALD SORIN, 323
- Lynn Davidman and Shelly Tenenbaum (eds.), *Feminist Perspectives on Jewish Studies*, SHULAMIT S. MAGNUS, 325
- Gertrude Wishnick Dubrovsky, *The Land Was Theirs: Jewish Farmers in the Garden State*, EWA MORAWSKA, 327
- Gerhard Falk, *American Judaism in Transition: The Secularization of a Religious Community*, LAURENCE A. KOTLER-BERKOWITZ, 329
- Sylvia Barack Fishman, *A Breath of Life: Feminism in the American Jewish Community*, MARGALIT SHILO, 332
- Reena Sigman Friedman, *These Are Our Children: Jewish Orphanages in the United States, 1880–1925*, DANIEL SOYER, 333
- Robert Alan Goldberg, *Back to the Soil: The Jewish Farmers of Clarion, Utah and Their World*, EWA MORAWSKA, 327

- Gregg Ivers, *To Build a Wall: American Jews and the Separation of Church and State*, GARY JEFFREY JACOBSON, 335
- Jacob Katz, *With My Own Eyes: A Historian's Autobiography*  
GEORGE L. MOSSE, 337
- Diane Lichtenstein, *Writing Their Nations: The Tradition of Nineteenth-Century Jewish Women Writers*, SYLVIA BARACK FISHMAN, 340
- Edward T. Linenthal, *Preserving Memory: The Struggle to Create America's Holocaust Museum*, ROCHELLE G. SAIDEL, 342
- Seymour Martin Lipset and Earl Raab, *Jews and the New American Scene*, DEBORAH DASH MOORE, 344
- Lara V. Marks, *Model Mothers: Jewish Mothers and Maternity Provision in East London, 1870–1939*, SHARMAN KADISH, 346
- J. Sanford Rikoon (ed.), *Rachel Calof's Story: Jewish Homesteader on the Northern Plains*, HENRY J. TOBIAS, 348
- Moses Rischin and John Livingston (eds.), *Jews of the American West*  
ROBERT A. ROCKAWAY, 350
- Yaakov Ro'i, *Jews and Jewish Life in Russia and the Soviet Union*  
ALEXANDER ÖRBACH, 353
- Silvia Schenkolewski-Kroll and Leonardo Senkman (eds.), *Judaica Latinoamericana: Estudios Histórico-Sociales II*  
JUDITH LAIKIN ELKIN, 354
- Ismar Schorsch, *From Text to Context: The Turn to History in Modern Judaism*, SHULAMIT VOLKOV, 357
- Naomi Shepherd, *A Price Below Rubies: Jewish Women as Rebels and Radicals*, ROCHELLE GOLDBERG RUTHCHILD, 359
- Melford E. Spiro, *Gender and Culture: Kibbutz Women Revisited*  
SHULAMIT REINHARZ, 363
- Henry Felix Srebnik, *London Jews and British Communism 1935–1945*, SHARMAN KADISH, 366
- Henry J. Tobias, *A History of the Jews in New Mexico*  
ROBERT A. ROCKAWAY, 350

### Language, Literature and the Arts

- Mark Anderson, *Kafka's Clothes: Ornament and Aestheticism in the Habsburg "Fin de Siècle,"* W.J. DODD, 369

- Alan Cheuse and Nicholas Delbanco (eds.), *Talking Horse: Bernard Malamud on Life and Work*, EMILY BUDICK, 371
- Lawrence Graver, *An Obsession with Anne Frank: Meyer Levin and the Diary*, STEPHEN J. WHITFIELD, 373
- Hannan Hever, *Bishvi hautopiyah: masah 'al meshihyut upolitikah bashirah ha'ivrit beerez yisrael bein shtei milhamot ha'olam* (*Captives of Utopia: An Essay on Messianism and Politics in Hebrew Poetry in Eretz Israel Between the Two World Wars*) HAMUTAL BAR-YOSEF, 375
- Lawrence A. Hoffman and Janet R. Walton (eds.), *Sacred Sound and Social Change: Liturgical Music in Jewish and Christian Experience*, MARK SLOBIN, 378
- Astrid Starck (ed.), *Westjiddish: Mündlichkeit und Schriftlichkeit—Le Yiddish occidental: Actes du Colloque de Mulhouse*, AVRAHAM GREENBAUM, 381

### Religion, Thought and Education

- Hannah Arendt, *Love and St. Augustine* (ed. Joanna Vecchiarelli Scott and Judith Chelius Stark), RICHARD H. KING, 271
- Richard J. Bernstein, *Hannah Arendt and the Jewish Question* RICHARD H. KING, 271
- Carole Brightman (ed.), *Between Friends: The Correspondence of Hannah Arendt and Mary McCarthy, 1949–1975* RICHARD H. KING, 271
- Elzbieta Ettinger, *Hannah Arendt/Martin Heidegger* RICHARD H. KING, 271
- Shulamit Soloveitchik Meiselman, *The Soloveitchik Heritage: A Daughter's Memoir*, SHAUL STAMPFER, 382
- Gloria Wiederkehr-Pollack, *Eliezer Zweifel and the Intellectual Defense of Hasidism*, SHAUL STAMPFER, 383
- Walter S. Wurzburger, *Ethics of Responsibility: Pluralistic Approaches to Covenantal Ethics*, SHUBERT SPERO, 384

### Zionism, Israel and the Middle East

- Uri Bar-Joseph, *Intelligence Intervention in the Politics of Democratic States: U.S., Israel and Britain*, SHLOMO GAZIT, 387

Yaacov Bar-Siman-Tov, <i>Israel and the Peace Process, 1977–1982: In Search of Legitimacy for Peace</i> , MARK A. HELLER,	390
<i>Documents on the Foreign Policy of Israel (Vols. 1–8)</i> J.C. HUREWITZ,	280
<i>Political and Diplomatic Documents, December 1947–May 1948</i> J.C. HUREWITZ,	280
Boas Evron, <i>Jewish State or Israeli Nation?</i> (trans. James Diamond) CHARLES S. LIEBMAN,	392
David Garnham and Mark Tessler (eds.), <i>Democracy, War, and Peace in the Middle East</i> , JACOB M. LANDAU,	394
Yael Zerubavel, <i>Recovered Roots: Collective Memory and the Making of Israeli National Tradition</i> , NACHMAN BEN-YEHUDA,	396
Recently Completed Doctoral Dissertations,	400
Contents for Volume XIV,	406
Note on Editorial Policy,	407