

For Out of Babylonia Shall Come Torah and the Word of the Lord from Nehar Peqod

The Quest for Babylonian Tannaitic Traditions

By

Barak S. Cohen



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Contents

Acknowledgements IX

- 1 Introduction: A Reassessment of the Existence of Babylonian Tannaitic Traditions 1**
- "Babylonian Mishnah," "Babylonian Baraitot," and "Amoraic Baraitot" 1
 - The Significance of the Study of Early Babylonian Traditions 5
 - The Halakhic Corpora Discussed in This Study 9
 - History of Scholarship 11
 - Introductory Terms* 11
 - Baraitot Which Interpret, Expand, or Add to the Mishnah* 14
 - A Brief and Anonymous Formulation, without Attribution to Tannaim* 15
 - The Absence of a Parallel in Palestinian Tannaitic Literature* 16
 - The Relationship between Baraitot and Amoraic Memrot* 17
 - Late Insertions of Halakhot and Interpretations into Earlier Baraitot* 18
 - The Names of Sages and Their Geographical Location* 19
 - Findings and Conclusions 20
 - The Origin and Nature of Halakha in Babylonia during the Second-Third Centuries* 20
 - The Historical Reliability of Attributions* 24
 - The Literary Contribution of Babylonian Sages from the Pre-talmudic Period* 26
- 2 In Quest of Babylonian Halakha in Tannaitic Compositions 28**
- Babylonian Rabbinic Traditions in the Proto-talmudic Era:
 - A History of Scholarship 28
 - Summary and Conclusions 41
- Appendix: A Survey of the Main Evidence Presented by Scholars as Proof for the Existence of "Babylonian Halakhot" from the Mishnaic Period 43**
- Circumstantial Evidence 43
 - Sources in the Babylonian Talmud 43
 - b. Sukkah 20a* 43
 - b. Pesah. 109a* 44
 - b. Git. 14b = b. Ketub. 94b* 44

	<i>b. B. Bat. 7b</i>	44
	<i>b. Beṣah 34b</i>	45
	<i>b. Šabb. 6b = Šabb. 96b</i>	45
	<i>b. Hul. 63b</i>	45
	<i>b. Beṣah 6a</i>	46
	<i>b. Nid. 14a</i>	46
	<i>b. Šabb. 35b</i>	46
	<i>b. Git. 65b</i>	46
	Sources in the Palestinian Talmud	47
	<i>y. Hal. 4:4 (60a)</i>	47
	<i>y. Ta'an. 1:1 (63d) = b. Ta'an. 10a</i>	47
	<i>y. Sanh. 8:4 (26b) = y. Soṭah 4:12 (19c) = Sifre Deut. 118</i> (ed. Finkelstein, p. 251)	47
	<i>y. Sanh. 1:3 (19a) = y. Ned. 6:8 (40a) = b. Ber. 63a-b</i>	48
	<i>y. Šabb. 5:4 (7c) = y. Beṣah 2:8 (61c)</i>	48
	<i>y. Qidd. 3:5 (64a) = b. Git. 14a</i>	48
	Midrashic Sources	49
	<i>Genesis Rabbah 33:3 (ed. Theodor-Albeck, p. 306)</i>	49
	<i>Midrash Psalms 104:22 (ed. Buber, p. 446)</i>	49
	The Gaonic Evidence: R. Sherira Gaon	49
	<i>R. Sherira Gaon, Epistle of R. Sherira Gaon, p 40</i>	49
3	The Legal Traditions of Avuha-De-Shmuel	50
	Introduction	50
	Early Babylonian Halakhic Traditions?	51
	His Halakhic Rulings	54
	His Commentary on and Emendation of Tannaitic Sources	58
	Avuha De-Shmuel's Customs	62
	Summary and Conclusions	67
4	The Legal Traditions of R. Shila	69
	Introduction	69
	The Problem of His Identification	71
	Passages in Which R. Shila's Identity is Certain	73
	Doubtful Appearances of R. Shila in the Talmuds	82
	Summary and Conclusions	88
	Appendix: Traditions Ascribed to R. Shila in the Talmuds and Their Parallels in Palestinian Tannaitic Literature	89
	Appearances Included in This Study	89
	<i>Certain Appearances</i>	89

- Doubtful Appearances* 89
- Appearances Not Included in This Study 90
- Doubtful Appearances in Mss* 90
- The Tanna, R. Shila* 90
- A Late Aggadic Story* 90
- "Of the House of R. Shila ([ד]בי[ת] רב שילא)"* 90
- 5 **Levi's Baraitot: *Tannei Levi, Tanna D'bei Levi*** 91
- Introduction 91
- Previous Scholarship 92
- Baraitot Which Interpret, Expand, or Add to the Mishnah 99
- Analysis of Sugyot 101
- Laws Related to Topics Not Covered by the Mishnah 115
- Baraitot That Differ from the Mishnah or Dispute It 123
- Summary and Conclusions 129
- Appendix: A List of All Levi's Baraitot and Their Parallels in Rabbinic Literature** 131
- Babylonian Talmud 131
- Palestinian Talmud 132
- 6 **Shmuel's Baraitot: *Tanna D'Bei Shmuel, Tannei Shmuel*** 133
- Introduction 133
- Previous Scholarship 133
- Analysis of Sugyot 138
- Summary and Conclusions 158
- Appendix: Shmuel's Attitude towards the *Tanna D'Bei Shmuel* Baraitot** 161
- 7 **"They Teach There" ("תניי תמן"): "Babylonian Baraitot" in the Palestinian Talmud** 166
- Introduction 166
- Re-evaluating Previous Research: Early Babylonian Halakhic Traditions? 167
- Analysis of Sugyot 171
- Summary and Conclusions 184
- Appendix: The Halakhot Transmitted in the "They Teach There" ("תניי תמן") Baraitot in the Palestinian Talmud and Their Parallels in Tannaitic Literature** 187

8	The <i>Tannei Tanna Kameh</i> Baraitot	191
	Introduction	191
	Interpretations and Expansions of the Mishnah	197
	Baraitot Containing Amoraic Additions	202
	Baraitot That Were Rejected or Emended	205
	Summary and Conclusions	215
	Appendix A: A Detailed List of Halakhot Found in TTK Baraitot and Their Parallels in Tannaitic Literature	217
	Babylonian Talmud	217
	Palestinian Talmud	219
	Appendix B: TTK Baraitot in the Babylonian Talmud Without an Amoraic Response	220
9	Shmuel: A Model of Halakhic Consistency	222
	Introduction	222
	The State of Scholarship: An Evaluation	223
	A New Appraisal of Shmuel's Halakhic Methodology	230
	Shmuel Rules According to the More Lenient Opinion	230
	Adopting the Opinion of "Babylonian Tannaim"	243
	Summary and Conclusions	251
	Appendix A: Halakhic Rulings in the Two Talmuds Issued by Shmuel Using the Term "Halakha" or "Hilkheta" ("הלכתא"/"הלכה") and the Names of the Amoraim Who Transmitted Them	255
	Babylonian Talmud	255
	Palestinian Talmud	256
	Appendix B: Decisions Made by Shmuel Which Accord with the More Lenient Tanna	257
	Babylonian Talmud	257
	Palestinian Talmud	261
	Uncertain Cases	262
	Bibliography	263
	Index of Hebrew and Aramaic Terms	291
	Subject Index	293