

THE LEGAL STATUS OF  
TERRITORIES SUBJECT TO  
ADMINISTRATION BY  
INTERNATIONAL  
ORGANISATIONS

BERNHARD KNOLL



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# CONTENTS

<i>Illustrations</i>	page xi	
<i>Foreword: Pierre-Marie Dupuy</i>	xiii	
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xvi	
<i>Table of Cases and Judicial Decisions</i>	xix	
1 Permanent Court of International Justice	xix	
2 Permanent Court of Arbitration	xix	
3 International Court of Justice	xix	
4 International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia		xxi
5 European Commission/Court of Human Rights		xxi
6 European Court of First Instance	xxii	
7 Domestic courts	xxii	
7.1 Austria	xxii	
7.2 Bosnia and Herzegovina	xxii	
7.3 Canada	xxiii	
7.4 East Timor	xxiii	
7.5 Germany	xxiii	
7.6 Kosovo	xxiv	
7.7 Palestine	xxiv	
7.8 South Africa	xxiv	
7.9 United Kingdom	xxiv	
7.10 United States	xxiv	
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xxvi	

## Introduction 1

1.1 International administrations and the discourse of empire	2
1.2 Methodological frames and structure	9

1 Creation of internationalised territories	18
1.1 Horizontal transfer of effective control and the bare title to territory	19
1.1.1 Doctrine and jurisprudence	20

1.1.2	Dynamics of state practice	25	
	(i) Panama Canal and Guantánamo Bay (both 1903)		26
	(ii) Bosnia-Herzegovina (1878) and the Saar Territory (1920)	28	
	(iii) Contrasting the <i>nudum ius</i> with state servitudes		30
1.1.3	Mixed methodology: Chapter VII and the incorporation of a horizontal agreement	32	
	(i) Eastern Slavonia (1995)	33	
1.2	UN territorial administration and the vertical imposition of <i>imperium</i>	36	
1.2.1	Searching for a legal basis: from Art. 24 to Chapter VII of the Charter	37	
	(i) Jerusalem and Trieste (both 1947)	37	
	(ii) Western Irian (1962) and Namibia (1967)		40
1.2.2	Imposing the divorce: Chapter VII and the appropriation of effective control by the UN	42	
	(i) Kosovo and East Timor (both 1999)	44	
	(ii) Disjunction between sovereign title and effective control in state practice: selected examples since 1878		50
	Résumé: towards an <i>in rem</i> characterisation of internationalised territories	51	
2	Fiduciary administration: mandates, trust and the transitory sovereignty vacuum	53	
	Introduction: the challenge to patrimonial conceptions of sovereignty		53
2.1	Mandates and the displacement of the sovereign	56	
2.1.1	Translating political context into legal response	59	
	(i) Trust and the transposition of municipal legal instruments	59	
2.1.2	The Mandate system as a network of interlocking obligations	63	
	(i) Formal categorisation of legal instruments utilised		63
	(ii) <i>Suprema potestas</i> within the Mandate system?		66
	(iii) Application of a 'matrix of modernism'	69	
2.2	' <i>Le roi est mort, vive le roi!</i> ': the Trusteeship system and the return of the sovereign	72	
2.2.1	Self-determination and the reversion to the sovereignty narrative	74	
	(i) 'Silent alchemy': Namibia and the triumph of the teleologists	75	
2.2.2	Ever-closer supervision and obligations under the Trusteeship system	80	

(i)	Normative framework of the Trusteeship mechanism	81
(ii)	Institutional framework	84
(iii)	Mandates and Trusteeship territories	91
2.2.3	South-West Africa revisited	92
(i)	Background	92
(ii)	Legal basis for terminating the Mandate	96
(iii)	Virtual governance: the United Nations Council for Namibia	102
	Résumé: heightened international authority and the 'peoples' as a new actor	108
<b>3</b>	<b>Self-determination and the personality of internationalised territories</b>	<b>111</b>
	Introduction: international law's agnosticism	112
3.1	Subjectivity as entitlement	116
3.1.1	The dynamic principle of self-determination	117
(i)	Norms of self-determination as a latent international entitlement	122
3.1.2	Other sources of entitlement: the inductive approach to personality	124
(i)	The Free City of Danzig, the Westbank/Gaza and Kosovo	126
3.2	Agency and the construction of international legal personality	131
(i)	Two points of clarification regarding agency <i>ex lege</i>	133
3.2.1	Representation-in-trust	135
3.2.2	Agency and 'performativity'	139
	Résumé: functional approaches to legal personality	143
<b>4</b>	<b>'The King's two bodies': the dual functions of international administrations</b>	<b>149</b>
	Introduction: the elusive 'international community interest'	151
4.1	Of international agents and organs	158
4.1.1	A custodian's parallel set of duties	162
4.2	Cases of dual functionality	164
4.2.1	The 'dual mandate'	164
4.2.2	The Allied Control Authority and its <i>bona fide</i> representation function	166
4.2.3	The United Nations Council for Namibia	171
(i)	Normative content of the Council's Decree No. 1 . . . within the UN legal order	173
(ii)	. . . within the domestic legal order of states	176
(iii)	. . . within the Namibian legal order	177
	Postscript: temporary identity of domestic and foreign policy	179

