

Institutions on the Edge

The Origins and Consequences of Inter-Branch Crises in Latin America

> GRETCHEN JÆLMKE University of Rochester



(2017

Contents

| List of Figures | p | <i>age</i> xi |
|--------------------|---|---------------|
| List of Tables | | xiii |
| Preface and Acknou | ledgments | xv |
| 1 Introduction | | r |
| 1.1 The Literature | 2 | 5 |
| 1.2 The Core Arg | ument | II |
| 1.2.1 President | al Crises | 12 |
| 1.2.2 Legislativ | e and Judicial Crises | 14 |
| 1.3 Plan of the Bo | ook | 16 |
| 2 Inter-Branch Cri | Inter-Branch Crises in Latin America | |
| 2.1 Defining and | Measuring Inter-Branch Crises | 19 |
| 2.1.1 Selection | Rule 1: Executives, Legislatures, and Courts | 20 |
| 2.1.2 Selection | Rule 2: Presidents and Multimember Bodies | 23 |
| 2.1.3 Selection | Rule 3: Institutional Composition is at Stake | 24 |
| 2.1.4 Selection | Rule 4: Initiation, Not Resolution | 25 |
| 2.1.5 Selection | Rule 5: Number of Targets Equals the Number of Crises | 26 |
| 2.1.6 Selection | Rule 6: Single versus Sequential Crises | 27 |
| 2.1.7 Selection | Rule 7: Duration, Democracy, and Time in Power | 28 |
| 2.1.8 Summary | , | 29 |
| 2.2 The Inter-Bra | nch Crises in Latin America Dataset | 29 |
| 2.2.1 Validity a | and Succession Criteria | 31 |
| 2.2.2 Patterns | of Institutional Instability | 38 |
| 2.3 Summary | | 46 |
| Appendix: Inter-F | Branch Crises | 48 |

•

viii

| | stitutional Crises as Bargaining Failures | 51 |
|-----|--|--------------|
| | A Basic Model of Institutional Crises | 53 |
| | 2 Executive-Legislative Bargaining under the Threat of Removal | 57 |
| | 3 The President's Dilemma | 59 |
| 3. | 4 Self-Coups as a Commitment Problem: Extending the Bargaining | |
| | Model to Legislative Crises | 65 |
| 3. | 5 Conclusion | 71 |
| ŧ W | hy the Mighty Fall: Explaining the Onset of Presidential | |
| С | rises in Contemporary Latin America | 73 |
| 4. | 1 The Data | 77 |
| | 4.1.1 Dependent Variables | 77 |
| | 4.1.2 Independent Variables | 79 |
| 4. | 2 Empirical Analysis and Results | 88 |
| | 4.2.1 Model Testing and Nested Comparisons | 89 |
| | 4.2.2 Assessing Substantive Effects | 91 |
| | 4.2.3 Robustness Checks | 94 |
| 4. | 3 Conclusion | 100 |
| 5 C | onstitutional Coups as a Commitment Problem | 102 |
| 5. | 1 Statistical Evidence | 103 |
| | 5.1.1 Threshold Crisis Conditions | 103 |
| | 5.1.2 Past Vulnerability as Future Risk | 106 |
| | 5.1.3 Costs to the President: Legislative Popularity and Traditional Parties | 110 |
| | 5.1.4 Timing | 112 |
| | 5.1.5 Putting It All Together | 113 |
| 5. | 2 Case Studies | 115 |
| | 5.2.1 Fujimori | 116 |
| | 5.2.2 Serrano | 117 |
| | 5.2.3 Chávez | 119 |
| | 5.2.4 Correa | 121 |
| 5. | 3 Discussion | 1 2 4 |
| 6 C | aught in the Cross-Fire? Inter-Branch Crises and Judicial | |
| | Istability | 126 |
| | 1 A New Theory of Judicial Manipulation | 129 |
| | 6.1.1 Presidential Powers | 130 |
| | 6.1.2 Probability of Success | 130 |
| | 6.1.3 Costs | 134 |
| | 6.1.4 Testable Implications | 135 |
| 6. | 2 Patterns of Presidential and Judicial Instability | 139 |
| | 3 Predicting Judicial Crises: A Statistical Analysis | 142 |
| 6 | 4 Discussion | 149 |
| 6 | 4 Discussion | |

.

| 7 | Conclusion | 151 |
|--------------|---|-----|
| | 7.1 Summary | 152 |
| | 7.2 Implications and Extensions | 154 |
| | 7.2.1 Legislative Supremacy | 154 |
| | 7.2.2 Spillover versus Substitution | 155 |
| | 7.2.3 Instability Traps or Inoculation? | 155 |
| | 7.2.4 The Effects of Inter-Branch Crises on Trust and the Economy | 158 |
| | 7.3 Institutional Reform: Solutions and Trade-Offs | 160 |
| Bibliography | | 165 |
| Ind | ex | 177 |

ix