Reason's Nearest Kin

PHILOSOPHIES OF ARITHMETIC FROM KANT TO CARNAP

MICHAEL POTTER

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

Introduction 1

0.1 Arithmetic 1
0.2 The a priori 4
0.3 Empiricism 6
0.4 Psychologism 9
0.5 Pure formalism 10
0.6 Trivial formalism 12
0.7 Reflexive formalism 15
0.8 Arithmetic and reason 17

1 Kant 20

1.1 Intuitions and concepts 21
1.2 Geometrical propositions 24
1.3 Arithmetical propositions 25
1.4 The Transcendental Deduction 27
1.5 Analytic and synthetic 30
1.6 The principle of analytic judgements 31
1.7 Geometry is not analytic 35
1.8 Arithmetic is not analytic 37
1.9 The principle of synthetic judgements 39
1.10 Geometry as synthetic 42
1.11 Arithmetic as synthetic 50
1.12 Arithmetic and sensibility 52

2 Grundlagen 55

2.1 Axiomatization 56
2.2 Arithmetic independent of sensibility 60
2.3 The *Begriffsschrift* 62
2.4 Frege's conception of analyticity 65
2.5 Numerically definite quantifiers 69
2.6 The numerical equivalence 72

2.7 Frege's explicit definition 75
2.8 The context principle again 78
2.9 The analyticity of the numerical equivalence 79

3 Dedekind 81

3.1 Dedekind's recursion theorem 81
3.2 Frege and Dedekind 83
3.3 Axiomatic structuralism 85
3.4 Existence 87
3.5 Uniqueness 91
3.6 Implicationism 95
3.7 Systems 97
3.8 Dedekind on existence 99
3.9 Dedekind on uniqueness 102

4 Frege's account of classes 105

4.1 The Julius Caesar problem yet again 105
4.2 The context principle in *Grundgesetze* 109
4.3 Russell's paradox 112
4.4 Numbers as concepts 115
4.5 The status of the numerical equivalence 117

5 Russell's account of classes 119

5.1 Propositions 119
5.2 The old theory of denoting 122
5.3 The new theory of denoting 125
5.4 The substitutional theory 128
5.5 Russell's propositional paradox 131
5.6 Frege's hierarchy of senses 134
5.7 Mathematical logic as based on the theory of types 136
5.8 Elementary propositions 139
5.9 The hierarchy of propositional functions in *12 140
5.10 The hierarchy of propositional functions in the Introduction 141
5.11 Typical ambiguity 144
5.12 Cumulative types 146
5.13 The hierarchy of classes 147
5.14 Numbers 150
5.15 The axiom of reducibility 152
5.16 Propositional functions and reducibility 154
5.17 The regressive method 157
5.18 The *Introduction to Mathematical Philosophy* 160

6 The *Tractatus* 164

6.1 Sign and symbol 164
6.2 The hierarchy of types 166
6.3 The doctrine of inexpressibility 168
6.4 Operations and functions 171
6.5 Sense 174
6.6 The rejection of class-theoretic foundations for mathematics 176
6.7 Number as the exponent of an operation 177
6.8 The adjectival strategy 179
6.9 Equations 181
6.10 Numerical identities 184
6.11 Generalization 185
6.12 The axiom of infinity 187
6.13 A transcendental argument 189
6.14 Another transcendental argument 192

7 The second edition of *Principia* 195

7.1 Logical atomism and empiricism 195
7.2 The hierarchy of propositional functions 197
7.3 Mathematical induction 199
7.4 The definition of identity 201

8 Ramsey 206

8.1 Propositions 206
8.2 Predicating functions 208
8.3 Extending Wittgenstein's account of identity 213
8.4 Propositional functions in extension 216
8.5 Wittgenstein's objections 218
8.6 The axiom of infinity 221

9 Hilbert's programme 223

9.1 Formal consistency 223
9.2 Real arithmetic 228
9.3 Schematic arithmetic 232
9.4 Ideal arithmetic 237
9.5 Metamathematics 239
9.6 Hilbert's programme 241

10 Gödel 243

10.1 Incompleteness 244
10.2 Formal theories 246
10.3 The unprovability of outer consistency 248
10.4 The demise of Hilbert's programme 250
10.5 The unprovability of consistency 254
10.6 Axiomatic formalism 258

11 Carnap 261

11.1 Language and symbolism 261
11.2 The rejection of the *Tractatus* 263
11.3 Conventionalism 265
11.4 Completeness 268
11.5 Consistency 269
11.6 Semantics 271
11.7 Pragmatics 274

Conclusion 278

Bibliography 290

Index 299