5	Extent of UN authority in Kosovo and the problem of an open-ended institution-building mandate	184
	Introduction: the UN <i>imperium</i> over the territory	184
5.1	Kosovo's status and Serbia's bare title to the territory	186
5.1.1	'Paramount law of the land': Resolution 1244 and its first implementing Regulations	187
	(i) UNMIK's deployment strategy and 'pillar' structure	190
	(ii) Sovereignty <i>v.</i> <i>imperium</i> : applying the <i>in rem</i> framework	196
	(iii) A case study	199
5.1.2	From benchmarking to status?	203
	(i) Governance challenge wrapped in a sovereignty enigma	204
	(ii) Of roadmaps and roadblocks: the 'earned sovereignty' approach	207
5.2	UNMIK as territorial agent and UN organ	213
5.2.1	Territorial agency	213
	(i) UNTAET and the Timor Gap Treaty	214
	(ii) UNMIK's performance of agency	217
	(iii) Towards a limited legal personality? A memo to the Kosovo Premier	228
5.2.2	UNMIK as administrator of an international trust	237
	(i) Privatisation, or: to be or not to be immune?	238
	Postscript: view from international humanitarian law	243
6	The status process: Kosovo's endgame	248
	Introduction: UNMIK as facilitator?	250
6.1	Statehood or stasis? UNOSEK and the Contact Group	252
6.1.1	Miscalculations and flawed premises	258
	(i) Spoiling the party	262
	(ii) The Troika	264
6.1.2	UNOSEK's settlement proposal	266
	(i) The question of international powers	268
	(ii) Building legitimacy: a new constitution	270
6.2	Wider implications for public international law	272
6.2.1	The option of 'status imposition'	273
6.2.2	The future of self-determination claims	276
6.2.3	Challenges to Serbia's position	280
	Résumé: status resolution as <i>contrapunctus</i>	282
7	An anomalous legitimacy cycle	288
	Introduction: premises and challenges	290
7.1	A transitional administration in transition	292
7.1.1	Two dimensions of the legitimacy discourse	294

7.2 Pursuit of domestic legitimacy: two promises	298
7.2.1 Foundational promise	299
(i) The Border Agreement between FRY and Macedonia	300
(ii) Vouching for the ward: the <i>Haradinaj</i> case	302
7.2.2 Devolution of power and the democratic moment	303
7.3 Legitimacy through defiance	305
7.3.1 <i>SRSG v. the Kosovo Assembly</i>	306
7.3.2 'You're fired': <i>OHR v. The Bosnian Constitutional Court</i>	309
7.3.3 Two fronts of the struggle over domestic legitimacy	318
Résumé: negative externalities	320
<b>8 Properties of a transitory legal order</b>	<b>326</b>
Introduction: the transitionality frame	328
8.1 Unmediated import of international law	329
8.1.1 Policing the border between past and future government authority	332
8.1.2 Collapse of dualism and the promise of a liberal future	335
8.2 Absence of hierarchy of local norms	339
8.2.1 Uniform promulgation	339
8.2.2 The problem of review	344
(i) Palestine: competence to review an Ordinance	349
(ii) Bosnia: incidental norm control	350
8.2.3 ' <i>Sed quis custodiet?</i> ': norm control and legality	356
8.3 A human rights vacuum?	360
8.3.1 Rights without remedies	360
(i) Extraterritorial applicability of human rights instruments	362
(ii) The Shell Game: the Court's failure to close the gap in <i>Behrami</i> and <i>Saramati</i>	367
8.3.2 Too little, too late: Kosovo's Human Rights Advisory Panel	381
(i) Options	383
(ii) The long march of UNMIK Regulation 2006/12	384
8.3.3 Will the International Civilian Representative in Kosovo do better?	394
(i) A new Mandate	395
Résumé: the 'stickiness' of an interim legal order	399
<b>Concluding appraisal</b>	<b>404</b>
(i) As to the legal status of the administering organ	408
(ii) As to the nature of powers assumed by an international administration	408
(iii) As to their extent	409

- (iv) As to their limitation by international human rights law 409
- (v) As to the fiduciary bond established between the international community and the population under its tutelage 410
- (vi) As to the title to territory 411
- (vii) As to the legal status of the territory 411
- (viii) Five themes for Accountability Guidelines for plenary UN Administration Missions 428

## *Bibliography* 434

- 1 Primary sources 434
  - A Treaties, conventions and constitutions (of international organisations) 434
  - B UN sources 436
    - United Nations General Assembly 436
    - United Nations Security Council 438
    - International Law Commission 439
  - C Documents and reports of international organisations 440
    - League of Nations 440
    - UN: peacekeeping/peace-building, governance and accountability 440
    - South-West Africa/Namibia 442
    - Eastern Slavonia 442
    - Bosnia and Herzegovina 442
    - Kosovo and Serbia 443
    - East Timor 449
  - D UNMIK and UNTAET legal sources ('mediate UN law') 449
  - E Agreements between international/local institutions and third parties 451
    - UNTAET 451
    - UNMIK 451
  - F Pronouncements of local Kosovo institutions 453
  - G Contact Group statements and unpublished documents (letters, Code Cables, etc.) 454
- 2 Secondary sources 457
  - A Books 457
  - B Book chapters 468
  - C Articles 475
  - D Speeches, theses, working papers and think tank/NGO studies 495

## *Index* 502